

BAR ACTIONS

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
June 19, 2018 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall**



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair (late); Carl Schwarz; Stephan Balut; Justin Sarafin, Mike Ball, Emma Earnst

BAR Members Absent: Breck Gastinger and Corey Clayborne

Staff Present: Jeff Werner, Camie Mess, Tim Lasley, and Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR’s jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR’s discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

No matters from the public.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

- 1. Minutes** May 15, 2018 Regular Meeting

Taken off the consent agenda because the minutes were not able to be circulated to the BAR until the meeting.

- 2. Certificate of Appropriateness**
BAR 16-11-01
401 Cherry Avenue
Tax Parcel 290150000
Cherry Ave Investments, LLC, Owner/Steven Von Storch, Applicant
Amendments to COA

Approved on the consent agenda (7-0).

- ~~**3. Certificate of Appropriateness (deferred by applicant)**~~
~~BAR 17-06-02~~
~~315 East High Street~~
~~Tax Parcel 330067000~~
~~City of Charlottesville, Owner/ Scott Hendrix, Applicant~~
~~Amendments to COA~~

4. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-02
946 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 310060000
Dairy Holdings, LLC, Owner/ Wendie Charles, Applicant
Amendments to COA

Approved on the consent agenda (7-0).

5. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-06-03
115 Altamont Circle
Tax Parcel 330122000
Tree Removal, Owner/ Alice L. Gore and William B. Hunt III, Applicant
Removal of Red Maple

This was removed from the consent agenda. Miller moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed tree removal satisfies the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions

- The replanting with a large shade tree conforming to the Charlottesville Tree List
- The tree have a caliper of no less than 2 inches
- The tree be planted no less than 4 feet from the curb

Balut seconded. Approved (7-0).

C. **New Items**

- 5:40 6. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-06-08
853 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 31-169, 31-170
Potbelly Sandwich Shop, Owner/ Landmark Properties, Applicant/ GPD Group
New outdoor café, new storefront louver, Seasonal patio cover and heaters

Motion: Mohr moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Cafes and Tents, I move to find that the proposed new outdoor café and new storefront louver satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the condition that the use of the outdoor café space complies with the conditions of the Special Use Permit (SP-13-08-15) and the Final Site Plan [for 853 West Main Street, *The Standard*].

The BAR moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral on the proposed seasonal patio cover [vinyl curtain].

Earnst seconded. Approved (7-0).

- 6:00 7. **Certificate of Appropriateness (Historic Conservation District)**
BAR 18-06-02
714 Locust Avenue
Tax Parcel 510069000
Front Porch, Owner/ Rashard Dacus
Applicant/ James Robertson (Robertson Renovations)
Porch replacement and construct canopy

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including Historic Conservation District Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed front porch and canopy satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Balut seconded. Approved (7-0.)

- 6:20 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-06-05
510 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 53006700
Bank of America ATM, Owner/ 510 Partners, Applicant/ Stanley Hill
Addition of 24 hour ATM, storefront modifications, new signage

Motion: Mohr moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, Public Design, and Signs, I move to find that the proposed storefront modifications and signage satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- All light fixtures are less than or equal to 3000 color rendering index (CRI)
[Note: As this is a 24 hour ATM facility, BAR condition applies also to the interior lighting at the ATM lobby relative to its visibility through the glass storefront.]**

Sarafin seconded. Approved (7-0).

- 6:40 9. Certificate of Appropriateness**
BAR 18-06-09
501 Park Street
Tax Parcel 530012000
Hospice of the Piedmont, Owner/ Jackie Gamache, Applicant
Landscape and site elements

Motion: Balut moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed landscape plan satisfies the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the recommendation that the applicant speak to the landscape architect on the BAR, Breck Gastinger, for recommendations on plantings and design. Sarafin seconded. Approved (7-0).

- 7:00 10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-06-04
105 3rd Street, NE
Tax Parcel 330232000
Stage Left Café Project, Owner/ The Paramount Theater, Applicant/ Mical Tawney
Construction of outside café

Motion: Balut moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Cafes I move to find that the proposed café space satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the understanding if the design of the rail changes that the applicant will submit that change to staff administratively for the BAR archive. Schwarz seconded. Approved (7-0).

The BAR noted that once they are done using the space for the season that they store the railings in the alleyway of the property.

- 7:20 11. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 18-06-01

404 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 280046000
New Dominion Bookshop, Owner/ NDB Land Trust/ George B. McCadlum III and David W. Kudravetz Trustees, Applicant/ Carla Edwards
Window replacement

Motion: Part I Schwarz moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral.

