

**From:** Scala, Mary Joy  
**Sent:** Friday, October 24, 2014 10:53 AM  
**To:** Benjamin Clore (benclore@me.com)  
**Subject:** BAR Action - 511 W Main Street - Oct 21, 2014

October 24, 2014

Benjamin Clore  
1411 Cherry Avenue  
Charlottesville, VA 22903

RE: **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 14-10-09  
511 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 320174000  
Benjamin Clore, Owner/Benjamin Clore, Applicant  
Paint Sign over Unpainted Masonry

Dear Applicant,

The above referenced project was discussed before a meeting of the City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR) on October 21, 2014. The following action was taken:

**The BAR approved (7-0) the painted wall sign, with preference for the solid black sign with white letters, subject to the final placement of the sign to be submitted to staff for approval. [The top of the black area should align with the bottom of the older, blue sign.]**

In accordance with Charlottesville City Code 34-285(b), this decision may be appealed to the City Council in writing within ten working days of the date of the decision. Written appeals, including the grounds for an appeal, the procedure(s) or standard(s) alleged to have been violated or misapplied by the BAR, and/or any additional information, factors or opinions the applicant deems relevant to the application, should be directed to Paige Barfield, Clerk of the City Council, PO Box 911, Charlottesville, VA 22902.

This certificate of appropriateness shall expire in 18 months (April 21, 2016), unless within that time period you have either: been issued a building permit for construction of the improvements if one is required, or if no building permit is required, commenced the project. The expiration date may differ if the COA is associated with a valid site plan. You may request an extension of the certificate of appropriateness *before this approval expires* for one additional year for reasonable cause.

Upon completion of the project, please contact me for an inspection of the improvements included in this application. If you have any questions, please contact me at 434-970-3130 or [scala@charlottesville.org](mailto:scala@charlottesville.org).

Sincerely yours,

Mary Joy Scala, AICP  
Preservation and Design Planner

**Mary Joy Scala, AICP**  
Preservation and Design Planner  
City of Charlottesville  
Department of Neighborhood Development Services  
City Hall – 610 East Market Street  
P.O. Box 911  
Charlottesville, VA 22902  
Ph 434.970.3130 FAX 434.970.3359  
[scala@charlottesville.org](mailto:scala@charlottesville.org)

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE  
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
October 21, 2014**



**Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 14-10-09

511 [formerly 509] West Main Street

Tax Parcel 320174000

Benjamin Clore, Owner/Benjamin Clore, Applicant

Paint Sign over Unpainted Masonry

---

**Background**

This is a contributing structure in the Downtown ADC District. The most recent use before rehabilitation was C&R Auto Repair. The National Register nomination describes this building as: Brick (five course American bond) ; one storey; flat or very low pitched gable roof with parapet gable on façade; three bays. Automotive building. Early 1900's (after 1910).

The former noodle restaurant will become a pizza restaurant.

June 21, 2011 - Approved (5-0-1 with Wolf recused) an application for new additions and new doors, with the exception of removal of the existing Zelcova in sidewalk, and requirement that additional details be submitted when available to staff for staff approval for lighting, signage, and pavement. The BAR suggested that a comprehensive site plan for the entire development come to the BAR as soon as possible.

December 20, 2011 - The BAR approved (6-0-1 with Wolf recusing) the courtyard, door changes, and mural as submitted with the condition that any new lighting added to the space, any shade structures and site furniture shall be submitted to the BAR for approval once those details become available.

May 15, 2012 - (509 W Main St) The BAR approved (8-0) the application as submitted for the courtyard paving and plantings. The BAR would like to see details when available regarding the trash and mechanical locations and lighting plans.

June 17, 2014 - The BAR approved on consent agenda (9-0) the rear addition as submitted.

**Application**

The applicant is requesting approval to paint a nine foot by two foot vertical wall sign on the unpainted brick. The building was previously painted a solid cream color when it was C&R Auto; the paint was sandblasted off in 2011 when it was rehabilitated for restaurant use. Remnants of a blue C&R Auto sign above the doors still remain (attached).

**Criteria, Standards and Guidelines**

**Review Criteria Generally**

*Sec. 34-284(b) of the City Code states that,*

*In considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:*

- (1) *That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the Design Guidelines established by the board pursuant to Sec.34-288(6); and*
- (2) *The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the protected property that is the subject of the application.*

**Pertinent Standards for Review of Construction and Alterations include:**

- (1) *Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable design control district;*
- (2) *The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs and signs;*
- (3) *The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;*
- (4) *The effect of the proposed change on the historic district neighborhood;*
- (5) *The impact of the proposed change on other protected features on the property, such as gardens, landscaping, fences, walls and walks;*
- (6) *Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;*
- (8) *Any applicable provisions of the City's Design Guidelines.*

**Pertinent Design Review Guidelines for Rehabilitations**

**H. Masonry**

*Masonry includes brick, stone, terra cotta, concrete, stucco, and mortar. Masonry is used on cornices, pediments, lintels, sills, and decorative features, as well as for wall surfaces. Color, texture, mortar joint type, and patterns of the masonry help define the overall character of a building. Brick is used for the construction of building walls, retaining walls, fencing, and chimneys.*

