

## June 2021 BAR Decision

Watkins, Robert <watkinsro@charlottesville.gov>

Wed 6/16/2021 10:34 AM

To: gilderwood@gmail.com <gilderwood@gmail.com>

### Certificate of Appropriateness

BAR 21-06-02

5 Gildersleeve Wood, TMP 110018000

Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District

Owner/Applicant: Deren Bader and Paul Lyons

Project: Replace sash in ten windows

Dear Deren,

On Tuesday June 15, the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review reviewed the above-referenced project. Please find the BAR's motion below:

*James Zehmer moves: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed window replacements for 5 Gildersleeve Wood satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.*

*Jody Lahendro seconds motion. Motion passes (7-0).*

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

All the best,

Robert

Robert Watkins  
Assistant Historic Preservation and Design Planner  
Neighborhood Development Services  
PO Box 911  
Charlottesville, VA 22902

**City of Charlottesville  
Board of Architectural Review  
Staff Report  
June 15, 2021**



**Certificate of Appropriateness**

BAR 21-06-02

5 Gildersleeve Wood, TMP 110018000

Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District

Owner/Applicant: Deren Bader and Paul Lyons

Project: Replace sash in ten windows



**Background**

Year Built: House: c1921; Garage: c1950

District: Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District

Status: Contributing (both)

Colonial Revival style home with a detached two-car garage. (The historic survey is attached.)

**Prior BAR Review**

(see Appendix)

**Application**

- Submittal: Pella Reserve window information and photographs of 5 Gildersleeve Wood and a similar house on Thomson Road.

CoA request to replace the contemporary, single-lite sash (c1980) in ten windows with new that 6/1 sash that will replicate the original, c1920 windows. New sash to be Pella Reserve: Insulated glass; six-lite upper sash will have 7/8" applied grilles and internal spacer bars.

**Discussion and Recommendations**

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**Suggested Motion**

*Approval:* Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed window replacements for 5 Gildersleeve

Wood satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application [as submitted.]

[...as submitted with the following conditions: ...]

*Denial:* Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed window replacements for 5 Gildersleeve Wood do not satisfy the BAR's criteria and are not compatible with this property and other properties in the Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC District, and that for the following reasons the BAR denies the application as submitted:

### **Criteria, Standards and Guidelines**

#### **Review Criteria Generally**

Sec. 34-284(b) of the City Code states that, in considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:

- 1) That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the Design Guidelines established by the board pursuant to Sec.34-288(6); and
- 2) The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the protected property that is the subject of the application.

#### **Pertinent Standards for Review of Construction and Alterations include:**

- 1) Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable design control district;
- 2) The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs and signs;
- 3) The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;
- 4) The effect of the proposed change on the historic district neighborhood;
- 5) The impact of the proposed change on other protected features on the property, such as gardens, landscaping, fences, walls and walks;
- 6) Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;
- 7) Any applicable provisions of the City's Design Guidelines.

#### **Pertinent Guidelines for Rehabilitation: Windows**

[...]

- 9) Reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or old photographs.
- 10) Avoid changing the number, location, size, or glazing pattern of windows by cutting new openings, blocking in windows, or installing replacement sash that does not fit the window opening.
- 11) Do not use inappropriate materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, reflective quality or color of the glazing, or appearance of the frame.
- 12) Use replacement windows with true divided lights or interior and exterior fixed muntins with internal spacers to replace historic or original examples.

- 13) If windows warrant replacement, appropriate material for new windows depends upon the context of the building within a historic district, and the age and design of the building. Sustainable materials such as wood, aluminum-clad wood, solid fiberglass, and metal windows are preferred. Vinyl windows are discouraged.
- 14) False muntins and internal removable grilles do not present an historic appearance and should not be used.

## **APPENDIX**

### **Prior BAR Reviews**

December 16, 2008 – BAR approved demolition of a shed (8-0). Renovations of porches, sunroom and 2-car garage approved 6-2 (Hogg, Knight).

April 12, 2009 – BAR approved the request to remove a tree 7-0 on the consent agenda.

July 20, 2010 - BAR could not support the proposal in current form. Mass and details are problematic. Outbuildings should be deferential to, and reflective of, the main structure. Note that accessory dwellings are not permitted in this zoning district.

November 16, 2010 - BAR accepted applicant's request for deferral (8-0). The BAR asked the applicant to continue to reduce the scale in relation to the main house, make the shape of the roof more sympathetic, and provide a site plan showing proposed improvements.

August 16, 2011 – BAR accepted (5-0) applicant's request for deferral. The BAR consensus was to further simplify the design of, and reduce the size of the proposed studio (find a balance between the use/size); submit additional information regarding the changes to the front wall, driveway, addition to garage, and landscaping removal; general accord with rear tree removal but before making that decision they want to see the revised studio and a site plan for the rear yard.

November 15, 2011 - BAR approved (7-1-1, Hogg opposed, Osteen abstaining) the proposed site changes to the front yard, landscaping changes, and the change in roof material as submitted. Further, the proposed garage addition and the supplemental landscape lighting including the post at the front are not approved as submitted, and the applicant is requested to revise those to be consistent with the Design Guidelines.