Part II: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation I move to find that the proposed window replacement and rehabilitations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves only the application for replacement of the front window sash. Ball seconded. Approved (7-0).

7:40 12. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-05-06
801 East High Street
Tax Parcel 530194000
Core Knowledge Foundation, Owner/, Applicant
Roof replacement (change of material)

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed roof replacement changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the conditions:

- **That the seams and ridge cap be hand crimped**
- **The pan and seam height be consistent with the existing standing seam metal roof that is on the addition, and the color match the existing standing seam metal roof.**

Earnst seconded. Approved (7-0.)

The BAR noted that this motion passes due to the fact that portions of the existing roof have previously had standing seam metal roofing installed.

8:00 13. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-06-10
1501 Gordon Avenue
Tax Parcel 050078000
Edgar J. Gunter, Owner/Peter Gunter, Applicant
Screen Porch Addition to the back of the house

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road – University Circle – Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- **Submit to staff a cut sheet for the new door and accurate set of photos of the neighboring existing porch from all sides**
- **The porch roof/wall joint will be 8" below the sill of the [existing, 2nd floor] window.**
- **Any deviations from the submittal to be turned in to staff for the BAR archive.**

Balut seconded. Approved (7-0).

The BAR noted that this motion passes because the applicant is replicating a neighboring porch and deck [at 1503 Gordon Ave.] without deviation.

8:20 14. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-06-06
513 Rugby Road
Tax Parcel 050053000
Pi Kappa Alpha, Owner/ West Range Castle Dango, LLC, Applicant/ BRW Architects
Enclosure of porches, replacement of windows, repainting of trim, repointing of brick

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed renovations and porch enclosures satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the following stipulations:

- For replaced windows, keep and repair the window frames and casings [exterior trim] in place.
- The rear [basement level] doors being replaced with windows, the opening shall be retained with panels infilling the space below the windows.
- The front and rear light fixtures will be submitted to staff and circulated to BAR for approval.
- The rear windows [center of elevation at 1st and 2nd floors] at the interior stairs will remain as double-hung windows. [If replaced, the new will match the existing.]
- Recommend at the porch enclosures the investigation of other window configurations—decision being left to applicant's discretion.
- Recommendation to repair existing windows [wherever possible], rather than replacing.
- For windows that must be replaced, they must be replaced in-kind.
- Front door should be repaired, and if not, should be replaced in-kind.

Balut seconded. Approved (6-1, with Miller opposed).

D. New Construction

8:40 15. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-08-01
230 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 280001000
Brands Hatch LLC, Owner/ Fred Wolf, Applicant
New Construction – Final Details

Motion: Mohr moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, New Construction, and Public Design I move to find that the proposed revisions satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the suggestion that landscape design add more trees to the mall end of the courtyard. The resolution of the tree grates needs to come back and be circulated for BAR review. Request that applicant assure that visibility issues along steps and edges will not later result in/require the installation of safety marking (for ex. yellow tape). Earnst seconded. Approved (6-1, with Schwarz opposed).

9:10 16. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-11-03
200 2nd Street SW
Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000, 280072000, 280073000, 280074000, 280075000
Market Plaza LLC, Owner/ Keith O. Woodard, Applicant
New Construction

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, New Construction and Additions, and Public Design I move to find that the proposed Massing, and Site Design and Elements satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted for massing, and site and landscape design. With the following items to be submitted for review at a future BAR meeting:

- more details for the plaza design, specifically regarding the paving and the trellis/shade structure;

- further investigation of the Water Street and 2nd Street SW elevations for pedestrian scale, specifically on the base.

And a request to investigate introducing elements of the plaza trellis/shade structure into the upper stories of the building [for example, at the balconies].

Mohr Seconded. Approved (4-3, with Miller, Ball, and Earnst opposed).

9:40 17. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-03-01
843 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 310175000
Kim Dabney, Owner/ Clark Gathright, Applicant
Proposal for new three story office building

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, move to find that the proposed massing and proposed glazing (in-concept) of the Office Building satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district. Additionally, the BAR would like the applicant to investigate stepping back portions of the building [from the street] and the BAR strongly recommends the applicant investigate and change the building's materiality.

Mohr seconded. Approved (6-1, with Ball opposed).

10:10 18. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 18-06-07
0 Rugby Road
Tax Parcel 050047100
Zero Rugby Road, Owner/ West Range Castle Dango, LLC, Applicant/ BRW Architects
New Construction

This is a preliminary discussion, so no action is required. If you would like to hear the specifics of the discussion please visit: http://charlottesville.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=2&clip_id=1304

E. Other Business
10:40 19. PLACE report
10:50 F. Adjournment