

Mess, Camie

From: Mess, Camie
Sent: Thursday, April 26, 2018 2:56 PM
To: Slaats, Matt
Cc: Werner, Jeffrey B
Subject: BAR Actions - March 20, 2018 - 321 East Main Street

April 25, 2018

Certificate of Appropriateness

BAR 18-03-03
321 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 330226000
321-323 East Main Street LLC, Owner/ Alan Goffinsk, Applicant
Proposed public mural

Dear Applicant,

The above referenced project was discussed before a meeting of the City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR) on March 20, 2018. The following action was taken:

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and Public Design and Improvements, I move to find that the proposed mural satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications the mural needs to be sized per Mohr's description and discussion during the BAR meeting. The mural should follow the line of the large window casing height across and come off the corner probably in line with that first window (based on the two sketches provided by Jeff Werner). Also, the final design and imagery needs to come back to the BAR for final approval, and that the artist recognizes that the mural's content will be visible from the street and that it should be to that scale. As presented the color and composition is acceptable. This mural is acceptable because it is on a non-contributing structure in the ADC District, is not located on a primary façade, and it will not be seen from the pedestrian mall. Mohr seconded. Approved (8-0).

This certificate of appropriateness shall expire in 18 months (September 20, 2019), unless within that time period you have either: been issued a building permit for construction of the improvements if one is required, or if no building permit is required, commenced the project. You may request an extension of the certificate of appropriateness before this approval expires for one additional year for reasonable cause.

If you have any questions, please contact Jeff Werner at 434-970-3130 or wernerjb@charlottesville.org.

Sincerely yours,

Camie Mess

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
March 20, 2018**



Certificate of Appropriateness

BAR 18-03-03

321 East Main Street

Tax Parcel 330226000

321-323 East Main Street LLC, Owner/ Alan Goffinsk, Applicant

Proposed public mural

Background

321 Main Street, originally the Miller and Rhodes Department Store, was built in 1956 by Carneal and Johnson of Richmond and Stainback and Scribner of Charlottesville. It is a non-contributing structure in the Downtown ADC district.

Building was remodeled in 1998 for SNL Securities. Work included the 4th Street canopy, the addition of eight square windows and one round window, replacement of the spandrel glass with clear and sandblasted glass, and new signage.

July 20, 2004- the BAR approved (4-2) the partial demolition of selected features: The pediment may be removed, but all cast stone/ precast concrete detailing from that point down must be retained, including the pilasters, columns and storefront surrounds. The cornice may be removed. The circular openings must remain, but the classical detailing and the divided lights in the circular windows may be removed. The 4th Street canopy may be removed. The BAR approved unanimously (6-0) deferral of the Certificate of Appropriateness application for changes to the building.

August 17, 2004- in addition to the items approved for removal at the previous meeting, the BAR approved (5-1) the removal of the architrave, the round window over the 4th Street entrance, the larger window near that entrance, the storefronts and entrance doors on the mall, and removal of all the classical detail on the round windows, including those on the west elevation.

The BAR approved unanimously (6-0) the application in terms of material, texture, color, height, and scale of modifications, particularly the choices of materials that are architecturally compatible with the district and with salient architectural features remaining of the original building design. The BAR asked that the applicant bring back to them a larger sample of the finish on the aluminum storefront at their next meeting.

December 21, 2004- the BAR accepted a larger aluminum sample.

January 18, 2005- the BAR approved a brick band and spandrel glass as presented, with a redesign of 4th Street to return to BAR for approval. The BAR did not approve (?) the proposed elimination of the Main Street canopy.

January 26, 2005- the BAR informally endorsed a proposed design for 4th Street.

February 15, 2005- The BAR approved (7-0) the proposal as submitted, specifically the revised entryway design including a new canopy on 4th Street. The BAR also clarified its January 18, 2005 motion to confirm that the BAR intended to approve the elimination of the canopy on Main Street.