January 17, 2012 - BAR approved (9-0) applicant's preferred R-2 fixture on the existing stone pier, the motion detector lights, and the changes to the shed roof as submitted.

### Property Information

#### Property Names

Name Explanation	Name
Function/Location	House, 5 Gildersleeve Wood

#### Property Addresses

Current - 5 Gildersleeve Wood

**County/Independent City(s):** Charlottesville (Ind. City)

**Incorporated Town(s):** *No Data*

**Zip Code(s):** 22903

**Magisterial District(s):** *No Data*

**Tax Parcel(s):** *No Data*

**USGS Quad(s):** CHARLOTTESVILLE WEST

#### Property Evaluation Status

Not Evaluated

This Property is associated with the Oakhurst/Gildersleeve Neighborhood Historic District.

### Additional Property Information

**Architecture Setting:** Town

**Acreage:** *No Data*

#### Site Description:

On east side of Gildersleeve Wood; stone wall along road; mature oaks; side driveway with stone gateposts leads back to garage.

-----  
Located south of house.

#### Surveyor Assessment:

The original owner of this Colonial Revival-style modified American Foursquare was R. Chapin Jones, who was Director of the Virginia Forest Service (now the Virginia Department of Forestry) as well as an instructor in Forestry at the University. His daughter Carolyn J. Silver, still lives in the house. It is one of the earliest dwellings on Gildersleeve Wood and is a contributing element to the potential Oakhurst-Gildersleeve Neighborhood Historic District.

**Surveyor Recommendation:** *No Data*

#### Ownership

Ownership Category	Ownership Entity
Private	<i>No Data</i>

### Primary Resource Information

**Resource Category:** Domestic

**Resource Type:** Single Dwelling

**NR Resource Type:** Building

**Historic District Status:** Contributing

**Date of Construction:** Ca 1921

**Date Source:** Site Visit/Map

**Historic Time Period:** World War I to World War II (1917 - 1945)

**Historic Context(s):** Domestic

**Other ID Number:** *No Data*

**Architectural Style:** Colonial Revival

**Form:** *No Data*

**Number of Stories:** 2.0

**Condition:** Excellent

**Threats to Resource:** None Known

#### Architectural Description:

This 2-story, 3-bay, hip-roofed (asphalt shingle), stuccoed dwelling uses elements of the Colonial Revival style. These include overhanging eaves, an interior-end brick chimney, 10-light sidelights around the front door, 1/1 and 6/1-sash windows, 1-bay side and front porches with Doric columns, an eyebrow dormer, and a tripartite multi-light/1 bay window on the first-floor front. Constructed ca. 1921, the house is well preserved.

**Exterior Components**

Component	Component Type	Material	Material Treatment
Roof	Hipped	Asphalt	Shingle
Foundation	Solid/Continuous	<i>No Data</i>	Stucco
Chimneys	Interior End	Brick	<i>No Data</i>
Structural System and Exterior Treatment	Frame	Wood	Stuccoed
Porch	1-story, 1-bay	Wood	Columns, Doric
Windows	Sash, Double-Hung	Wood	6/1

**Secondary Resource Information**

**Secondary Resource #1**

**Resource Category:** Domestic  
**Resource Type:** Garage  
**Date of Construction:** 1950Ca  
**Date Source:** Site Visit  
**Historic Time Period:** The New Dominion (1946 - 1991)  
**Historic Context(s):** Domestic  
**Architectural Style:** *No Data*  
**Form:** *No Data*  
**Condition:** *No Data*  
**Threats to Resource:** None Known

**Architectural Description:**

Garage: 1950s, this hip-roofed, stuccoed, 2-car garage was constructed in order to accommodate a larger car than the old garage would allow.

**Number of Stories:** *No Data*

**Secondary Resource #2**

**Resource Category:** DSS Legacy  
**Resource Type:** Shed  
**Date of Construction:** 1921Ca  
**Date Source:** Site Visit  
**Historic Time Period:** World War I to World War II (1917 - 1945)  
**Historic Context(s):** Domestic  
**Architectural Style:** *No Data*  
**Form:** *No Data*  
**Condition:** *No Data*  
**Threats to Resource:** None Known

**Architectural Description:**

Shed: This ca. 1921 hip-roofed stuccoed building was the original garage and was later converted into a shed.

**Number of Stories:** *No Data*

**Historic District Information**

**Historic District Name:** Oakhurst/Gildersleeve Neighborhood Historic District  
**Local Historic District Name:** *No Data*  
**Historic District Significance:** *No Data*

**CRM Events**

**Event Type: Survey:Phase I/Reconnaissance**

**Project Review File Number:** HD104-5092  
**Investigator:** Kalbian, Maral  
**Organization/Company:** Unknown (DSS)  
**Photographic Media:** *No Data*  
**Survey Date:** 3/1/2004  
**Dhr Library Report Number:** *No Data*

**Project Staff/Notes:**

Survey conducted for the city of Charlottesville in preparation of Preliminary Information Form

**Project Bibliographic Information:**

Name: Bibb, Eugenia  
Record Type: Personal Papers  
Bibliographic Notes: Bibb, Eugenia, "Field Notes," April 15, 2004, 1545 Dairy Road, Charlottesville, Va. 22903

