

**City of Charlottesville  
Board of Architectural Review  
October 18, 2011  
Minutes**

**Present:**

Fred Wolf, Chair  
Syd Knight, Vice Chair  
Preston Coiner  
Candace DeLoach  
Melanie Miller  
William Adams  
Brian Hogg

**Not Present:**

Michael Osteen  
H. Fairfax Ayres

**Also Present:**

Mary Joy Scala

Mr. Wolf convened the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

**Announcements:**

**A. Matters from the public not on the agenda**

The Chair welcomed new member Melanie Miller, who replaces Eryn Brennan.

Mr. Hogg asked if the BAR could be issued iPads, like the Planning Commission has.

**B. Consent Agenda**

1. **Minutes – September 20, 2011-Not available yet**

**C. Projects in Non-Compliance**

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 10-10-04  
All Historic Districts  
City of Charlottesville  
Dark Sky Compliant Street Light

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

Judy Mueller presented options to correct the West Main Street streetlights that were installed without glass panes. The BAR agreed she would install for the BAR to review, a sample of pebbled acrylic in two fixtures, and pebbled glass in two fixtures. Coiner recused himself from the discussion.

**D. Previously Deferred items**

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from September 20, 2011)**  
BAR 11-07-07  
235 W Main Street  
Tax Map 33 Parcel 155L  
Omni Charlottesville Virginia Corp, Owner/ Cellco Partnership, Applicant  
New generator on Old Preston

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Nathan Holland, and representative, Maynard Sipe, were present and added that it would be very compelling to have a generator on site to have continued service.

### **Questions or Comments from the public**

Virginia Daugherty, and adjacent owner, would like the wall to be brick and would like the corridor kept attractive.

### **Questions or Comments from the Board**

- Will the hollies be removed?
- What is exactly happening between the access wall?
- Has it been verified that the existing fence is within setbacks?
- Would the entire enclosure be brick?
- Feels the applicant is correct with the wooden fence.
- Feels the existing equipment should be changed.
- Paint the fence dark green and maintain the hollies.
- Is the height of the generator the same as existing?

The applicant stated that the enclosure could be brick and the height of the generator is just a little bit higher than the existing.

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed generator with screening satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the proposed generator with a screen, with the conditions that the screen be provided in the form of an 8 ft. high wooden fence, configured in a simplified form, with details related to plan, section, and painting to be submitted to staff for approval. Intent: The fence shall replace the existing fence, shall be painted immediately a dark green-approaching-black color, shall be configured in 3 planes with one parallel to the sidewalk, and shall be designed with a simple cap. The existing plantings shall be maintained; any new planting shall be a single plant material planted to form a hedge.

Mr. Adams seconded the motion

### **The BAR approved (7-0)**

4. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from September 20, 2011)**  
BAR 11-09-05  
505 West Main Street  
Tax Map 32 Parcel 174  
Greg Jackson, Applicant/ Main Street West, LLC, Owner  
Renovate existing building (Revised design)

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The architect, Greg Jackson, was present and stated that the entire chimney will be removed.

### **Questions or comments from the public**

There were none

### **Questions or Comments from the Board**

- Was the south side door updated to open?
- Very appropriate proposal.

The applicant stated that they wanted the door to be more efficient.

Mr. Adams said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application with the revised rehabilitation design as submitted, including removal of both entire chimneys.

Mr. Hogg seconded the motion

### **The BAR approved (6-0-1 with Wolf recused)**

5. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 11-07-06  
207 14<sup>th</sup> Street NW  
Tax Map 9, Parcels 70.1, 70.21  
University Ltd, LLC, Owner/ Whit Graves, Applicant  
Convert existing apartment building to Alcove 14<sup>th</sup> St Hotel (Details)

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The architect, Bob Anderson, was present and stated that the height of the fence will be reduced.

### **Questions or Comments from the public**

There were none

### **Questions or Comments from the Board**

- Would like clarification of the wood fiber cement.
- Will the brick wall remain?
- Location of the lobby, will it be on 15<sup>th</sup> St?
- Changes on south elevation are very nice.
- Very agreeable with the fence/less scale to the street.