Application

Proposed mural by artist Shepard Fairey et al to be painted on the north-facing brick wall. Dimensions to be determined. The intent of the mural, in the aftermath of local events in the summer 2017, is to *move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction forward.*

Discussion

Review Criteria Generally

Sec. 34-284(b) of the City Code states that,

In considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:

- (1) That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the Design Guidelines established by the board pursuant to Sec.34-288(6); and*
- (2) The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the protected property that is the subject of the application.*

Pertinent Standards for Review of Construction and Alterations include:

- (1) Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable design control district;*
- (2) The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs and signs;*
- (3) The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;*
- (4) The effect of the proposed change on the historic district neighborhood;*
- (6) Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;*
- (7) When reviewing any proposed sign as part of an application under consideration, the standards set forth within Article IX, Sections 34-1020, et seq. shall be applied; and*
- (8) Any applicable provisions of the City's Design Guidelines.*

Pertinent Design Review Guidelines for Rehabilitation:

K. PAINT

A properly painted building accentuates its character-defining details. Painting is one of the least expensive ways to maintain historic fabric and make a building an attractive addition to a historic district. Many times, however, buildings are painted inappropriate colors or colors are placed incorrectly. Some paint schemes use too many colors, but more typical is a monochromatic approach in which one color is used for the entire building. On particularly significant historic buildings, there is the possibility of conducting paint research to determine the original color and then recreating that appearance.

- 1. Do not paint unpainted masonry.*

Pertinent Design Review Guidelines for Public Design and Improvements:

- 1. Maintain existing features related to public art, statues and fountains.*
- 2. Public art is preferred that offers a place-making role in celebrating and communicating the history and culture of the districts.*
- 3. Develop an appropriate relationship between materials, the scale of artwork and the surrounding environment.*
- 4. Choose artwork that is appropriate for the current general character of the site.*

5. *Consider the appropriateness of the sculpture base.*
6. *Public art, statues, and fountains shall be maintained as accessible to the public.*
7. *A mural's appearance, materials, colors, size, and scale should be compatible with the building and historic district of which the building is a part.*
8. *The use of neon, luminescent, or reflective paint or materials is discouraged.*
9. *A mural should not obscure or distort the historic features of a building, and should not cover an entire wall.*
10. *Murals painted on primary facades are rarely permitted and strongly discouraged.*
11. *In general, previously unpainted masonry should be left unpainted.*
12. *Painting directly onto the walls of a non-contributing building, or adding a mural to a previously-painted, non-primary elevation of a contributing building will be considered on a case-by-case basis.*
13. *In general, murals should be created on removable material, no directly on a building wall; installed on framing that allows water to weep between the mural and the wall; and attachments should not irrevocably damage the building.*
14. *Mural art that constitutes a sign shall conform to the sign regulations.*

Discussions and Recommendations

The BAR should discuss how the mural will be put on the building, as well as if a mural is appropriate in this location.

Additionally, taking into consideration the concern that approval of the COA would represent a precedent, staff recommends that the BAR clarify and state the unique circumstances related to this proposal. Among them:

- The building is a non-contributing structure in the ADC
- The proposed location is on the building's non-primary elevation and will not be visible from the bricked pedestrian mall.
- The mural will not interfere with or *cover* any architectural elements of the wall.
- The mural is in response to a significant event in the city's history and is intended to offer to the community a unique opportunity, through art, to heal and move forward from that event.
- The mural represents the work of a prominent, nationally-recognized artist working in collaboration with local artists.

Suggested Motion

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and Public Design and Improvements, I move to find that the proposed mural satisfies/does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible/not compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves/denies the application as submitted (or with the following modifications...).



SHEPARD FAIREY CHARLOTTESVILLE MURAL. 4th STREET

321 E MAIN ST- Parcel ID 330226000- owner: 321-323 E Main Street LLC

This proposal outlines the appropriateness of a mural by renown artist Shepard Fairey on the north-facing wall of 321 East Main Street. The building is located at the northwest corner of East Main Street and 4th Street. The proposed mural will be a permanent beautification to a large indistinct brick surface without prominent structural elements and minimal interruptions to compete with visually.