-----  
Name: Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps  
Record Type: Map

-----  
Name: Chville Assessors Records  
Record Type: Local Records  
Bibliographic Notes: Web Site

**Bibliographic Information**

**Bibliography:**

*No Data*

**Property Notes:**

*No Data*



# Board of Architectural Review (BAR) Certificate of Appropriateness

Please Return To: City of Charlottesville  
Department of Neighborhood Development Services  
P.O. Box 911, City Hall  
Charlottesville, Virginia 22902  
Telephone (434) 970-3130

Please submit ~~ten (10) hard copies~~ and one (1) digital copy of application form and all attachments.  
Please include application fee as follows: New construction project \$375; Demolition of a contributing structure \$375;  
Appeal of BAR decision \$125; Additions and other projects requiring BAR approval \$125; Administrative approval \$100.  
Make checks payable to the City of Charlottesville.  
The BAR meets the third Tuesday of the month.  
Deadline for submittals is Tuesday 3 weeks prior to next BAR meeting by 3:30 p.m.

Owner Name Daren Bader and Paul Lyons Applicant Name (owner)  
Project Name/Description Window replacement Parcel Number 110018000  
Project Property Address 5 Gildersleeve Wood

### Applicant Information

Address: 5 Gildersleeve Wood  
Charlottesville, Va 22903  
Email: gilderwood@gmail.com  
Phone: (W) \_\_\_\_\_ (C) \_\_\_\_\_

### Property Owner Information (if not applicant)

Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
Email: \_\_\_\_\_  
Phone: (W) \_\_\_\_\_ (C) \_\_\_\_\_

Do you intend to apply for Federal or State Tax Credits  
for this project? \_\_\_\_\_

### Signature of Applicant

I hereby attest that the information I have provided is, to the best of my knowledge, correct.

Daren Bader

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

Daren Bader 4/5/21

Print Name \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

### Property Owner Permission (if not applicant)

I have read this application and hereby give my consent to its submission.

Daren Bader

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

Daren Bader 4/5/21

Print Name \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

### Description of Proposed Work (attach separate narrative if necessary):

Replace the sash in ten (10) c1980s aluminum, 1/1, double-hung windows with Pella Reserve sash with insulated glass--applied grille on upper sash. New sash to be 6/1, replicating the original c1920 windows. Exterior wood trim to remain.

### List All Attachments (see reverse side for submittal requirements):

Attached photos and Pella spec

### For Office Use Only

Received by: O. Eubank

Fee paid: 125.00 Cash/Ck. # 002

Date Received: 5/10/2021

Revised 2016

Approved/Disapproved by: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Conditions of approval: \_\_\_\_\_

PEI-0071



# 5 Gildersleeve Wood

Customer: PAUL LYONS

Project Name: Paul Lyons - 5 Gildersleeve Wood, Charlottesville

Quote Number: 13885933

Line #	Location	Attributes	Qty
10	UPSTAIRS	<p><b>Pella® Reserve, Traditional, Double Hung, 34 X 65, White</b></p> <p>1: Traditional, Non-Standard Size Non-Standard Size Double Hung, Equal Frame Size: 34 X 65                      General Information: Standard, Luxury, Clad, Pine, 5", 3 11/16"                      Exterior Color / Finish: Painted, Standard Enduraclad, White                      Interior Color / Finish: Wheat Stain Interior                      Sash / Panel: Ogee, Ogee, Standard, No Sash Lugs                      Glass: Insulated Dual Low-E Advanced Low-E Insulating Glass Argon Non High Altitude                      Hardware Options: Spoon-Style Lock, Oil Rubbed Bronze, No Window Opening Control Device, No Limited Opening Hardware, Order Sash Lift, No Integrated Sensor                      Screen: Integrated RolSCREEN® Lower Sash Only                      Performance Information: U-Factor 0.29, SHGC 0.25, VLT 0.47, CPD PEL-N-232-00255-00001, Performance Class CW, PG 50, Calculated Positive DP Rating 50, Calculated Negative DP Rating 50, Year Rated 08/11, Egress Meets Typical 5.7 sqft (E) (United States Only)                      Grille: ILT, No Custom Grille, 7/8", Traditional (3W2H / 0W0H), Ogee, Ogee                      Wrapping Information: No Exterior Trim, 3 11/16", 5", Factory Applied, Pella Recommended Clearance, Perimeter Length = 108"</p>	10
		<p>PK # 2085</p> <p>Viewed From Exterior                      Rough Opening: 34 - 3/4" X 65 - 3/4"</p>	
		<p>INSTPOCKET00 - Pocket install single window</p>	Qty 1
		<p>COLONLY02 - Coil wrap clad wood pocket single unit</p>	Qty 1





**5 Gildersleeve Wood.** Replacement of ten second floor windows: Six on the front (west) elevation; one on the side (south) elevation; three on the rear (east) elevation.



Front and side



Rear - SE Corner



Rear - NE Corner



House of similar to 5 Gildersleeve Wood, c1921.

**1930 Thomson Rd — c1928**

