

## Human Right Commission Minutes Regular Meeting

**DATE:** December 19, 2019

Shantell Bingham called the meeting to order at 7:10 PM.

**ROLL CALL:** Shantell Bingham, Katherine Laughon, Ann Smith, Catherine Spear, Lyndele Von Schill, Pheobe Brown, Elliot Brown, Ernest Chambers, Jeanette Abi-Nader, Robert Woodside, Andy Orban, Sue Lewis, Idyll Aktan, Matthew Tenant, Olivia Gabbay

*\*Please note, the summarized notes presented below are recorded in real time and are not concise quotes from the correlated speaker. Please review the posted audio recording for specific language. The HRC intends to get word-for-word transcript meeting notes for accessibility purposes in the future.*

### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

1. Charlene
  - a. MLK Events
    - i. Calendar now posted online
    - ii. Keynote
      1. Roxanne Gay
      2. Register for free tickets ASAP
      3. Event is at The Paramount
      4. Tickets can be held at box office
    - iii. Several other events noted
  - b. Equity Center Community Fellows in Residence
    - i. May still be taking applications
    - ii. [equitycenter@virginia.edu](mailto:equitycenter@virginia.edu)
  - c. Bus tour
    - i. January 17, 9am
    - ii. Primarily for Martha Jefferson staff
    - iii. 10 additional seats available
    - iv. Email Charlene to reserve a seat
    - v. Tour is two hours

**MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC** (Include names of people who spoke and their concern or comment)

None.

### **COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**

None.

### **REVIEW OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES**

1. Motion to accept (Commissioner name): Catherine Spear
2. Seconded by (Commissioner name):
3. Discussion
  - a. Several Commissioners suggested the minutes should be more concise and less word-for-word
  - b. Minutes will reflect this wish going forward

4. Vote Record
  - a. # In favor: 10
  - b. # Opposed: 0
  - c. # Abstained: 4

## **BUSSINESS MATTERS**

1. Yolunda Harrell, CEO, New Hill Development Corporation
  - a. Ms. Harrell provided a summary of the work that is being done by the New Hill Dev. Corp.
2. Nomination Committee Update
  - a. Chair
    - i. Shantell
  - b. Vice Chair
    - i. Sue
    - ii. Rob
    - iii. Andy
    - iv. Catherine
  - c. Candidates for Vice Chair will send emails to Pheobe with their reasons for running
3. Chair Update
  - a. Retreat
    - i. Scheduled for February 1, 2020
    - ii. 10:00am to 3:00pm
    - iii. Rockbrook Manor: 7 Rockbrook Road
    - iv. CNE will facilitate
    - v. Commissioners are invited to review the topic document in the HRC Google Drive file
    - vi. Commissioners should email Shantell, Charlene, or Todd with thoughts of topics to discuss at the retreat
  - b. VAHR Planning Meeting
    - i. Scheduled for February 17, 2020
    - ii. Lunch meeting (OHR will cover costs of lunch)
    - iii. Meeting will be held in Richmond
    - iv. Planning for annual conference in Prince William
  - c. Letter to Susi Wilbur
    - i. Shantell shared the draft with Commissioners by email
    - ii. No additional suggestions were offered during the meeting
  - d. Meeting Time
    - i. Motion being considered: Motion to change the meeting time to 6:00 pm.
    - ii. Motion to accept (Commissioner name): Pheobe
    - iii. Seconded by (Commissioner name): Jeanette
    - iv. Discussion:
      1. 6:30 suggested
      2. Some concerned about dinner
      3. OHR could provide dinner for HRC members (not for public)
    - v. Vote Record:
      1. # In favor: 7
      2. # Opposed: 5
      3. # Abstained: 1
4. Neighborhood camera update

- a. A group of neighborhood residents suggested the idea based on concerns of drug dealing and other activities
  - b. The camera issue will also be discussed at the next CRHA Safety Committee meeting
    - i. Wednesday, January 8, 2020
    - ii. 1:00pm at Westhaven
5. OHR Staff Report – Todd Niemeier
  6. OHR Staff Report – Charlene Green
    - a. Made budget request for administrative assistant but the request was denied
    - b. Potential for Madison House volunteers to help answer phones and do pre-intake work
    - c. Department of Equity and Inclusion
      - i. Charlene has met with the City Manager to find out proposed relationship with OHR
      - ii. No clear plan to-date
      - iii. Commissioners are encouraged to ask questions about the Department of Equity and Inclusion of the City Manager and City Council

#### **WORK SESSION**

1. Policy Ad Hoc Committee Report
  - a.
2. Community Engagement Ad Hoc Committee Report
  - a. Proposed meetings in January to go over scripts with potential spokespeople
  - b. Pheobe will send an email to all interested people

#### **OTHER BUSINESS**

1. Suggestion for interactions between Commissioners to be more amicable and less dismissive when subjects are raised that are less familiar to some Commissioners
  - a. The ground rules that were developed at the first retreat could be revisited at the retreat
  - b. Ground rules to be reviewed at the start of each meeting

#### **MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC** (Include names of people who spoke and their concern or comment)

None.