The applicant stated that the brick wall will remain and the entrance will be on 15<sup>th</sup> Street.

Mr. Adams said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the details for the proposed addition and renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the design details as submitted, with the metal fence pulled back to the building line on the 14<sup>th</sup> Street side.

Mr. Hogg seconded the motion

**The BAR approved (6-0-1 with Wolf recused)**

**E. New Items**

**6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 11-10-02  
200 W Water Street  
Tax Map 28 Parcel 79  
Mono Loco, LLC, Applicant/ Chauncey Hutter, Owner  
Replace patio canopy

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Max DiStefano, was present and stated that the canopy structure has been there since 2005 and they are just trying to replace it.

**Questions or Comments from the Public**

There were none.

**Question or Comments from the Board**

- Will it stay in place year around?
- The current canopy is obscuring the building.
- Like to see more plastic and less canvas.
- The canopy is not actually conformed to elevation.
- The sides should be replaced to what is similar.

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Signs, Awnings, Vending and Cafes, I move to find that the proposed outdoor canopy satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications; the replacement canopy, given the specific circumstances of this existing canopy, with the color and panel design or window layout to come to staff for administrative approval.

Mr. ----- Seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (5-1-1 with Coiner opposed and Hogg recused)**

**7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 11-10-03  
603 Farish Street  
Tax Map 52 Parcel 183.1  
Angela Taylor, Applicant  
Add deck; add trees; paint house

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report. The applicant was not present.

**Questions or Comments from the public**

There were none.

**Questions or Comments from the Board**

- The same deck is being proposed.
- Feels that the house is not really contributing.
- Feel that the details are appropriate.

Mr. Hogg said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, for Site Design, and for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed new deck, landscaping, and paint color satisfy the BAR’s criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. ----- seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (7-0) the application as submitted, with the suggestion that the applicant tests a small area of the color on the building first, to be sure it is the color expected.**

- 8. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 11-10-04  
31 University Circle  
Tax Map 6 Parcel 80  
CDA Design Studio, Applicant/ James and Rosa Lee Breeden, Owners  
New garage doors, gutters, roof

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

**Questions or Comments from the public**

There were none.

**Questions or Comments from the Board**

- Are there going to be 4 doors?
- Are the doors shown in the photograph?

The architect, Chuck Dickey, stated that it is actually one door designed to look like two.

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed garage renovation satisfies the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Hogg seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (6-1 with Knight opposed) the garage alterations as submitted.**

- 9. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 11-10-01  
1512 East Market Street  
Tax Map 56 Parcel 40.4  
Chris Murray, Jefferson Area Board of Aging, Applicant/  
Preston Coiner, Burgess Lane Properties, Owner  
Re-approval to construct three new buildings on adjacent parcel to the Timberlake-  
Branham House; change some construction materials

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

Frank Stoner gave an overview of some changes being made.

### **Questions or Comments from the public**

There were none.

### **Questions or Comments from the Board**

- Will the retaining walls between the units change?
- Will the retaining walls be red?
- Not really having a problem with the railings.
- Does not like that the dormer is narrower.
- The changes in the arch are beneficial.
- Feel the changes meet the guidelines.
- Uncomfortable with some of the material.

The applicant stated that only the retaining walls at the two ends will change and the concrete walls will be red.

Mr. Hogg said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the following proposed revisions to materials and design buildings satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and the Timberlake Branham property, and that the BAR approves only the following portions of the application. The BAR, considering the particular location and obligations associated with the review of this project, which make it unusual, approved the changes to the design and materials as submitted, with the request that railings in public areas overlooking stairwells or in retaining wall areas keep the composite rather than vinyl material. Also, the windows shall have substantial (4.5") trim with a sill, not a "picture frame" trim.

Mr. Knight seconded the motion.

### **Approved (6-0-1 with Coiner recused)**

**F. Matters from the public not on the agenda -None**

**G. Other Business -None**

**8:10 H. Adjournment 8:40 pm**