Shepard Fairey is perhaps the most well-known American muralists and has completed notable murals in cities across the globe. His contribution will be a free and generous gift to Charlottesville. A notable work of art such as this will contribute significantly to the cultural and artistic landscape of the city. Executed properly with input from diverse local artists, collaboration with the Heather Heyer Foundation, support from the owner of the building, and support from the 4th street stakeholders, this project will move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction forward.

This mural proposal is in collaboration with Heather Heyer's mother and president/co-founder of the Heather Heyer Foundation, Susan Bro. While the proposed mural content will engage the tragic events of August 2017, this will not be an explicit memorial to Heather. More so, this will be a dedication to the equity, peace, kindness, and community engagement that Heather and countless others in this city stand for. Susan is insistent that this mural look forward rather than backward. We are all enthusiastic about seeing a piece of artwork that reflects the best of Charlottesville in a way that is not dismissive of the past. Fairey will collaborate with local artists and the Charlottesville Mural Project to make sure this piece is positive, inclusive and representative of Charlottesville. The Charlottesville Mural Project and The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative are committed to offering support--logistical, creative, and otherwise--for the duration of this project, ensuring positive outcomes.

View of 321 East Main Street from the north, looking south down 4th Street.



MURAL RENDERING



Commemorative Plaque

To provide context and info, recognize the contribution of Fairey, and underscore support for this mural, We will place an aluminum plaque with black text and small color graphics at street level on 4th street. The Plaque will be no larger than 2' x 2'. Plaque is visible below above the small orange traffic cone.



ABOUT SHEPARD FAIREY.

Frank Shepard Fairey (born February 15, 1970) is an American contemporary street artist, graphic designer, activist, illustrator. The Institute of Contemporary Art, Boston has described him as one of the best known and most influential street artists. His work is included in the collections at The Smithsonian, the Los Angeles County Museum of Art, the Museum of Modern Art in New York City, the Museum of Contemporary Art San Diego, the National Portrait Gallery in Washington, D.C., the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts in Richmond, and the Victoria and Albert Museum in London.

Fairey's extensive humanitarian efforts include support for ACLU, Feeding America, Chiapas Relief Fund, RUSH Philanthropic Arts Foundation, Human Rights Action Center, Juvenile Diabetes Research Foundation and Coalition for the Homeless.



LOCAL INCLUSION.

In order to stay responsive and sensitive to the Cville community and in an effort to promote meaningful local perspectives, The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project are involving photographer Eze Amos and social practice artist Destinee Wright in the conceptualization of this mural. Both are artists we have worked with in the past and can vouch for their talent and contribution. Design and execution will be in the hands of Shepard Fairey. Involvement of Eze Amos and Destinee Wright will provide a helpful creative lens through which Shepard can view the Charlottesville community. This will assist in the conceptualization of an informed, responsible, well-received design. By listing Amos and Wright as collaborators, this is also an excellent opportunity for Shepard's gift to Charlottesville to stretch further and lend credibility to worthy work being done by Cville's own.

The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project remain fully involved and engaged so that that Shepard can collaborate meaningfully and swiftly with these Cville artists. We acknowledge the generosity of this gift to Charlottesville and want to make this collaboration with local artists as seamless as possible while facilitating the creation of a powerful, relevant piece.

INTRODUCING EZE AMOS



ABOUT EZE AMOS (PHOTOGRAPHER): Portrait, event, and street photography are among Eze's strongest talents. As a long time resident with a family, home, and career in Cville, Eze is extremely invested in the community. In both a personal capacity and as a staff photojournalist for the local newspaper, Eze was present during all white nationalist action in 2017 and at virtually every subsequent press conference, memorial, and rally. His projects capturing everyday people on the Downtown Mall and documenting families displaced from the vinegar hill neighborhood speak to the quality and thoughtfulness of his work and his suitedness to this project.

