

BAR ACTIONS
CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
July 17, 2018 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Carl Schwarz, Stephan Balut, Justin Sarafin, Mike Ball, Emma Earnst (arrived 8:40), Breck Gastinger, and Jody Lohendro
BAR Members Absent: Tim Mohr, vice chair
Staff Present: Jeff Werner, Tim Lasley, and Carolyn McCray

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda

Madison Spencer expressed concern with the BAR's motions regarding 843 West Main Street, as well as other projects approved within the City of Charlottesville.

B. Consent Agenda

1. Minutes

May 15, 2018 Regular Meeting

~~June 19, 2018 Regular Meeting (deferred by staff)~~

May minutes approved on Consent Agenda (7-0). Schwarz motion. Gastinger seconded.

June minutes removed from Consent Agenda because they were not circulated prior to meeting.

2. Certificate of Appropriateness

BAR 17-10-08

550 East Water Street; Tax Parcel 530162300

Neal Sansovich, Owner/ Andrew Baldwin, Applicant

Amendments to the COA

(This item was removed from the Consent Agenda.)

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, and for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed amendments to the COA approved on April 19, 2016 satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- The understanding that this COA applies only to the addition of an exterior entry at the west façade to accommodate street level access for a bank office requiring evening ATM access; the extension of bluestone paving to provide access to the ATM entry; the replacement of the approved Black Gum street tree with a European Hornbeam; the elimination of a wood and steel bench at the public courtyard; the addition of two S2 wall sconces on the north façade matching fixtures approved at other entry locations; and the interior lighting of the ATM vestibule/lobby, which will include dimmable, recessed fixtures with a color temperature of 3000k, matching nearby exterior fixtures.**
- The monument sign must come back to the BAR for review.**
- The BAR would like to remind the applicant that all exterior lighting should be reviewed when installed, specifically the location, directions, shielding, and timing of those fixtures.**

Gastinger seconded. Approved (7-0).

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)

BAR 17-07-05

503 Lexington Avenue; Tax Parcel 530218000

Sean Lymon, owner/Alt Energy Inc., Daniel Walsh, applicant

Addition of Solar Panels

Approved on Consent Agenda (7-0).

C. Deferred Items

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)

BAR 17-03-03

612 Grove Avenue

Tax Parcel 510049100

Heather Carlton, Owner/Applicant

Screened porch

Motion: Balut moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions in Conservation Districts, I move to find that the proposed new porch addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Neighborhood Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the note that the applicant submit final details of the privacy screening, railings, and deviations from the submitted proposal to staff and be circulated to the BAR for approval.

Schwarz seconded. Approved (7-0).

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 17-06-02

315 East High Street

Tax Parcel 330067000

City of Charlottesville, Owner/ Scott Hendrix, Applicant

Amendments to COA

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements and Canopies, I move to find that the proposed Amendments to the COA, approved on June 20, 2017, satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following stipulations:

- **Submit a less transparent gate to staff to be circulated to the BAR for approval.**
- **Align the screen wall with the center line between the two existing windows.**
- **The recommendation of planting a tree at the corner from the Charlottesville master tree list.**
- **The new window will match existing in-kind.**

Sarafin seconded. Approved (7-0).

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-06-01

404 East Main Street; Tax Parcel 280046000

New Dominion Bookshop, Owner/ NDB Land Trust/ George B. McCadlum III and David W. Kudravetz Trustees, Applicant/ Carla Edwards

Window replacement (South elevation)

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed window replacements satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted; windows to have 1-1/8" mullions.

Balut seconded. Approved (7-0).

D. New Items

7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-07-01

1819 University Circle; Tax Parcel 05003800

John Todd Rutter Lawrence, Owner/ John S.R. Lawrence, Applicant
Window replacement

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed rehabilitations do not satisfy the BAR's criteria and are not compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR denies the application as submitted.

Lohendro seconded. Denied (7-0).

Note: In its denial, the BAR cited the ADC Guidelines for Windows (from Chapter III. Rehabilitation, section C. Windows); specifically, though not exclusively, item 13: If windows warrant replacement, appropriate material for new windows depends upon the context of the building within a historic district, and the age and design of the building. Sustainable materials such as wood, aluminum-clad wood, solid fiberglass, and metal windows are preferred. Vinyl windows are discouraged.

8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-07-04

0 East Water Street; Tax Parcel 570157800

Alan Taylor, Owner/ Ashley Davies, Applicant

Maintenance and Rehabilitation

Motion: Schwarz moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral.

Lohendro seconded. Approved (7-0).

9 Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-07-02

430 North 1st Street; Tax Parcel 330088100

George and Austine Howard, Owner/ Scott Weiss, Applicant

Addition and Modifications

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed new additions and modifications to the original house satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following modifications:

- Proposed railing detail must be submitted to staff to be circulated to the BAR for approval.
- Photos showing proposed brick next to existing brick to be submitted to staff to be circulated to the BAR for approval.
- Color choices to be submitted to for administrative approval.
- The BAR does not approve the request to paint the existing exterior brick.

Lohendro seconded. Approved (7-0).

D. New Construction

10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)

BAR 18-07-03

815 East High Street; Tax Parcel 530197000, 530196000, 530195000, 530194100, 530198000, 530199000, 530200000, 530201000, 530202000

Tarleton Oak, LLC, Owner/ Jennifer Feist, Applicant

New Construction

(Earnst arrived at meeting.)

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions in Conservation Districts, I move to find that the proposed height and massing of Phase II of this project satisfies the BAR's

criteria and are compatible with this properties and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the height and massing as submitted with the following investigations to be reviewed by the BAR at a further meeting:

- Along the 8th Street elevation, address the heights of the arched openings [between the staircases], which get shorter from south to north. (Page 14 revised.)
- At the NE corner, address the height of the water table band [from where the grade drops at the arched opening on Maple Street, continuing east and around the corner onto the east elevation]. (Pages 15 revised and 18.)
- At the upper floor window arches, the keystones appear random. (Pages 12 revised, 14 revised, and 18.)
- Either revise the accent brick to produce more contrast (for example, use a darker brick) or provide a design narrative to support using the one presented [on July 17]. (Pages 12 revised, 14 revised, and 18.)
- Add large trees (conforming to the city's tree list) within the space between the back of the five houses on Lexington Avenue and the east facade of the parking/residential structure. (Pages 9 revised and 13 revised.)
- Add vegetation along the walls on either side of the pedestrian walk between the back of the five houses on Lexington Avenue and the east facade of the parking/residential structure. (Pages 9 revised, 13 revised and 18.)
- Note on the plan the proposed tree species
- Address the visibility from the outside of the lighting within the parking structure.

Earnst seconded. Approved (8-0).

(Note: References are to the drawings reviewed by the BAR on July 17, 2018.)

E. **Other Business**

11. 815 Tarleton Oak Glass Discussion

12. PLACE report

F. **Adjournment** (approx. 11:00 p.m.)