

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
July 19, 2011
Minutes**

Present:

Fred Wolf, Chair
Syd Knight, Vice Chair
Preston Coiner
Candace DeLoach
Eryn Brennan
William Adams
Michael Osteen

Not Present:

Brian Hogg
H. Fairfax Ayres

Also Present:

Mary Joy Scala

Mr. Wolf convened the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

Announcements:

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda

1. Discussion

Jack Masloff from WA Lynch Roofing asked about adding a metal cap to the brick parapet at 101 E Water Street. He will submit an application.

B. Consent Agenda

1. Minutes – June 21, 2011

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-05-04
513 West Main Street
Tax Map 32 Parcel 172
Gabriel Silverman, Applicant/ Main Street West, LLC, Owner
Renovate building for general commercial use (west façade window detail)

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 08-10-03
1824 University Circle
Tax Map 6 Parcel 97
Charles Dickey, BRW Architects, Applicant/
Hillel Jewish Center at UVA, Owner
Revise project to eliminate two trellises (new trash enclosure)

Mr. Coiner mad the motion

Mr. Knight seconded the motion

Approved (7-0) with corrections to the minutes; Osteen & Brennan recused from minutes vote; Wolf recused from 513 West Main.

C. Projects in Non-Compliance
Update on Main Street streetlights and murals on 1st Street North

D. Previously considered items

1. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 11-07-03 (formerly BAR 10-05-05)
503 W Main Street
Tax Map 32 Parcel 175
James E Treakle, Owner/AHK Architects, Inc., Applicant
Rebuild two Federal style chimneys and connecting wall

Ms. Scala gave the staff report

The Applicant was not present.

Question or Comments from the public

There were none.

Questions or Comments from the Board

- Enough progress was not made over the last year.
- The Board feels it's pretty much straight forward since nothing has changed.

Mary Joy stated that they were having trouble finding a mason.

Mr. Wolf called for a motion.

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed design for the reconstruction of the west chimneys and curtain wall satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the same conditions.

Ms. Brennan seconded the motion.

Approved (7-0) with same conditions and recommendations as previous approval.

The conditions of the previous approval still need to be confirmed/submitted before the applicant can obtain a building permit:

1. **The mortar shall be [lime mortar or] high lime content;**
2. **The chimney width in the north-south direction is aligned and based upon the old chimney stack;**
3. **The chimney will be rectilinear in its proportion to match what originally existed.**
4. **The applicant shall look at the Dinsmore House [1211 West Main Street] coping on top of the parapet wall; for the skirt in between the chimneys; as well as the other reconstruction for similar details, and shall look at the original chimneys on the photographs.**
5. **The applicant shall match the color of the brick as closely as possible [in case the paint is removed in the future].**

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 11-07-05
422 E Main Street
Tax Map 28 Parcel 52
Townsquare Associates, Owner /Marthe Rowen, Applicant
New wood café deck and Revisions to canopy and brick finish

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report.

Marthe Rowen, the applicant was present and displayed examples of the products that will be used.

Questions or Comments from the public

There were none

Questions or Comments from the Board

- Will this project interfere with the Cat House in any way?
- Will there be additional lighting on the deck.
- How will the brick be cleaned?
- Hand washing the brick would be better than power washing.
- Will stucco be used to run along the side of the building.
- How will the extension be held together
- Was the stucco approved.
- The Board has a problem with stucco being used.
- Wood and steel threshold would work well together.

The applicant stated that the Cat House will not be affected in anyway. The brick will be cleaned with a low pressure power wash. No additional lighting will be used, only the lighting from the two city lights already there. Stucco will be used and don't think stucco has been approved.

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the new outdoor café platforms and revisions to the original design for front canopy, window head/canopy heights and brick finish satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion

Approved (7-0) the revisions to the original design for the front canopy, window head/canopy heights, and brick finish as submitted.

Further, the BAR requires that the design for the new outdoor café platforms be revisited as discussed and submitted for administrative approval (relate at least wood portion of 2-3 decks to the building openings, possibly combine first 2 decks; make steel thresholds look solid; suggest fixed stanchions.) The applicant should use the least obtrusive manner of finishing the brick. The stucco application and backing should be clarified as discussed. The applicant has agreed to remove the platforms at end of café season each year.

E New Items

1. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-07-02
500 Court Square
Tax Map 53 Parcel 96.606
Arnold McFalls, Applicant and Owner
Replace 9 Windows in Ct Square Condo (former Monticello Hotel)

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report.

A representative of Court Square was present and had examples of the windows that will be used.

Questions or Comments from the public

There were none

Questions or Comments from the Board

- Has a window already been approved for the condos.
- Has the HOA been made aware of the window change.
- How many windows will be changed.
- The Board feels that it would have been in the best interest of the HOA to come to the BAR and have one window approved.

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed window replacement project satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Wolf seconded the motion.

Approved (7-0) as submitted (aluminum clad sash kits with 7/8" putty profile muntins) in color "French Vanilla." This is the only approved window replacement at this time for the entire structure.

