

**HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

DRAFT Minutes

Basement Conference Room City Hall

March ~~17, January 20~~, 2010

12:00 pm

<u>Members Present</u>		<u>Staff</u>
<del>Charlie Armstrong, Co-Chair</del> <del>— Melissa Celli</del> Charlie Armstrong, Co-Chair		Kathy McHugh
<del>Vicki Hawes</del>		Melissa Celli
<del>Dave Norris</del> Kathy Galvin		
Tony Waterfield		Nick Rogers
Satyendra Huja		
Richard Spurzem		
Sasha Farmer		<u>Others</u>
Chris Murray		Marnie Allen
Peter Loach		Edith Good
<u>Randy Bickers</u>		Paul Vaughan
Susan Pleiss		Paul Beyer
Karen Waters		Dave Norris
<del>Kathy Galvin</del> Jennifer Jacobs		
<u>Joy Johnson</u>		
<u>Members Absent</u>		
Dan Rosensweig		
Art Lichtenberger		
Reed Banks		
Ryan Jacoby		
<u>Non-Voting Members Absent</u>		
Ron White		
Vicki Hawes		

Meeting began at 12:~~40~~00 pm, ~~as the Airport Authority's meeting ran slightly over time.~~

**Introductions/Welcome:** Charlie Armstrong welcomed everyone and explained that Art Lichtenberger was unable to attend due to a work related issue.

Mr. Armstrong then asked everyone to review the minutes and advise of any necessary changes. With no further comments/discussion, the minutes were approved by unanimous vote.

**Updates from the Chair:** ~~Advised of the upcoming Affordable Housing Symposium on 2/5/10 being sponsored by the Batten School of Leadership & Public Policy at UVA. Mayor Norris added in that the Batten School event would be in sync with the housing report going to Council and also his proposal to Council for permanent dedicated funding for housing. He asked the HAC if any members are interested in sitting down with him informally (at a time to be determined) to discuss a presentation to the City Council regarding a dedicated fund for affordable housing from the Capital Improvements Fund. Dan Rosensweig added that the Planning Commission has recommended a set aside of \$1.4 million.~~

~~Discussed Haiti Benefit Concert being put on Saturday at 6 pm at the Fry's Spring Beach Club to raise money for Haiti relief to support Partners in Health. Attendees were encouraged to come out for music and food, as well as a silent auction to provide financial aid to those in need. Art Lichtenberger asked Dan Rosensweig to provide the committee with an update on information related to tax assessments for Habitat-for-Humanity assisted properties, wherein there is a deed restriction relative to: (1) right of first refusal by Habitat for Humanity; and (2) for as long as the first mortgage is in place, any future sales price will have to be dictated by a formula that takes the initial sales price into consideration and then increases or decreases the same by the percentage change in the annual median sales price for the Charlottesville area.~~

~~Dan Rosensweig went on to explain that Habitat for Humanity is using deed restrictions on assisted homes in order to make the homes more affordable. In turn, the restriction limits the value of the house compared to actual fair market value (FMV). Since tax assessments are based on FMV, the properties will be assessed at a rate higher than the potential sales price (as dictated by the deed restriction). Given that the initial price of the home is lower than FMV at the time of closing (due to extensive use of volunteer labor), the higher taxation places a hardship on low income families who purchase Habitat housing because they will be paying property taxes that are do not take the deed restriction into consideration.~~

~~Art Lichtenberger suggested that the group form a sub-committee to examine the specifics on the situation and write a letter to the City Council. Further, Peter Loach agreed that this issue is important if we want to keep housing affordable. Mr. Rosensweig then asked Council representative Satyendra Huja his position and Councilman Huja advised that the City must follow State law/policy.~~

~~Joy Johnson stated that she was concerned about the use of the term ***deed restriction*** and how it can mean different things from one use to another. Further, Karen Waters stated that she thought it was premature to start forming sub-committees until we know what we are doing. She clarified that while she does not think that the idea is bad, that this issue should not be addressed at the beginning of the meeting as it would need to be reviewed by the Committee in light of an overall work plan.~~

~~As a result of these concerns the discussion regarding tax assessments and deed restrictions was placed on hold. The group decided that they would like to do a joint~~

Formatted: Font: Bold, Italic

meeting with the CDBG taskforce to identify and work toward common goals. Melissa Celii added that such a meeting could be accommodated at the April CDBG Task Force meeting.

