

BAR ACTIONS
CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
May 15, 2018 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present:; Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair (late); Carl Schwarz; Stephan Balut; Justin Sarafin, Mike Ball

BAR Members Absent: Breck Gastinger; Emma Earnst; and Corey Clayborne
Staff Present: Jeff Werner, Camie Mess, and Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:40 pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

They were no matters from the public.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes April 17, 2018 Regular Meeting

Schwarz: In comments on 201 West Water Street, clarify that he was not disagreeing/questioning City Attorney's conclusion, only wanting clarification since the drawings were unclear. Ball: Comment on 167 Chancellor Street re: asymmetry problems, clarify that he believed new design was an improvement from the previous submittal. With these changes Schwarz moved to approve the April 17, 2018 minutes. Sarafin seconded. Approved (5-0).

5:40 C. Deferred Items
2. Certificate of Appropriateness
BAR 17-11-04
413 Ridge Street
Tax Parcel 290136000
Jeffrey Erkelens, Owner/ Jeffrey Erkelens, Applicant
Amendments to the COA

Motion: Balut moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Ridge Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the suggestion you change the trim on the windows from MiraTEC to PVC. Sarafin seconded. Approved (4-1; with Miller opposed).

Mohr joined the meeting during staff's introduction of the project.

- 6:00** **3. Certificate of Appropriateness**
BAR 18-01-03
1602 Gordon Avenue
Tax Parcel 090013000
Montessori Education Trust, Inc., Owner/ Lindsey Munson, Applicant
New addition

Motion: Sarafin moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, and Site Design and Elements I move to find that the proposed addition and various site improvements satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application with the drawings as submitted via e-mail on 5/15/2018 [specifically revisions to the north and east elevations]. Balut seconded. Approved (6-0).

Staff note: With this COA, the BAR review of this project (BAR 18-01-03) is complete. Per NDS, Final Site Plan was approved on May 4, 2018.

- 6:20** **4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-06-04
1211 West Main Street (Dinsmore House Inn)
Tax Parcel 100059000
1817 House LLC, Owner/Ryan Hubbard, Applicant
Landscape Plan Modifications

Motion: Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed landscape plan modifications satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Sarafin seconded. Approved (6-0).

- D. New Items**
- 6:40** **5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-05-03
1211 West Main Street (Dinsmore House Inn)
Tax Parcel 100059000
1817 House LLC, Owner/Virginia Tent Rental, Applicant
Temporary tent

Motion: Sarafin moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that proposed tent satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district,

and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Balut seconded. Approved (5-1; with Miller opposed).

~~7:00~~ ~~6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (deferred by applicant)~~
~~BAR 18-05-06~~
~~801 East High Street~~
~~Tax Parcel 530194000~~
~~Core Knowledge Foundation, Owner/Samantha Hanna, Applicant~~
~~Roof replacement (change of material)~~

Motion: Blaut moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral. Schwarz seconded. Approved (6-0).

7:20 7. Certificate of Appropriateness
BAR 18-05-01
517 Ridge Street
Tax Parcel 290145000
Dogwood Properties LLC, Owners/Applicant
Proposed concrete sidewalk on the front and north side of the property

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Elements and Design, I move to find that the proposed concrete sidewalk satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Ridge Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications as outlined in Schwarz's sketch dated 5/15/2018. Also, the tree should be centered in the green space, and the BAR is recommending a London Plane. Balut seconded. Approved (6-0).

7:40 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-05-06
404 Altamont Street
Tax Parcel 330151000
David, Charlotte Smith, Owner/Applicant
Porch Repairs, Renovation

Motion: Mohr moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the porch repairs and renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following provisos to be submitted to staff via e-mail and circulated to the BAR for administrative review:

- Submit cutsheets for the window and door
- Submit photo documentation of the existing window being replaced
- Request the concrete at sidewalk be city mix
- The BAR is in agreement that the light fixture on the back porch can be replaced

Schwarz seconded. Approved (5-1; with Miller opposed).

8:00 9. Certificate of Appropriateness
BAR 18-05-02
420 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 290011000

Main Street Associates, LLC, Owner/ Greg Jackson, Applicant
Exterior Paint and Patio Improvements

Motion: Mohr moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolitions, Rehabilitation, and for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application (plans submitted 5/15/2018 at the meeting) with the modification that the addition of a street tree at the NW corner, provided it meets sight line criteria and is selected from the approved tree list. The BAR recommends that the neon sign be considered an appropriate sign for the district. Balut seconded. Approved (6-0).

Staff note: 1) Applicant's plan did not indicate parcel boundaries. Staff clarified that BAR approval applies only to improvements on the applicant's parcel. 2) Neon signs are not permitted in the Downtown ADC (Sec. 34-1041(c)).

8:20 10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-05-04
250 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 280089000
Lewis & Clark Square Unit Owners Association, Owner/Applicant
Proposed exterior renovations

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the exterior changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with these properties and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Sarafin seconded. Approved (6-0).

E. New Construction
8:40 11. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-05-05
815 East High Street
Tax Parcel 530197000, 530196000, 530195000, 530194100, 530198000, 530199000,
530200000, 530201000, 530202000
Tarleton Oak, LLC, Owner/ Jennifer Feist, Applicant
Site Elements and Design

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed landscape plan satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this properties and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the proposal for Phase 1 with the following recommendations:

- **Increase number of street trees along Maple Street and 8th Street**
- **Soften the transition between the project and 801 East High Street, a city-designated IPP.**
- **Consider use of trees from the *Tarleton Oak*.**

Balut seconded. Approved (6-0).

It should be noted that Phase II of this project will have to come back to the BAR for a full review.

- 9:10** **13. Preliminary Discussion**
BAR 17-11-03
200 2nd Street SW
Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000, 280072000, 280073000, 280074000, 280075000
Market Plaza LLC, Owner/ Keith O. Woodard, Applicant
New Construction

This was a preliminary discussion, so no action was taken. To listen to the complete discussion about this project go to http://charlottesville.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=2&clip_id=1297.

- F. Other Business**
9:40 **14. PLACE report**

In lieu of the PLACE meeting there was a meeting about Charlottesville Comprehensive Plan that members of PLACE were encouraged to attend.

- 9:50** **G. Adjournment 11:30**