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-07-01
423 2nd Street NE
Tax Map 33 Parcel 86
Kay Humes, Applicant and Owner
Restore exterior; Remove chimney

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report

The applicant, Kay Humes was present and stated that she just wants to restore the house back to the original.

Questions or Comments from the public

There were none.

Questions or Comments from the Board.

- How will the front porch be restored.

- Will the handrail be restored or a new handrail be placed.
- The Board is in support of the project.

The applicant stated that the front porch will be painted to match what already exists. She also stated that a new handrail will be installed.

Ms Brennan said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolition and Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposal to remove the front chimney, porch gutter, and north door and stairway, add shutters, and do exterior repairs and site work satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

Approved (6-0-1 with DeLoach recused) application as submitted (remove front chimney, porch gutter, north door & stairway, add shutters, exterior repairs & site work). If the handrail design changes, it should come back to the staff for approval.

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-07-04
 425 Maple Street
 Tax Map 53 Parcel 203
 City of Charlottesville, Owner/
 Martha Jefferson Neighborhood Association, Applicant
 Add Solar Security Lights and Historic Marker at Maplewood Cemetery

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report.

The applicant, MJH neighborhood association was present and added that this project will just be a temporary solution to a major problem.

Questions or Comments from the public

There were none.

Questions or Comments from the Board

- Will the post be 4x4 pressure treated.
- What is the color of the posts
- How tall are the post
- Will there be reasonable time to test the temporary solution.
- The Board feels that a steel post will be appropriate.
- Has the association hired a professional lighting person evaluate the situation.

The applicant stated that the temporary solution will be evaluated for one year. The association feels that a year will be enough time to evaluate. The post will be a dual gray metal.

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions in Historic Conservation Districts, I move to find that the proposed new security lighting and historic marker satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following

conditions; that the applicant re-evaluate the temporary condition after one year and either remove it if it doesn't work, or get approval for a more permanent solution. Also approved to substitute steel posts for wood. A dark color post is recommended to make it less visible during the day.

Ms. Brennan seconded the motion.

Approved (7-0)

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (incomplete application – removed from agenda)

BAR 11-07-06
207 14th Street NW
Tax Map 9, Parcels 70.1, 70.21
University Ltd, LLC, Owner/ Collins Engineering, Applicant
Convert existing apartment building to Alcove 14th St Hotel

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-07-07
235 W Main Street
Tax Map 33 Parcel 155L
Omni Charlottesville Virginia Corp, Owner/ Cellco Partnership, Applicant
Cellular antennas behind faux rooftop wall and new generator on Old Preston

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report.

The applicant, a representative from Verizon was present and gave an overview of what Verizon is proposing.

Questions or Comments from the Public

There were none

Questions or Comments from the Board

- Could the generator be pushed back further towards the building.
- Could the unit be placed in another corner
- Exactly where will the boxes be located
- What is the current height of the penthouse.
- How often will the emergency generator are tested.
- The Board is really concerned about the appearance the generator will have on the pedestrian Downtown entrance.
- The Board feels that the screening should not come any closer to Preston

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed antennae with faux wall screening, equipment cabinets with new fencing satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application with the faux wall and cabinets on the roof with the qualifier that if the cabinets are visible then they need screening; but the BAR did not approve the current location for the generator.

Mr. Knight seconded the motion.

Approved (6-1)

The applicant asked for a deferral on the generator.

Accepted (7-0) the applicant's deferral on the generator.

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-07-08
418 East Jefferson Street
Tax Map 53 Parcel 40
418 E Jefferson Street, LLC, Owner/ Jeff Easter, Applicant
Replace 15 windows

Mary Joy Scala gave the staff report.

The applicant, Jeff Easter was present and stated that they chose the same windows as the Juvenile and Domestic court.

Questions or Comments from the Public

There were none

Questions or Comments from the Board

- The Board feels they could easily support the project.

Ms. Brennan said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed window replacement project satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion.

Approved (7-0) as submitted (white aluminum clad wood 1/1 replacement windows).

7. Individually Protected Property Recommendation

BAR 11-07-09
104 Stadium Road
Tax Map 16 Parcel 2
Woodrow Too LLC, Owner /City of Charlottesville, Applicant

Mary Joy gave the staff report

The owner was not present.

Questions or Comments from the Board

- The Board was in unanimous decision to support this.

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including criteria for *Additions to or Deletions from Districts or Protected Property List*, I move that the BAR recommends that City Council should designate 104 Stadium Road, the MacLeod House building and property, an Individually Protected Property.

Ms. Brennan seconded the motion

The BAR recommended (7-0) that City Council should designated 104 Stadium Road, the MacLeod House building and property, as an Individually Protected Property. The BAR expressed appreciation to Kristin Rourke for the survey information.

F. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes)

There were none.

G. Other Business

At retreat discuss condo question and also height of standing seams on metal roof.

H. Adjournment 7:55 p.m.