**Updates from Staff:**  ~~Melissa discussed handouts and a vote was taken to approve the October 28, 2009 minutes with a motion by Art Lichtenberger and second by Karen Waters. The motion passed.~~

Melissa Celii advised that the report on **Goals for Affordable Housing** would be presented to the City Council at their meeting on February 1, 2010, and that the plan was adopted “as is” with the goal of 15% increase in affordable housing over the next 15 years.

Formatted: Font: Bold

Karen Waters asked why staff recommended a lower percentage of increase from the amount specified in the report (i.e., 15% down to 12%). Melissa Celii explained that staff was asked by the City Manager to make a recommendation and that this was done, along with a provision that increases be tied to budgetary constraints.

Kathy McHugh then reviewed information related to the calendar of “housing-related” events including an upcoming UVA class devoted to affordable housing research by students and an upcoming weekend event being sponsored by CRHA at the Westhaven Community Center which would feature information regarding Habitat for Humanity and other related programs. Unfortunately, Ms. McHugh was under the impression that this was the type of information being previously requested by HAC members and not a calendar of City-related events.

Karen Waters explained that “outside events” were not the focus and that the HAC needs a calendar of city-related events (including CRHA, CDBG Task Force and others) so that members can be aware of what is going on and be afforded notice to attend various events as schedules allow.

Joy Johnson stated that she would like to see a list of projects using CHF dollars so that she is aware of on-going projects/efforts using City of Charlottesville funding.

Kathy McHugh explained that she would prepare the calendar and send it out over the next week and would get with Melissa Celii to develop a list of projects using CHF monies to be provided at the next meeting.

Kathy McHugh then reviewed the chart of grant possibilities provided as a handout. As Melissa Celii and Kathy McHugh had just listened into a HUD audio conference regarding the Sustainable Communities program, they were able to explain that the funding announcement has been issued as a draft and that comments will be received until March 12<sup>th</sup>. Ms. McHugh advised that she would send members a link so that they could comment on the announcement.

Formatted: Superscript

As time was running short, Kathy McHugh explained that the rental monthly snapshot had been updated and was available as a handout, but discussion of various issues related to the information would be postponed until next meeting.

**Other Issues:**

Ms. Amy Kilroy and Mr. Randy Bickers with CRHA presented a PowerPoint presentation to the HAC membership regarding the redevelopment master plan for CRHA properties. In conjunction with several layouts, information was provided regarding the various options being considered.

During the presentation by CRHA (and in no specific order) the following issues were discussed:

- Ms. Joy Johnson stated that she would like to see more of an educational outreach to PHAR (not to push a specific scenario/agenda) to provide information about what is included in the CRHA Master Plan.
- Dan Rosensweig asked about the proposed parking to housing unit ratio and advised that the zoning ordinance covers parking requirements that will need to be incorporated into the plan and/or in some cases a waiver may need to be obtained. Amy advised that she sent WRT a copy of the zoning ordinance.
- Karen Waters asked if there had been any data collection on social ramifications (e.g., how people get along and if young people have access to activities to keep busy) of various housing redevelopment scenarios and how it has worked in other areas. Amy Kilroy advised that no research has been done on this particular subject to her knowledge.
- Randy Bickers advised that CRHA would like to have a split of 33 1/3% for ACC, LITC and market rate units to be able to achieve mixed income communities.
- Karen Water asked about information regarding the original school district ratio/numbers by CRHA site.
- Amy Kilroy advised that she met with the School Board to make sure that development plans adhere to school capacities.
- Chris Murray asked if employment options have been considered and how these will be incorporated to provide jobs for home businesses/cottage industries.

