

From: [Murphy, Mollie](#)
To: tdub.ardinae@gmail.com
Cc: [Werner, Jeffrey B](#)
Subject: BAR # 23-02-02
Date: Friday, February 24, 2023 8:25:00 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR # 23-02-02

600 Lexington Ave, TMP 520165000

Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District

Owner: Tom Ward

Applicant: Tom Ward

Project: Window installation

Mr. Ward:

The CoA for the above referenced project was approved by the City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review on February 22, 2023. The following action was taken:

Action: *Motion approved (5-0) with approval of Consent Agenda at the beginning of the meeting:* Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including Historic Conservation District Guidelines, I move to find that the proposed window replacement at 600 Lexington Avenue satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Note: Ms. Lewis moved to approve Consent Agenda. Zehmer second. Motion passed 5-0. (Mr. Schwarz abstains from Consent Agenda)

For specifics of the discussion, the meeting video is on-line at:

<https://boxcast.tv/channel/vabajtzezyv3iclkx1a?b=gv0e4cwtctydvwjjke2c>

Per the provisions of City Code Sec. 34-280: This CoA is valid for 18 months [from the date of BAR approval]; upon written request and for reasonable cause, the director of NDS or the BAR may extend that period by one year; and this CoA does not, in and of itself, authorize any work or activity that requires a building permit. (Link to Sec. 34-280: [CoA period of validity](#))

If you have any questions, please contact me at wernerjb@charlottesville.gov.
(Please remove the BAR notice sign.)

Sincerely,
Mollie Murphy



Mollie Murphy
Assistant Historic Preservation and Design Planner
Neighborhood Development Services
City of Charlottesville
(434) 970-3515 | murphymo@charlottesville.gov

<https://www.charlottesville.gov/264/Historic-Preservation-Design-Review>

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
Staff Report
February 22, 2023**



Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation)

BAR # 23-02-02

600 Lexington Ave, TMP 520165000

Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District

Owner/Applicant: Tom Ward

Project: Window installation



Background

Year Built: 1930

District: Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District

Status: Contributing

(Historical survey in Appendix)

Prior BAR Reviews

June 19, 2019 - BAR approved CoA for fence and pergola on the south side of the rear yard.

Application

Applicant submitted:

- Applicant photo: Existing south elevation and photo-sim with twin windows.

Request to replace a single double-hung window on the south wall with twin windows, to match the existing.

Discussion

Staff recommends approval as a Consent Agenda item. (Approval of the agenda incorporates the motion to approve below.)

This parcel is a corner lot at the intersection of Lexington Avenue and Sycamore Street. Because the south wall is visible from Sycamore Street, this alteration requires BAR approval. Within the HC districts, the ordinance allows the replacement of windows without BAR review, except when the wall opening is altered (ref Sec. 34-340(c)). Applying Sec. 34-342, staff finds the proposed change is visually and architecturally compatible with the house and the district; is

in harmony with the proportion, sizes and placement of existing windows; does not change the essential architectural form and integrity of the house; does not architecturally conflict with the district; and does not conflict with the district's design guidelines.

Note: The regulations and guidelines for projects within a Historic Conservation District (HCD) are, by design, less rigid than those for an ADC District or an IPP. The HCD designations are intended to preserve the character-defining elements of the neighborhoods and to assure that new construction is not inappropriate to that character, while minimally imposing on current residents who may want to upgrade their homes. Within the existing HCDs are buildings and/or areas that might easily qualify for an ADC District or as an IPP; however, in evaluating proposals within HCDs, the BAR may apply only the HCD requirements and guidelines.

Suggested Motions

Approval: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including Historic Conservation District Guidelines, I move to find that the proposed window replacement at 600 Lexington Avenue satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Criteria, Standards, and Guidelines

Review Criteria Generally

Sec. 34-341 - Criteria for approval

- a. In considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:
 1. That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the conservation district design guidelines; and
 2. The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the conservation district in which the property is located.
- b. The BAR's review of the proposed new construction or addition to a building or structure shall be limited to factors specified in section 34-342. The BAR's review of the proposed demolition, razing or moving of any contributing structure shall be limited to the factors specified in section 34-343.
- c. The BAR, or city council on appeal, may require conditions of approval as are necessary or desirable to ensure that any new construction or addition would be compatible with the scale and character of the historic conservation district. Prior to attaching conditions to an approval, due consideration shall be given to the cost of compliance with the proposed conditions.