#### **COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**

None.

**Meeting Adjourned:** 9:00 PM.

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

1. Candidates for Vice Chair will send emails to Pheobe with their reasons for running
2. Commissioners are invited to review the topic document in the HRC Google Drive file
3. Commissioners should email Shantell, Charlene, or Todd with thoughts of topics to discuss at the retreat
4. Commissioners are encouraged to ask questions about the Department of Equity and Inclusion of the City Manager and City Council
5. Ground rules to be reviewed at the start of each meeting



**Human Rights Commission AGENDA  
December 19, 2019  
City Space 100 5<sup>th</sup> Street N.E.  
7:00pm**

**CALL TO ORDER**

**ROLL CALL**

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC** Public comment permitted for those who sign up before the meeting (limit 3 minutes per speaker) and at the end of the meeting on any item

**COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**

**MINUTES\***

**BUSINESS MATTERS**

1. Yolunda Harrell, CEO, New Hill Development Corporation
2. Nomination Committee update
3. Chair update (including retreat, Feb.17 VAHR meeting, etc.)
4. OHR staff report, Todd Niemeier and Charlene Green

**WORK SESSION**

1. Ad Hoc Committee updates
  - a. Community Engagement

**OTHER BUSINESS**

1. Human Rights Commissioners comment on meetings and other events attended since the last monthly meeting

**MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**

**COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC**

\*ACTION NEEDED

---

**Office of Human Rights**  
**Todd Niemeier Monthly Staff Report**  
**December 19, 2019**

**Service Provision Data:**

- The chart below is based on service data entered as of 12/19/19
  - Data entry for August stops on 8/12/19
  - Values may change in future reports following reviews for accuracy and/or categorization updates
- Key to abbreviations and terms
  - Total Contacts = Includes externally generated contacts and staff contacts going out
  - Total External Contacts = Includes only contacts coming into the office
  - I = New Inquiries
    - Service provision involving any of the protected activities
    - Complaints of discrimination that fall outside the OHR's jurisdiction
  - C = New Complaints
    - Complaints of discrimination that fall within the OHR's jurisdiction for which the Complainant chose to take action
  - P.A. = Protected Activity
  - P.C. = Protected Class
  - Counseling = Contacts involving referrals to services or direct non-investigative assistance
  - Referral = Contact resulting in a referral to another agency for assistance
    - CSRAP = Charlottesville Supplemental Rental Assistance Program
    - LAJC = Legal Aid Justice Center
    - CVLAS = Central Virginia Legal Aid Society
    - PHA = Piedmont Housing Alliance
    - EEOC = Equal Employment Opportunity Commission
    - DPOR = Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation (VA Fair Housing Office)

<i>Open office days in the month</i>	22	20	21	22	23	20	22	22	20	23	19	18	252
<b>Measures</b>	<b>Jan</b>	<b>Feb</b>	<b>Mar</b>	<b>Apr</b>	<b>May</b>	<b>Jun</b>	<b>Jul</b>	<b>Aug</b>	<b>Sep</b>	<b>Oct</b>	<b>Nov</b>	<b>Dec</b>	<b>TOTALS</b>
<i>Total Contacts</i>	152	145	189	195	206	201	207	91	0	0	0	0	1386
<i>Total External Contacts</i>	132	110	121	153	171	166	178	69	0	0	0	0	1100
<i>Average External Contacts/Day</i>	6	6	6	7	7	8	8	3	0	0	0	0	51
<i>Referrals from Sin Barreras</i>	1	3	0	0	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	7
<i>Contacts in Spanish</i>	3	15	10	0	0	1	6	0	0	0	0	0	35
<i>Total Staff Follow-ups</i>	20	35	68	42	35	35	29	22	0	0	0	0	286
<i>Total Client Follow-ups</i>	52	27	60	68	85	68	86	41	0	0	0	0	487
<i>Total Third Party Contacts</i>	8	14	13	38	29	30	37	12	0	0	0	0	181
<i>Total General Contacts</i>	48	60	37	39	50	47	35	8	0	0	0	0	324
<i>Total New Inquiries</i>	24	8	10	7	7	20	20	8	0	0	0	0	104
<i>Total New Complaints</i>	0	1	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
<i>Total Allegations (Both I&amp;C)</i>	4	3	5	2	4	9	1	0	0	0	0	0	28