After the presentation, Dan Rosensweig announced that although the last Planning Commission (PC) meeting was cancelled due to bad weather, that the PC is currently working on revising the zoning matrix for residential property uses. He advised that there will be a public hearing and that recommendations will come back to the HAC. Information on the draft zoning matrix for housing/residential is to be sent out to the Committee.

**Formatted:** Font: Bold

**Formatted:** Indent: Left: 0.25", Hanging: 0.25"

**Formatted:** Tab stops: 0.25", Left

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5", Tab stops: 0.25", Left

**Formatted:** Bullets and Numbering

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5"

**Formatted:** Indent: Left: 0.25"

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5"

**Formatted:** Bullets and Numbering

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5"

**Formatted:** Bullets and Numbering

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5"

**Formatted:** Bullets and Numbering

**Formatted:** Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.25" + Tab after: 0.5" + Indent at: 0.5"

**Formatted:** Bullets and Numbering

Art suggested that we dedicate the next HAC meeting to discussing subcommittees and outline a work plan. Joy Johnson advised that the work plan focus should be on three big picture items: 1) publicity/outreach/education; 2) advocacy of various issues and collection of information; and 3) HAC calendar and possible website changes to better communicate information.

There was also a recommendation made by Susan Pleiss that prior to subcommittee work that priorities be set to make sure that subcommittees have clear direction/focus from the HAC as a whole.

Karen Waters reiterated the need for a calendar of events, which was echoed by Joy Johnson. Joy also stated that she wants to hear from the City Council to incorporate events and planned efforts into the calendar. Ms. Johnson specifically mentioned that City of Charlottesville Consolidated Plan and wanted to know where it is (planning wise) and what the HAC can do to be involved.

There was also a discussion by Joy Johnson of how to get increased participation by low to moderate income persons in the process of discussing housing in Charlottesville and what the Committee needs to do to ensure that the City meets its 15% goal over the next 15 years.

There was a concern expressed by Council Huja that we have talked about housing issues for a long time; however, no new housing has been built.

Karen Waters commented that now that the report is finished that there are things that HAC needs to do as a committee to make the plan happen.

Art applauded the HAC for finishing the report, as it was a very involved and difficult effort.

7

**~~Discussion on Housing Report:~~** ~~Karen Waters suggested that cover photograph be changed to show denser multi-family housing and Co-Chair Charlie Armstrong thanked Melissa for all her hard work on preparing and revising the report.~~

**~~Discussion on Other Issues:~~**

~~The group focused discussion for the remainder of the meeting on setting 2010 Housing Advisory Committee priorities and goals.~~

~~As to priorities and goals, Co-Chair Armstrong suggested that the group focus on where they go from here and to be as specific as possible by setting concrete short-term goals so as to put “big picture” issues into achievable action items.~~

Kathy Galvin had sent out some goals to the HAC and asked the group to consider putting housing into context and to not isolate it as a separate issue. Specifically, she asked that the group consider employment, transit, jobs, and design all together. She noted that housing is impacted by all of these issues and neighborhoods need to be looked at in terms of the big picture.

A group discussion / brain storming session followed with input and comments from multiple attendees, as follows: It was stated that the Housing Authority and the City have similar needs in that while they are different, they share common concerns over provision and protection of affordable housing. As such, it was suggested that the next HAC meeting be dedicated to meeting with the CRHA group to determine what is planned / proposed for redevelopment of public housing in Charlottesville.

The need to have more transparency was also highlighted as a concern. The group wants to take an active role in communicating what affordable housing looks like and what is the desired "end result". In short, it was thought that the HAC should fill in the gaps for the public to educate them as to how funding for affordable housing impacts them. Further, that the public needs to understand why affordable housing is relevant and why the drop in the housing market has not fixed the identified affordable housing needs of the city. In order to communicate this information, it was thought that a public event for educational purposes would be helpful.

