

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
December 21, 2010
Minutes**

Present:

Fred Wolf, Chair
H. Fairfax Ayres
Michael Osteen
Candace Deloach
Brian Hogg
Eryn Brennan
Preston Coiner

Not Present:

Syd Knight, Vice Chair
William Adams

Also Present:

Mary Joy Scala
Michael Smith (Planning Assistant)

Mr. Wolf convened the meeting.

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda

No one wished to speak

B. Consent Agenda

1. Minutes – November 16, 2010

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

1824 University Circle

BAR 10-12-04

Tax Map 6 Parcel 97

Charles Dickey, BRW Architects, Applicant/ Hillel Foundation at UVA, Owner
Signage and Lighting for Brody Center

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

610 Lyons Court

BAR 10-12-05

Tax Map 52 Parcel 78

Wyck Knox, Applicant and Owner

Tree removal

Item #2 was pulled for discussion

Mr. Osteen motioned to move the consent agenda.

Ms. Brennan seconded the motion. The motion passed, 6-0. Mr. Ayers had not arrived yet.

Discussion of Item #2

Certificate of Appropriateness Application

1824 University Circle

BAR 10-12-04
Tax Map 6 Parcel 97
Charles Dickey, BRW Architects, Applicant/ Hillel Foundation at UVA, Owner
Signage and Lighting for Brody Center

Jay Levin, representing the owner of the project cited that the site lighting is a minimal, late addition. The lighting outlines walkway and parking areas.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC:

Karen Dugal, University Circle, mentioned there were concerns from the neighborhood over the lighting of the parking lot. She says the lighting from the parking lot spills over into adjacent properties.

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD:

No comments.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no comments from the public.

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD:

Mr. Wolf thought the lighting was appropriate and sensitive to the character of the neighborhood.

Mr. Hogg, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including ADC District Design Guidelines for Signs, Awings, Vending and Cafes, moved to find that the proposed new signage and lighting satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

Motion passed(6-0).

C. Projects in Non-Compliance (no status report this month)

None

D. Previously Considered Items

None

E. New Items

1. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-12-02
500 Park Street
Tax Map 53 Parcel 131.1
First Presbyterian Church
Installation of five street lights and removal of four trees

Mr. Ayres arrives.

Ms. Scala presented the staff report.
QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no questions from the public.

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD:

Mr. Wolf asked if the street lights would be enclosed.

James Hubbard, member of the church and property management committee, mentioned the street lights would be very similar to the lights at the Whole Foods on Hillsdale Dr. He cited the lights would be LEDs and mirror the lighting of Court Square.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no comments from the public.

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD:

Mr. Osteen thought the height of the street lights were excessive.

Mr. Hogg doesn't believe the loss of hemlocks will hurt the character of the church.

Ms. Brennan thought a photometric plan could be submitted to the zoning department due to the street lights spillover into the street.

Mr. Wolf thought there was not sufficient evidence to make a decision.

Mr. Ayres suggested separating the two issues. He proposed the Board review the removal of trees and installation of lights individually.

The applicant requested deferral for lights.

Mr. Coiner seconded the deferral. Deferral passed (7-0)

Mr. Wolf, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design & Elements, moved to find that removal of 3 of 4 trees excluding healthy hemlock of SW corner of the church portico satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Ms. Osteen seconded the motion.

Motion passed (6-1) with Mr. Hogg against.

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-12-03

550 East Water Street

Tax Map 53 Parcel 162.3

Water Tower, LLC, Applicant and Owner

New Construction: Four story mixed-use building

Ms. Scala gave the staff report.

Clark Gathright, Daggett Grigg Architects, introduced himself and welcomed any questions the Board had.\

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC:

David Myatt, 112 5th St, expressed concerns over mass and placement of the proposal.

Mr. Hogg explained the City desired to strengthen the character of Water St. by emphasizing a denser scale.

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD:

Mr. Osteen asked if the approved site plan applied to the current submission.

Mr. Gathright explained that the approved site plan was associated with the current submission.

Ms. Brennan asked about the material of the green roof.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

Tim Michel, property owner along 5th St., had no concerns with the project, however desired the project interact more creatively with 5th St.

David Myatt expressed additional concerns about the density regulations of Water St.

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD:

Ms. Brennan, Mr. Hogg, Mr. Coiner, and Mr. Wolf all expressed support of this project.

Ms. Brennan, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, moved to find that the proposed 4-story mixed use condominium building satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

The motion passed (7-0)

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-07-02

205 2nd Street NW Unit 205D

Tax Map 33 Parcel 174.2G

John Rhett, RA Architects LLC, Applicant/ Claude Ripley, Owner

Revise new window locations and add door to outdoor storage

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no questions from the public.

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD:

Ms. Brennan asked about the windows and why the applicant thought it necessary to change them.

John Rhett, applicant, cited that the interior scale was not compatible with the current windows.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no comments.

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD:

Mr. Wolf and Mr. Ayres both expressed support for the project.

Ms. Brennan, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, moved to find that the proposed window and door changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Wolf seconded the motion.

Motion passed (7-0).

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-12-06

415 1st Street N

Tax Map 33 Parcel 106

Joe Milby, Applicant/ Francis Hollis Camp, Owner

Change windows and doors

Ms. Scala gave the staff report.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no questions from the public.

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD:

There were no questions from the board

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

There were no comments from the public.

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD:

The Board discussed various issues with the windows. Overall, the Board supported the request to replace the picture window with sliding doors and the request to create a new window opening.

Mr. Wolf, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, moved to find that the proposal to:

- 1) to replace a picture window with a pair of sliding doors, and**

- 2) to create a new window opening for only a 6/6 Marvin Integrity fiberglass-clad window with hung shutters that match those on adjacent windows and are sized to fit the window if closed. A condition of the approval is that you must first submit to staff for approval a detail of the proposed exterior muntin that shows a putty profile and the width and depth dimensions of the muntin.

satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted

And, furthermore, the BAR denied your requests:

- 3) to raise an existing window opening and
- 4) to replace three existing 6/6 windows with 2/2 windows.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

Motion passed (7-0)

F. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes)

None

G. Other Business

Mr. Coiner moved to nominate Mr. Wolf as Chair and Syd Knight as Vice-Chair.

Mr. Hogg seconded the motion.

Motion passed (6-0-1) with Mr. Wolf abstained.

H. Adjournment

Mr. Hogg moved to adjourn.

Motion passed (7-0).