

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
December 20, 2011
Minutes**

Present:

Fred Wolf, Chair
Syd Knight, Vice Chair
Preston Coiner
Candace DeLoach
Melanie Miller
William Adams
Brian Hogg
Whitt Graves

Not Present:

Michael Osteen

Also Present:

Mary Joy Scala

Mr. Wolf convened the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

Announcements:

Mr. Wolf announced the re-appointed of Candace DeLoach and Brian Hogg for another term.

Mary Joy announced Tim Mohr as being the new member of the BAR and he will start his term at the next month meeting.

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda-none

B. Consent Agenda

1. **Minutes** – November 15, 2011-**Not available**
2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 11-12-01
718-722 Preston Avenue
Tax Map 31 Parcel 38
City Campus LLC, Owner/ Martin Chapman, Applicant/ Willard Scribner, Architect
Former Coca Cola Bottling Works Rehabilitation (restore windows)

The BAR felt the owner showed extraordinary appropriateness.

Mr. Hogg made a motion to approve the Consent Agenda

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion

The BAR approved (8-0).

C. Projects in Non-Compliance-None

D. Previously Deferred items

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from June 2011)**
BAR 11-04-08
1223 West Main Street
Tax Map 10 Parcel 20
Raymond E. Gaines, AIA, Applicant/ University Baptist Church, Owner
New handicapped ramp

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Raymond Gaines was present and he had nothing to add, but was available for questions.

Questions from the Public

There were none

Questions from the Board

- **Will the brick pad extend above the ground**
- **What is the intent of the planting**
- **Will the ramp be paved concrete**
- **What is the size of the top railing**
- **Are the circles on the railing part of the building detail**
- **What is the thickness on the pre-cast caps**
- **Will solid brick be used to fill in where the mesh wire is going**
- **What type of material will be used for the metal post**

The applicant stated that they felt keeping the metal off the ground is more attractive. The planting scale will get larger at the ramp. The pickets are ½ inch square bars and the thickness of the caps will be 2 ½ inches.

Comments from the public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **The Board appreciates the access way that was created and feels it really ties in nicely to the historic side.**
- **They would like more attention dedicated to the landscape**
- **Would like a different material used for the pre-cast caps if they are going to be covered**
- **Some feel that the design may not be there yet**
- **They feel that the density of the pickets is not too troubling.**
- **The details have been toned down, rather invisible and meet the guidelines.**

Mr. Hogg said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed handicapped ramp satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, asking that the applicant to consider comments made by the BAR as the project moves toward contract documents, including: a more aggressive planting scheme with the goal to eventually screen the bottom portion of the ramp; the caps on the front brick columns should be more robust; remove the brick bases/caps on the metal columns.

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (8-0)

- 4. Certificate of Appropriateness (Deferred from November 2011)**
BAR 11-09-08
600 Preston Place
Tax Map 5 Parcel 109
Will Teass, AIA, Applicant/ Xi Chapter of Theta Chi Alumni Corp, Owner
Enlarge fraternity with three-level addition for five additional bedrooms

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Will Teass was present and stated that modifications were made based on comments from the BAR.

Questions from the Public

There were none

Questions from the Board

- **Will any windows be replaced**
- **How will the grading be from Grady Ave up to the travel way**
- **Will the steel rails be painted**
- **Explain what is on the other side of the wall**
- **Will work be done on the garage**
- **Will the dumpster enclosure cover the existing walls**
- **Are there bedrooms in the garage**

The applicant stated that, no windows will be replaced at this time. The grade will follow what is there now. The rails will be painted a light color. There is no proposed work on the garage at this time and there are two rooms in the garage used as accessory apartments. The dumpster enclosure will cover the existing windows in the garage.

Comments from the Public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **Some changes successfully reflect the discussion from the previous meeting.**
- **Would like the band to go and a little more detail would help.**
- **Feels that part of the project is still massive**
- **Really comfortable with the roof line**

Mr. Wolf said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed renovation, addition, and site work satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district,

and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions: Details on exterior lighting, trash enclosure, typical guardrail including paint color, new cornice/soffit, and driveway entrance off Grady, to come back to the BAR for further discussion.

Additionally, a friendly suggestion was made to address the inappropriate existing vinyl windows that have grids between the glasses.

Mr. Knight seconded the motion

The BAR approved (6-2 with Miller and DeLoach opposed)

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from November 2011)

BAR 11-11-05

518 17th Street NW

Tax Map 5 Parcel 66

Chas Dickey, BRW Architects, Applicant/

Ch'ville VA House Corp – Alpha Phi, Owner

Alphi Phi Sorority Addition

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Chas Dickey was present and added that information about the project was presented to the Venable Neighborhood Association and they approved the design and feel it is appropriate for the neighborhood.

Questions from the public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **Which three cherry trees will be cut down**
- **How wide is the west elevation**
- **Will the existing siding be left on the house**
- **Will the ramp be built out of wood and how wide are the slats**
- **What type of roof material will be used**

The applicant stated the width will be 6ft wide and it has not been determined which trees will come down. He also stated that the stucco will be removed from the house on the left side.

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, subject to staff approval of: window cut sheet (aluminum clad with exterior applied SDL's), dark-sky compliant exterior lighting, landscape plan showing trees to be removed/replaced, and material submissions for windows and slate roof.