<i>Open office days in the month</i>	22	20	21	22	23	20	22	22	20	23	19	18	252
<b>Measures</b>	<b>Jan</b>	<b>Feb</b>	<b>Mar</b>	<b>Apr</b>	<b>May</b>	<b>Jun</b>	<b>Jul</b>	<b>Aug</b>	<b>Sep</b>	<b>Oct</b>	<b>Nov</b>	<b>Dec</b>	<b>TOTALS</b>
<i>Total I&amp;C: Locality - Cville</i>	22	5	8	7	3	16	10	7	0	0	0	0	78
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Employment</i>	7	1	3	0	2	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	18
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Housing</i>	13	7	4	4	3	13	11	0	0	0	0	0	55
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Public Accommodation</i>	1	1	3	1	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	10
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Credit</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Private Education</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.A. - Other (Unprotected)</i>	3	0	1	3	0	3	7	0	0	0	0	0	17
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Age</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Disability</i>	2	0	1	0	0	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	6
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Marital Status</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - National Origin</i>	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Preg./Childbirth</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Race/Skin Color</i>	3	2	4	1	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	12
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Religion</i>	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Sex</i>	1	1	0	0	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	5
<i>Total I&amp;C: P.C. - Not specified</i>	19	6	3	5	2	13	17	0	0	0	0	0	65
<i>Total Counseling Contacts</i>	61	28	45	31	43	61	53	24	0	0	0	0	346
<i>Total Employment Counseling</i>	10	5	10	3	10	11	4	4	0	0	0	0	57
<i>Total Housing Counseling</i>	42	19	28	22	25	44	44	16	0	0	0	0	240
<i>Total Pub. Accommodation Counseling</i>	1	2	5	3	7	4	1	1	0	0	0	0	24
<i>Total Credit Counseling</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total Private Education Counseling</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Total Other (Unprotected) Counseling</i>	8	2	2	3	1	2	4	1	0	0	0	0	23
<i>Total Contacts resulting in Referrals</i>	16	9	5	3	8	7	15	3	0	0	0	0	66
<i>Referrals to CSRAP</i>	9	1	4	2	1	1	7	1	0	0	0	0	26
<i>Referrals to LAJC</i>	1	2	0	0	3	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	9
<i>Referrals to CVLAS</i>	1	3	0	0	3	3	1	0	0	0	0	0	11
<i>Referrals to PHA</i>	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
<i>Referrals to EEOC</i>	2	1	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	5
<i>Referrals to DPOR</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Referrals to Other</i>	5	5	1	1	3	0	8	1	0	0	0	0	24

### Active Investigations:

- One investigation ongoing
  - Public Accommodation Discrimination on the basis of race
  - One potential pending witness interview

### Outreach:

- Service Provision
  - None since last HRC meeting
  - Currently at or near capacity in terms of daily external contacts and ability to follow-up
- Education & Awareness
  - None since last HRC meeting
- Facilitation & Leadership
  - Public Housing Association of Residents Community-Based Research Review Board (CRRB)
    - Next meeting: Monday, 1/13/2020, 9am, at LAJC
      - MOU is currently being reviewed by the PHAR Administrative Committee for approval to be shared with the UVA IRBs and Equity Center
      - Still determining the legal and financial structure of the CRRB
      - Draft position descriptions and applications for Board Members and CRRB Coordinator under review
      - Current outreach to community members interested in serving as paid Review Board members is on hold until legal structure is finalized
  - Housing Hub/Housing Navigation
    - Next meeting: TBD, likely February 2020
      - Continued discussion focused on efforts to improve affordable housing navigation
      - Affordable housing database still expanding
        - Partnering with a law student through LAJC
        - Partnering with UVA School of Data Science on a potential project to create a GIS map of all properties in the City where portable vouchers are attached
          - Two potential benefits of this project
            - Better Housing navigation
              - We will be able to see which landlords currently accept vouchers
                - We can couple this with existing data to create a more robust navigation database
              - We will be able to see areas in the city where known rental properties exist that do not accept vouchers
                - We can use targeted outreach to landlords to learn their concerns about vouchers and explore potential incentive programs to encourage them to accept vouchers
            - Potential for data to support advocacy around “source of payment” discrimination
              - If the geographic patterns of voucher acceptance and rejection match the geographic patterns of historical segregation in the city, then this data could be used to show that “source of payment” discrimination perpetuates historical segregation.