"Maybe it's my roots in West Africa, but for me it all comes down to family and community. There's nothing like the privilege of helping people see what I see -- the beauty tucked within each moment of relationship. I pay attention. I look for what's real."

INTRODUCING DESTINEE WRIGHT



ABOUT DESTINEE WRIGHT (SOCIAL PRACTICE ARTIST): Destinee Wright is a University of Virginia alumna with her Bachelor's in Women, Gender and Sexuality. She is a successful small business owner, regional artist and social justice advocate. Destinee Wright began the Solidarity Cards Project after the 2016 election results. The idea for this engagement practice emerged as Wright noticed a trend during a number of community events. Attendees at these gatherings seemed to benefit greatly from the opportunity to discuss things on their minds. Wright wanted to find a way to provide that cathartic release while creatively capturing their feelings and concerns. The Solidarity Cards Project has evolved into an anonymous platform for participants to openly voice their thoughts about not only our current political climate, but all sorts of social justice and global issues.

HOW ARTIST COLLABORATION IS HAPPENING

Destinee Wright: Destinee's *Solidarity Cards Project* has already garnered hundreds of useful responses that will inform the motif of Shepard's work. Sentiments from this project have inspired design concepts and included text. Destinee's Solidarity Card Project will be exhibited during a completion party celebrating the success of the mural.

Eze Amos: Shepard Fairey's work often includes strong portrait elements. Eze has an extensive collection of powerful images of local faces and places that have been used to inform this design.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

A celebration of this mural will be in order! Business owners and employees along 4th street have been enthusiastic about contributing to this project in some significant way. This support includes building tenants such as Ting and WillowTree Apps as well as other businesses. A block party (food, music, etc) will be a perfect opportunity to celebrate some new colors on the wall and allow community stakeholders to show their support and involvement in this project.

March 19, 2018

My name is Rachel Pennington, and I have owned The Pie Chest for a little over 3 years. When we first began to do the build-out in our space on 4th Street, it wasn't long until we began to meet and come to know the brilliant and vibrant close-knit community of our street. Daedelus, Hedge, Willow Tree, ting, Oh Suzannah, The Cigar Shop, The Rug Store, Melody Supreme, Halo Spa, the Thomas Jefferson Commission, Thriving Cities - so many of these individuals who work on our street embraced us immediately and we became a part of the small community of what I believe is the best street on the Downtown Mall.

On August 14, two days after the tragic attack that occurred at the bottom of our beloved street, I felt the need to walk up and down and personally visit every office, shop, business, firm, etc. I compiled a list of names and email addresses and created a list - I felt the energy existed to do something, even if I did not know what we could do in the wake of August 12. The next day, I was contacted by a member of an architect firm who overheard a meeting between the Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and members of the BAR for a possible mural installation. We decided to combine the energy, funds, and diverse thinking of our street with the mural project and join forces to make this happen. Speaking as a representative of 4th Street, we wanted to send a message through this mural about what we value, not necessarily make it a memorial to a tragedy.

After several discussions, meetings, and exploring possible building spaces for the mural, the project seemed uncertain. Serendipitously, Shepard Fairey contacted representatives from the Bridge Project about donating a mural, and suddenly the project was kicked back into motion.

As a business owner on 4th Street and as a person who lived the events of August 12 first-hand, this potential mural has my wholehearted support and I believe it sends the right message of our street, the Downtown Area, and the city of Charlottesville.

Thank you for your consideration!

Sincerely,
Rachel Pennington, M.Div. & M.A., Princeton Theological Seminary
Owner, The Pie Chest



To Whom it May Concern,

On behalf of Virginia Humanities, I write this letter in support of the mural proposed by The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project to be painted on the north-facing wall of 321 E. Main Street. The artist, Shepard Fairey, is among the world's most well-known contemporary artists. In addition to notable murals in cities across the globe, Shepard is the creator of many iconographic images such as the Obama "Hope" print that was a ubiquitous during the 2008 presidential campaign. The wall on 321 E. Main Street is a suitable location for a mural and we believe it will enhance the surrounding architecture and provide an installation of public art that can empower and instill pride in our community. A notable work of art such as this will contribute significantly to the cultural and artistic landscape of the city. We assess that this project is being executed responsibly with input from diverse local artists, in collaboration with the Heather Heyer Foundation, support from the owner of the building, and support from the 4th street stakeholders. It is our belief that this project will move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction. It is our determination that this will be a significant and inspiring addition to our cultural landscape for years to come.

