

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

Regular Meeting

August 21, 2018 – 5:30 p.m.

City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair; Justin Sarafin, Breck Gastinger, Stephan Balut, Carl Schwarz, Emma Earnst, Mike Ball

BAR Members Absent: Jody Lahendro

Staff Present: Jeff Werner, Camie Mess, Tim Lasley, and Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:40 pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

There were no matters from the public.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

| | | |
|-------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| 1. Minutes | June 19, 2018 | Regular Meeting |
| | July 17, 2018 | Regular Meeting |

Motion: Balut moved to approve the June 19, 2018 and July 17, 2018 minutes, with the discussed changes. Earnst seconded. Approved (7-0-1, with Mohr abstained, since he was not in attendance at the meeting).

5:40 C. Deferred Items
2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 18-07-04

0 East Water Street

Tax Parcel 570157800

Alan Taylor, Owner/ Ashley Davies, Applicant

Maintenance and Rehabilitation

Motion: Sarafin moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, and Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed park design and rehabilitations to the Coal Tower satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with

this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following additions:

- **The lower platform [outside of the door at top of tower] to be retained if possible**
- **Consent to replace windows if repair is not feasible**
- **Simplify the design of the park**
- **Explore different grasses to use in the stripe between the sidewalk and Bocce court**
- **Provide a lighting plan for under the tower.**
- **Interpretive signs will come back to the BAR for review**

Changes to the site plan will be turned into staff and put on the consent agenda for approval next month. Balut seconded. Approved (7-1, with Gastinger opposed.)

D. New Items

6:00

3. Preliminary Discussion

BAR 18-08-02

310 4th Street NE

Tax Parcel 330205L00

Great Eastern Management, Owner/ Henningsen Kestner Architects, Applicant

Renovation and addition of square footage and patio area

This is a preliminary discussion; no BAR action is required.

Mike Ball recused himself for the next item.

E. New Construction

6:20

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-01-04

512-514, 600 West Main Street

Tax Parcel 290007000, 290006000, and 290008000

Heirloom West Main Development LLC, Owner/Heirloom West Main Development LLC, Applicant

Amendments to the COA – final details

Signs:

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the concept of the proposed signs satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the signs in-concept with the provision that all illuminated signage shall appear to be lit white at night. Balut seconded. Approved (7-0)

Brick infill at south elevation of 512-514 West Main Street:

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed brick infill at the two, first floor openings satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with these properties and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Balut seconded. Approved (7-0.)

Painting of brick at south and west elevations of 512-514 West Main Street:

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed painting of the unpainted brick walls does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and is not compatible with these properties and other

properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR denies this portion of the application as submitted. Balut seconded. Denied (7-0.)

Color scheme for Blue Moon diner and Mini Mart:

Motion: Schwarz moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral. Balut seconded. Approved (7-0.)

Storefront renovation of historic, single-story commercial additions:

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed storefront renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with these properties and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications:

- **Maintain the wood storefront on Blue Moon diner (514 West Main Street), and replace in-kind**
- **Approve the replacement of the aluminum door of the Blue Moon diner (514 West Main Street), with the door replacement to come back to be put on the consent agenda for the next month's meeting**
- **Approve the replacement of the storefront of the Mini Mart (600 West Main Street); lite pattern and dimensions to match existing**
- **Approve the replacement of plywood panels [in Mini Mart storefront] with glazed panels**

Balut seconded. Approved (6-1, with Sarafin opposed.)

6:40 5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 18-03-01
843 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 310175000
Kim Dabney, Owner/ Clark Gathright, Applicant
Proposal for new three-story office building

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, move to find that the proposed office building satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications and requirements

- **Does not approve the back elevation and would like to see that revised**
- **Submit a landscaping plan; explain why the plaza is designed as such**
- **Approves the concept of recessed lighting in the canopies; need additional information**
- **Approves the use of metal [ACM] panels**
- **Approves the general configuration elevations**
- **Does not approve the ground faced block; investigate another material that relates to West Main Street**

Mohr seconded. Denied (2-5-1, Schwarz and Mohr for; Miller, Gastinger, Balut, Earnst, and Ball opposed; and Sarafin abstained.)

Motion: Schwarz moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral. Mohr seconded. Approved (8-0.)

7:10 6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-11-03
200 2nd Street SW
Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000, 280072000, 280073000, 280074000, 280075000
Market Plaza LLC, Owner/ Keith O. Woodard, Applicant
New Construction

Motion: Earnst moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, New Construction and Additions, and Public Design, I move to find that the proposed design does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR denies the application as submitted, based on the comments cited earlier focusing on mass and height and the use of the plaza as a functional public space. Gastinger seconded. Approved (5-3, with Sarafin, Balut, and Mohr opposed.)

- 7:40 7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-02
946 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 310060000
Dairy Holdings, LLC, Owner/ Wendie Charles, Applicant
Amendments to COA – specifically glass

Motion: Schwarz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed Amendments to the COA approved on January 17, 2018, satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted for this specific instance because of the project's specific design intent. Balut seconded. Approved (5-3, with Gastinger, Earnst, and Miller opposed)

- 8:10 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)**
BAR 18-07-03
815 East High Street
Tax Parcel 530197000, 530196000, 530195000, 530194100, 530198000, 530199000,
530200000, 530201000, 530202000
Tarleton Oak, LLC, Owner/ Jennifer Feist, Applicant
New Construction

Motion: Schwartz moved having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions in Conservation Districts, I move to find that the proposed residential building design for Phase II and updates to the parking structure (from Phase I) satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with these and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the recommendation to widen the stairs at Maple Street. Earnst seconded. Approved (8-0.)

- 8:40 9. Pre-Application Meeting**
17 University Circle
Tax Parcel 060067000
Matthew Schetlick, Owner/Applicant

This is a pre-application meeting, so no BAR action is required.

- F. Other Business**
9:00 10. PLACE report

- 9:10 G. Adjournment**