Methods to achieve additional outreach included a series of articles in the C'ville News / The Hook, with a focus on those who impact funding for affordable housing and on those that need the housing. It was recognized that the general public needs to understand why it is important to fund affordable housing and what benefits come about as a result. Further, borderline cases (homeowners and renters) need to be informed about strategies that might allow them to stay in their houses and avoid foreclosure / eviction. Need to identify ways that affordable housing can be given priority through QAP.

Need to develop aggressive policies to encourage mixed income communities and ways to integrate more inter generational housing were also identified as priorities.

The upcoming update of the City's Comprehensive Plan was thought to be a good way to update the housing section of the plan by making recommendations to be included in the Plan

A consolidated calendar of HAC events and associated housing activities was thought to be a must, as it would provide a way to identify relevant events and allow people to plan for attendance.

It was suggested that the HAC recommend to the City that they support affordable housing legislation that would encourage provision of on-site affordable housing and to examine the location of such housing.

~~Further, that enabling legislation be adopted to allow for revised tax assessment policy to allow for owners of deed restricted properties to pay taxes based on their ability to pay. Further, to examine funds expended as a result of tax abatement.~~

~~Long term fixes have been overlooked in the past in lieu of using band-aids / temporary fixes. Options were discussed that would provide a more long term solution. Options included providing people with more wealth potential so that affordable housing is no longer needed and or the need is reduced.~~

~~Transportation is a huge housing issue for people because they need access to jobs, as well as goods and services. Providing housing related jobs to low income persons and allowing home businesses (through inclusionary zoning) are two policy methods to enable the private market to provide housing.~~

~~It was noted that prior criminal records (i.e., a felony conviction) can restrict housing opportunities even if the conviction was related to some non-violent offense such as writing a bad check. Also, that homeowner or condo associations can restrict home businesses, which would allow people to stay at home while earning income and ultimately reduce transportation and other associated costs to the family.~~

~~Promotion of housing types that allow for income producing uses (i.e., live-work units) was discussed as one way to provide additional assistance. Further, it was thought that integration of mixed use and mixed income is a concept that the public needs to be educated about.~~

~~With respect to current City requirements for affordable housing, there was a discussion of the fact that there has been only one application (proffer or rezoning) that was required to meet City requirements. Ultimately, the developer was able to actually reduce their original offer to provide affordable housing units to a lesser number. As such, it was concluded that the current City ordinance is not producing the intended results.~~

~~Setting up an extended farmer's and/or community market would provide a place for people to be able to sell their goods. A subsidized building which provides inexpensive space would be necessary to make this work. Allowing people the opportunity to work and create home-made items would ultimately reduce the demand for affordable housing.~~

~~There are a lot of big (space) areas that are currently underutilized. Mixed use should not consist of just retail uses.~~

~~An upcoming visit by the CRHA to Greenville was mentioned as a potential venue for the HAC because of the chance to view successful mixed use development.~~

~~A summary of critical issues was reviewed at the end of the meeting and the following were highlighted:~~

- ~~-CRHA is to present their master plan to improve both the relationship and integration of housing efforts~~
- ~~-Need for transparency in public education~~
- ~~-Examine eroding existing affordability~~
- ~~-Provide HAC Calendar of events~~
- ~~-Look at potential enabling legislation issues~~
- ~~-Update housing section of Comprehensive Plan~~
- ~~-Track national policies and grant opportunities~~
- ~~-Offer business education classes to lift people out of poverty~~
- ~~-Use community centers as education centers~~

**Possible Future Action-Committees:** Send out information on Sustainable Communities grant announcement; send out information on zoning matrix and prepare and distribute a calendar of City of Charlottesville housing-related meetings. Devote next HAC meeting to work plan / focus group / subcommittee efforts. Look at joint April CDBG Task Force meeting. —Dedicate next HAC meeting to the CRHA and look at revisiting above efforts by subdividing HAC into teams/subgroups to discuss and identify tangible work activities.

**Other Business:** None.

Meeting Adjourned at 1:35~~0~~ pm

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering