

**From:** Scala, Mary Joy  
**Sent:** Monday, June 27, 2016 11:40 AM  
**To:** 'Russell Skinner'  
**Cc:** 'MNSenzyme@t-online.de'  
**Subject:** BAR Actions - June 21, 2016 - 36 University Circle

June 27, 2016

Russell Skinner and Abbot Skinner, Architects  
707 East Jefferson Street  
Charlottesville, VA 22902

**RE: Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-03-04

36 University Circle

Tax Parcel 060092000

Margaret Nelsons Spethmann, G.P.A., Owner/Russell Skinner, Applicant  
Front Dormer Redesign

Dear Applicant,

The above referenced project was discussed before a meeting of the City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR) on June 21, 2016. The following action was taken:

**Graves moved to find that the revised dormers and plan to remove aluminum siding satisfies the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road- University Circle- Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following modifications:**

- **Keep existing windows, but with new storms**
- **Patching/repairing the existing shingles after removing the aluminum siding**
- **Move to a two dormer option as shown on the drawings submitted to the BAR at the meeting.**

**Balut seconded. Motion approved (8-0).**

This certificate of appropriateness shall expire in 18 months (December 21, 2017), unless within that time period you have either: been issued a building permit for construction of the improvements if one is required, or if no building permit is required, commenced the project. The expiration date may differ if the COA is associated with a valid site plan. You may request an extension of the certificate of appropriateness *before this approval expires* for one additional year for reasonable cause.

If you have any questions, please contact me at 434-970-3130 or [scala@charlottesville.org](mailto:scala@charlottesville.org).

Sincerely yours,

Mary Joy Scala, AICP  
Preservation and Design Planner

**Mary Joy Scala, AICP**  
Preservation and Design Planner  
City of Charlottesville  
Department of Neighborhood Development Services  
City Hall – 610 East Market Street  
P.O. Box 911  
Charlottesville, VA 22902  
Ph 434.970.3130 FAX 434.970.3359  
[scala@charlottesville.org](mailto:scala@charlottesville.org)

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE  
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
June 21, 2016**



**Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-03-04

36 University Circle

Tax Parcel 060092000

Margaret Nelsons Spethmann, G.P.A., Owner/Russell Skinner, Applicant

Front Dormer Redesign

---

**Background**

This property (36 University Circle) is a contributing structure in the Rugby Road- University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District. The survey is attached. The Colonial Revival dwelling was constructed circa 1911-1916.

March 15, 2016 – Sarafin moved to find that the proposed changes to the dwelling and the new garage satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road- University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, aside from the design of the two dormers on the front façade to come back later (probably when the siding decisions possibly come back) and additional information on the condition of the existing windows, particularly on the street side façade, to come back to the BAR in the future. Mohr seconded. Motion passes (6-0-1, with Balut abstained)

**Application**

The applicant has provided a new design for the two dormers on the front façade, and has decided to keep the original windows, and has provided additional information on the condition of the siding.

The applicant proposes keeping the existing windows, and replacing the existing old storm windows with previously BAR approved Velv-a-lume storm windows, by West Windows.

Regarding the siding, the applicant plans to tear off the aluminum siding and patch, replace, and repair the existing cedar shingles and paint them in a weathered gray color for uniformity. The applicant will keep the Board informed if the plan needs to be amended as the uncovering commences.

**Criteria, Standards and Guidelines**

**Review Criteria Generally**

*Sec. 34-284(b) of the City Code states that,*

*In considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:*

- (1) That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the Design Guidelines established by the board pursuant to Sec.34-288(6); and*
- (2) The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the protected property that is the subject of the application.*

**Standards for Review of Construction and Alterations**

- (1) Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable design control district;*
- (2) The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs and signs;*
- (3) The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;*
- (4) The effect of the proposed change on the historic district neighborhood;*
- (5) The impact of the proposed change on other protected features on the property, such as gardens, landscaping, fences, walls and walks;*
- (6) Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;*
- (7) When reviewing any proposed sign as part of an application under consideration, the standards set forth within Article IX, Sections 34-1020, et seq. shall be applied; and*
- (8) Any applicable provisions of the city's Design Guidelines (see Sec. 34-288(6)).*

## **Pertinent Guidelines for Rehabilitation**

### **C. WINDOWS**

Windows add light to the interior of a building, provide ventilation, and allow a visual link to the outside. They also play a major part in defining a building's particular style. Because of the wide variety of architectural styles and periods of construction within the districts, there is a corresponding variation of styles, types, and sizes of windows.

Windows are one of the major character-defining features on buildings and can be varied by different designs of sills, panes, sashes, lintels, decorative caps, and shutters. They may occur in regular intervals or in asymmetrical patterns. Their size may highlight various bay divisions in the building. All of the windows may be the same or there may be a variety of types that give emphasis to certain parts of the building.