Sec. 34-342 - Standards for review of new construction and additions.

The following features and factors shall be considered in determining the appropriateness of proposed new construction and additions to buildings or structures:

- 1) Whether the form, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable conservation district;
- 2) The harmony of the proposed changes in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances and windows;
- 3) The impact of the proposed change on the essential architectural form and integrity of the existing building;

- 4) The effect, with respect to architectural considerations, of the proposed change on the conservation district neighborhood;
- 5) Any applicable provisions of the city's conservation district design guidelines.

Sec. 34-340. - Actions requiring certificate of appropriateness; exemptions; penalties.

- c) The proposed demolition, razing or moving of any building or structure requires a COA only when:
 - 1) The building is a contributing structure; and
 - 2) The proposed demolition is located in whole or in part to the front or side of the contributing structure; or
 - 3) The proposed demolition is located on a lot that abuts a street on the side or rear; or
 - 4) The proposed demolition is equal to or greater than thirty-three (33) percent of the total gross floor area of the existing building. **However, the removal or replacement of windows or doors shall not constitute a demolition under this conservation district article, provided the size of the opening is not altered.**

From the Guidelines for New Construction and Additions (Historic Conservation)

Building Openings – orientation, doors and windows

1. A single entrance door (or main entrance of a multifamily dwelling) facing the street is recommended.
2. Window and door patterns and the ratio of solids (wall area) to voids (window and door area) of new buildings should be compatible with contributing buildings in the surrounding area.
3. Windows should be simple shapes compatible with those on contributing buildings, which are generally vertically oriented in residential areas.

Staff Comment: New windows are consistent with the existing house and the district

Guidelines specific to the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District

Architectural character-defining features:

1. Encourage one-story front porches;
2. Encourage garages to be located in the rear yards;
3. The levels of a building's stories should be consistent with those on surrounding structures with respect to the natural grade [for example, a first floor should not be raised so that it is higher than most surrounding first floors];
4. Do not exclude well-designed, new contemporary architecture [there may be a misconception that only historic-looking new buildings are permitted];
5. Encourage standing seam metal roofs;
6. Maintain and encourage tree canopy [Maintain the existing tree canopy and encourage new large shade trees];
7. The following Historic Conservation Overlay District Design Guidelines are especially pertinent: maintain neighborhood massing and form; encourage the use of sustainable materials; and limit the height of fences in front yards to 3 ½ feet in height.
8. Regarding the future development of the hospital properties, the neighborhood's focus has been: not to tear down the old houses; to encourage low density residential development north of Taylor Walk (with the suggestion that Taylor Street be reinstated); and to expect the High Street area to develop as a sensitively designed, high-quality, mixed use development;
9. Encourage good stewardship of Maplewood Cemetery.

Appendix
Historical Survey

600 Lexington Avenue



TM/P: 52/165

DHR: 104-5144-0043

Primary Resource Information: Single Dwelling, Stories 2.00

Style: Other, 1930.

August 2007: This 2-story, 2-bay, hipped-roof American Foursquare is finished in stucco and has a hipped-roof porch that stretches across the entire façade. Clerk J. Briscoe Mundy built the house in 1930 on speculation, promptly selling it the same year to Charles Carroll. Carroll and his family are buried in Maplewood Cemetery. Approached via a single concrete step, the porch is supported by 3 slender Tuscan columns. The door is located in the south bay of the west-facing façade, while the other bay of the 1st floor has a pair of windows. The 2nd story bays have one window each; all windows are 3/1-sash. Brick chimneys emerge from either side of the roof and a hipped roof dormer with a 3-light casement window peeks out of the center of the metal roof. A 1-story, stucco-finished addition is attached to the rear of the house and is flush with the south elevation.

Individual Resource Status: Single Dwelling

Contributing: 1

600 Lexington Avenue — Window replacement, south elevation — BAR review Feb 22, 2023