- 1) *Retain masonry features, such as walls, brackets, railings, cornices, window surrounds, pediments, steps, and columns that are important in defining the overall character of the building.*
- 2) *When repairing or replacing a masonry feature, respect the size, texture, color, and pattern of masonry units, as well as mortar joint size and tooling.*
- 3) *When repointing masonry, duplicate mortar strength, composition, color, and texture.*
  - a. *Do not repoint with mortar that is stronger than the original mortar and the brick itself.*
  - b. *Do not repoint with a synthetic caulking compound.*
- 4) *Repoint to match original joints and retain the original joint width.*
- 5) *Do not paint unpainted masonry.*

**K. Paint**

*A properly painted building accentuates its character-defining details. Painting is one of the least expensive ways to maintain historic fabric and make a building an attractive addition to a historic district. Many times, however, buildings are painted inappropriate colors or colors are placed incorrectly. Some paint schemes use too many colors, but more typical is a monochromatic approach in which one color is used for the entire building. On particularly significant historic buildings, there is the possibility of conducting paint research to determine the original color and then recreating that appearance.*

- 1) *Do not remove paint on wood trim or architectural details.*
- 2) *Do not paint unpainted masonry.*
- 3) *Choose colors that blend with and complement the overall color schemes on the street. Do not use bright and obtrusive colors.*

- 4) *The number of colors should be limited. Doors and shutters can be painted a different color than the walls and trim.*
- 5) *Use appropriate paint placement to enhance the inherent design of the building.*

### **Discussion and Recommendations**

Painting on unpainted masonry is generally not permitted, but a mitigating factor is that this building was painted at one time, and then the paint was removed.

A painted sign is attractive, and there is clearly historic precedent on this building. The only downside to approving a painted sign in this instance would be that painted signs are more difficult to remove than signs that are attached to the building. If this restaurant leaves, then the options would be either to paint over the painted sign, or to physically somehow remove the sign, without further damaging the brick.

### **Suggested Motion**

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed sign painted on brick satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted (or with the following modifications...).

Parcel ID  
20174000

Card    Address  
01 of 02    505 W MAIN STREET

Index Order    ADDRESS  
Index Value    W MAIN STREET



Zoom 100%

Picture  
Date 05/17/2002

Front  
Year: 2003

Seq: 1





## Board of Architectural Review (BAR) Certificate of Appropriateness

Please Return To: City of Charlottesville  
Department of Neighborhood Development Services  
P.O. Box 911, City Hall  
Charlottesville, Virginia 22902  
Telephone (434) 970-3130 Fax (434) 970-3359

RECEIVED

OCT 06 2014

NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

Please submit ten (10) copies of application form and all attachments.

For a new construction project, please include \$375 application fee. For all other projects requiring BAR approval, please include \$125 application fee. For projects that require only administrative approval, please include \$100 administrative fee. Make checks payable to the City of Charlottesville.

The BAR meets the third Tuesday of the month.

Deadline for submittals is Tuesday 3 weeks prior to next BAR meeting by 4 p.m.

Owner Name Benjamin Clore Applicant Name Benjamin Clore  
Project Name/Description Sign painting for Oakhart Socail Parcel Number \_\_\_\_\_  
Property Address 511 W Main St. Charlottesville VA 22903

### **Applicant Information**

Address: 1411 Cherry Ave Charlottesville VA 22903

Email: ben@oakhartsocial.com

Phone: (W) 4344668854 (H) \_\_\_\_\_

FAX: \_\_\_\_\_

### **Property Owner Information (if not applicant)**

Address: Allan Cadgene, Main Street West, LLC  
2088 Union St. Suite 1 San Francisco, CA 94123

Email: allan@alimar1.com

Phone: (W) 415 474 4444 (H) 415 425 2501

FAX: 415 474 7474

### **Signature of Applicant**

I hereby attest that the information I have provided is, to the best of my knowledge, correct. (Signature also denotes commitment to pay invoice for required mail notices.)

[Signature] 10/6/14  
Signature Date

Benjamin Clore

Print Name

10/5/14  
Date

### **Property Owner Permission (if not applicant)**

I have read this application and hereby give my consent to its submission.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

Print Name \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

**Description of Proposed Work (attach separate narrative if necessary):** Painting a vertical sign on the front of our building which would read "OAKHART". The sign would be located directly to the right of our front door and measure approximately 9'X2'.  
The lettering would be block capitals in white over a solid black background. Please see attached photos.

### **List All Attachments (see reverse side for submittal requirements):**

Photographs of the exterior of 511 W Main and the adjacent buildings. Photograph of the proposed sign location.

### **For Office Use Only**

Received by: \_\_\_\_\_

Fee paid: \_\_\_\_\_ Cash/Ck. # \_\_\_\_\_

Date Received: \_\_\_\_\_

Approved/Disapproved by: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Conditions of approval: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_