- 1. Prior to any repair or replacement of windows, a survey of existing window conditions is recommended. Note number of windows, whether each window is original or replaced, the material, type, hardware and finish, the condition of the frame, sash, sill, putty, and panes.*
- 2. Retain original windows when possible.*
- 3. Uncover and repair covered up windows and reinstall windows where they have been blocked in.*
- 4. If the window is no longer needed, the glass should be retained and the back side frosted, screened, or shuttered so that it appears from the outside to be in use.*
- 5. Repair original windows by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing. Wood that appears to be in bad condition because of peeling paint or separated joints often can be repaired.*
- 6. Replace historic components of a window that are beyond repair with matching components.*
- 7. Replace entire windows only when they are missing or beyond repair.*
- 8. If a window on the primary façade of a building must be replaced and an existing window of the same style, material, and size is identified on a secondary elevation, place the historic window in the window opening on the primary façade.*
- 9. Reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or old photographs.*
- 10. Avoid changing the number, location, size, or glazing pattern of windows by cutting new openings, blocking in windows, or installing replacement sash that does not fit the window opening.*
- 11. Do not use inappropriate materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, reflective quality or color of the glazing, or appearance of the frame.*

12. *Use replacement windows with true divided lights or interior and exterior fixed muntins with internal spacers to replace historic or original examples.*
13. *If windows warrant replacement, appropriate material for new windows depends upon the context of the building within a historic district, and the age and design of the building. Sustainable materials such as wood, aluminum-clad wood, solid fiberglass, and metal windows are preferred. Vinyl windows are discouraged.*
14. *False muntins and internal removable grilles do not present an historic appearance and should not be used.*
15. *Do not use tinted or mirrored glass on major facades of the building. Translucent or low (e) glass may be strategies to keep heat gain down.*
16. *Storm windows should match the size and shape of the existing windows and the original sash configuration. Special shapes, such as arched top storms, are available.*
17. *Storm windows should not damage or obscure the windows and frames.*
18. *Avoid aluminum-colored storm sash. It can be painted an appropriate color if it is first primed with a zinc chromate primer.*
19. *The addition of shutters may be appropriate if not previously installed but are compatible with the style of the building or neighborhood.*
20. *In general shutters should be wood (rather than metal or vinyl) and should be mounted on hinges. In some circumstances, appropriately dimensioned, painted, composite material shutters may be used.*
21. *The size of the shutters should result in their covering the window opening when closed.*
22. *Avoid shutters on composite or bay windows.*
23. *If using awnings, ensure that they align with the opening being covered.*
24. *Use awning colors that are compatible with the colors of the building.*

## G. ROOF

1. *When replacing a standing seam metal roof, the width of the pan and the seam height should be consistent with the original. Ideally, the seams would be hand crimped.*
2. *If pre-painted standing seam metal roof material is permitted, commercial-looking ridge caps or ridge vents are not appropriate on residential structures.*
3. *Original roof pitch and configuration should be maintained.*
4. *The original size and shape of dormers should be maintained.*
5. *Dormers should not be introduced on visible elevations where none existed originally.*
6. *Retain elements, such as chimneys, skylights, and light wells that contribute to the style and character of the building.*
7. *When replacing a roof, match original materials as closely as possible.*
  - a. *Avoid, for example, replacing a standing-seam metal roof with asphalt shingles, as this would dramatically alter the building's appearance.*
  - b. *Artificial slate is an acceptable substitute when replacement is needed.*
  - c. *Do not change the appearance or material of parapet coping.*
8. *Place solar collectors and antennae on non-character defining roofs or roofs of non-historic adjacent buildings.*
9. *Do not add new elements, such as vents, skylights, or additional stories that would be visible on the primary elevations of the building.*

## I. WOOD

The flexibility of wood has made it the most common building material throughout much of America's building history. Because it can be shaped easily by sawing, planing, carving, and gouging, wood is used for a broad range of decorative elements, such as cornices, brackets, shutters,

columns, storefronts, and trim on windows and doors. In addition, wood is used in major elements such as framing, siding, and shingles.

1. *Repair rotted or missing sections rather than replace the entire element.*
  - a. *Use epoxies to patch, piece, or consolidate parts.*
  - b. *Match existing materials and details.*
2. *Replace wood elements only when they are rotted beyond repair.*
  - a. *Match the original in material and design by substituting materials that convey the same visual appearance or by using surviving material.*
  - b. *Base the design of reconstructed elements on pictorial or physical evidence from the actual building rather than from similar buildings in the area.*
  - c. *Complement the existing details, size, scale, and material.*
3. *Do not substitute vinyl for wood railing and trim. Some composites, including fiberglass reinforced composite, may be found acceptable as a substitute material for a specific application, but must be painted.*

## J. SYNTHETIC SIDING

A building's historic character is a combination of its design, age, setting, and materials. The exterior walls of a building, because they are so visible, play a very important role in defining its historic appearance. Wood clapboards, wood shingles, wood board-and-batten, brick, stone, stucco or a combination of the above materials all have distinctive characteristics. Synthetic materials can never have the same patina, texture or light reflective qualities.

These modern materials have changed over time but have included asbestos, asphalt, vinyl, aluminum, and artificial stucco and have been used to artificially create the appearance of brick, stone, shingle, stucco, and wood siding surfaces.

1. *Avoid applying synthetic siding. In addition to changing the appearance of a historic building, synthetic siding can make maintenance more difficult because it covers up potential problems that can become more serious. And synthetic siding, once it dents or fades needs painting just as frequently as wood.*
2. *Remove synthetic siding and restore original building material, if possible.*

### **Discussion and Recommendations**

The BAR should decide if the new dormer design is appropriate. It is a good plan to keep the existing windows, and to remove the aluminum siding.

### **Suggested Motion**

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the revised dormers and plan to remove aluminum siding satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted (or with the following modifications...).

### 36 University Circle



<b>STREET ADDRESS:</b>	36 University Circle
<b>MAP &amp; PARCEL:</b>	6-92
<b>PRESENT ZONING:</b>	R-1
<b>ORIGINAL OWNER:</b>	Fletcher D. Woodward
<b>ORIGINAL USE:</b>	Single Family
<b>PRESENT USE:</b>	Single Family
<b>PRESENT OWNER:</b>	Nelson, Bruce W & Sally C Trustees
<b>ADDRESS:</b>	Nelson, Bruce W & Sally C Trustees 36 University Circle Charlottesville, Va. 22903
<b>DATE/ PERIOD:</b>	Ca. 1915
<b>STYLE:</b>	Colonial Revival
<b>HEIGHT IN STORIES:</b>	1.5 stories
<b>DIMENSIONS AND LAND AREA:</b>	2,626 sq. ft/0.338 acres
<b>SOURCES:</b>	Charlottesville City Records and 2004 Architectural Survey
<b>CONTRIBUTING:</b>	Yes

#### ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

This 1 ½-story, frame Colonial Revival-style dwelling was constructed in the 1910s. Details include: weatherboard siding; raised basement; gable roof with front cross gable; symmetrical 3-bay front; 1-bay front porch with paired Tuscan posts; grouped windows; entry with floor-length sidelights; interior brick chimneys; and side wing. This slightly altered house features a central cross-gable opening onto the top of the front porch. It was probably built for Dr. Fletcher D. Woodward, Professor of Medicine at UVA in the 1920s and contributes to the District.

**ABBOT SKINNER**  
**ARCHITECTS, PLLC**  
707 EAST JEFFERSON STREET  
CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA 22902  
434-971-1438 Phone and Fax  
E-mail- ruskin4@earthlink.net

**RECEIVED**

MAY 31 2016

NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

May 31, 2016

Mary Joy Scala, AICP  
Preservation and Design Planner  
City of Charlottesville  
Department of Neighborhood Development Services

Re: 36 University Circle  
Nelson Spethmann Project

Dear Mary Joy,

As I understand it we have three outstanding issues.

1. **Dormers:** Attached you will find a drawing showing both the previous dormer design and the new proposed dormer. The client is quite enthusiastic about the added upstairs space this new design affords.
2. **Siding:** The plan now is to tear off the aluminum siding, patch, replace and repair, as required, the existing cedar shingles and paint them in a weathered gray color for uniformity. We will keep the Board informed as the uncovering commences, if our plan needs to be amended.
3. **Windows:** Keep the existing windows and replace the existing old storm windows with previously BAR approved Velv-a-lume storm windows, by West Windows

I'm looking forward to appearing before the Board.

Sincerely,



Russell Skinner  
Abbot Skinner Architects



1  
A.I. 1/4" = 1'-0" 06-21-16

---

Approved version  
Received at BAIR meeting 6/21/2016





Front Elevation - Proposed  
Scale: 1/4" = 1'-0"



Front Elevation - Submitted  
Scale: 1/4" = 1'-0"



*Not approved*

**ABBOT SKINNER**  
ARCHITECTS PLLC

707 EAST JEFFERSON STREET  
CHARLOTTEVILLE, VIRGINIA 22902  
RUSSELL SKINNER 434.971.1438

**Nelson Residence**  
Remodeling & Additions  
University Circle  
Charlottesville, Virginia

Exterior Elevations  
Front Dormer Study

31 May 2016

BAR