It is our recommendation that this proposed mural should move forward with our full support.

Sincerely,

Matthew Gibson

Executive Director, Virginia Humanities



March 14, 2018

Jeff Werner, AICP, Preservation and Design Planner
City of Charlottesville; Department of Neighborhood Development Services
City Hall - 610 East Market Street
Charlottesville, VA 22902

To the Board of Architectural Review,

As Vice Provost for the Arts at the University of Virginia, I write this letter in support of the mural proposed by The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project to be painted on the north-facing wall of 321 E. Main Street. The muralist, Shepard Fairey is among America's most well-known muralists and has completed notable murals in cities across the globe. This wall is perfectly suited for a mural and we believe it will not detract from the surrounding architecture or aesthetic.

A notable work of art such as this will contribute significantly to the cultural and artistic landscape of the city. We assess that this project is being executed responsibly with input from diverse local artists, in collaboration with the Heather Heyer Foundation, support from the owner of the building, and support from the 4th street stakeholders.

It is our belief that this project will move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction. It is our determination that this will be a significant and inspiring addition to our cultural landscape for years to come.

It is our recommendation that this proposed mural should move forward with our full support. I thank you in advance for your thoughtful consideration of this worthy and exciting project.

Best,



Jody Kielbasa
Vice Provost for the Arts
Director, Virginia Film Festival
University of Virginia



#5 Best Places to Work
glassdoor

#7 Great Place to Work
FORTUNE

March 16, 2018

The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative
209 Monticello Rd,
Charlottesville VA 22902

The Board of Architectural Review

We, WillowTree, Inc, write this letter in support of the mural proposed by The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project to be painted on the north-facing wall of 321 E. Main Street. The muralist, Shepard Fairey is among America's most well-known muralists and has completed notable murals in cities across the globe.

This indistinct wall is a suitable location for a mural and we believe it will not detract from the surrounding architecture or aesthetic. A notable work of art such as this will contribute significantly to the cultural and artistic landscape of the city. We assess that this project is being executed responsibly with input from diverse local artists, in collaboration with the Heather Heyer Foundation, support from the owner of the building, and support from the 4th street stakeholders.

It is our belief that this project will move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction. It is our determination that this will be a significant and inspiring addition to our cultural landscape for years to come.

It is our recommendation that this proposed mural should move forward with our full support.

Yours faithfully,



Tobias Dengel
CEO

WE TAKE MOBILE PERSONALLY



March 12, 2018

Dear Board Members,

We, Ting Internet, write this letter in support of the mural proposed by The Bridge Progressive Arts Initiative and the Charlottesville Mural Project to be painted on the north-facing wall of 321 E. Main Street.

The muralist, Shepard Fairey is among America's most well-known muralists and has completed notable murals in cities across the globe. This indistinct wall is a suitable location for a mural and we believe it will not detract from the surrounding architecture or aesthetic. A notable work of art such as this will contribute significantly to the cultural and artistic landscape of the city.

We assess that this project is being executed responsibly with input from diverse local artists, in collaboration with the Heather Heyer Foundation, support from the owner of the building, and support from the other 4th street stakeholders that we have met with in regards to this project.

It is our belief that this project will move perception and representation of Charlottesville in a positive direction. It is our determination that this will be a significant and inspiring addition to our cultural landscape for years to come.

It is our recommendation that this proposed mural should move forward with our full support.

Please let us know if we can provide any additional information.

Sincerely,

Drew Hurst
Marketing Manager
Ting Charlottesville
drew@ting.com
434.227.5287