Mr. Graves seconded the motion

The BAR approved (8-0)

The BAR also found that the proposed handicapped ramp (placed at the SE corner) does not threaten the historic significance of the building.

Additional suggestions are: eliminate the belt course on the hipped piece, reconsider the painting scheme with corner boards and trim, and articulate the blank panels on the “sleeping porch,” possibly with fixed shutters.

E. New Items

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-12-02

108 3rd Street NE

Tax Map 33 Parcel 231

Williams, J & D Pettit, Tr, Advance Auto LD, Owner/Brian Helleberg, Applicant

Fleurie Restaurant Patio

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Brian Helleberg, was present.

Questions from the Public

There were none

Questions from the Board

- **What is the height of the platform as it connects to the building**
- **How will it removed in the winter months**
- **Why the color mahogany**
- **Do the planter boxes sit on the platform**
- **Is the top rail round**
- **Why extend the wall in on one side**

The applicant stated that the height of the platform will be 4 inches with 6 inches on the other side and the red mahogany was the best option of what was available. The planters will be sitting on the platform and the wall will be extended so that the area will not be so claustrophobic.

Comments from the Public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **Feel that the design is appropriate**
- **Would love to see the design of the table and chairs**
- **Feel that natural wood would go better with the building**

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and for Signs, Awnings, Vending and Cafes, I move to find that the new outdoor café platforms satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the condition that the tables and chairs are to be submitted to staff for approval.

Mr. Wolf seconded the motion

The BAR approved (8-0)

They also requested that the applicant consider items discussed at the meeting: wood finish; exact detailing of banquette wall and extent of penetrability; and possibility of omitting planters and substituting another form of green material.

Brian Hogg left the meeting.

7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 11-12-03

Tax Map 32 Parcel 174

509 W Main Street

West Main Street, LLC, Owner/ Water Street Studio, Applicant

Courtyard Renovation

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant was present and didn't add to the report.

Questions from the public

There were none

Questions from the Board

- **Have the table and chairs been chosen**
- **Are the existing details on the garage opening not squared off on the top**
- **Will the curb cut be changed at all**
- **How tall will the trees be**
- **Any plans for umbrellas**

The applicant stated that the table and chairs will be left up to the restaurant owner. The curb cut will not change and the trees will be 12-15ft to get shade from them.

Comments from the Public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **Feels the designs are appropriate**

- **Would love to see a more locally significant mural**
- **Feels it's an interesting proposal and that it meets the guidelines**
- **Color of concrete is acceptable**
- **Really like the design of the courtyard**
- **The doors are fine and the planting is appropriate.**

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed courtyard and door changes and mural satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application the courtyard, door changes, and mural as submitted with the condition that any new lighting added to the space, any shade structures and site furniture shall be submitted to the BAR for approval once those details become available.

Friendly suggestion: The owner should consider a mural with local significance.

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion

The BAR approved (6-0-1 with Wolf recusing)

8. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
 BAR 11-12-04
 201 E Main Street
 Tax Map 33 Parcel 240.1
 Central Place Limited Partnership, Owner/ Fabian Kuttner, Applicant
 Replace cloth awnings with Corten steel awnings

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Fabian Kuttner was present and added that the new awning will have some stain and rust issues for the first two years but almost goes away to nothing the last 2-5 years.

Questions from the public

There were none

Questions from the Board

- **If a sealer is added, will the steel look wet all the time**
- **Why was this material chosen**
- **Was a small mock up done**

The applicant stated that the material was chosen because of the longevity and low maintenance. He also stated that a mockup was not done because of time and that there is a sealer product that will not look wet all the time.

Comments from the Public

There were none

Comments from the Board

- **Feel that the detail needs a little tweaking**
- **Needs to look more traditional**
- **Really interesting idea but could use a little bit more details of the building.**
- **Would love to see a sample of the material**

The applicant made a request for a deferral

Mr. Coiner made a motion to accept the applicant request for a deferral.

Ms. Miller seconded the motion.

The BAR accepted (7-0) the applicant’s request for deferral. The BAR wants to see more details, including: batten design; square tubes may be better and allow neater weld joints; where has Corten been used locally; have a sample of the final product.

9. Preliminary Discussion

1308 & 1310 Wertland Street
 Tax Map 10 Parcels 10 & 11
 Dinsmore, LLC, Owner/ Daggett & Grigg, Applicant
 New 4-story apartment building with 12 units and commercial space

The BAR made preliminary comments, including: Strong elements are the tower piece, and the commercial space in the alley. Concerns are: materiality (consider 3 stories of brick, then setback); overwhelming existing buildings (tenement feel); Don’t obliterate light and air; Provide more justification for removal of addition, shed, and trees; Reconsider the balconies; Avoid monumental gestures between the two historic buildings; No glass strip up the façade; Double windows provide a bad scale; Odd touching existing building.

10. Preliminary Discussion

1250 Wertland Street
 Tax Map 10 Parcel 25
 Wertland, LLC, Owner/ Daggett & Grigg, Applicant
 New 4-story boarding house

The BAR made preliminary comments, including: In general, the building fits in well; the brick is an appropriate material; concerns are the degree to which the parking opening drives the façade design, and the lack of a front door.

F. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes) -None

G. Other Business –1. Elect Vice-Chair The BAR elected (7-0) Bill Adams as Vice-Chair and Mary Joy Scala as Secretary.

8:10 H. Adjournment to Annual Holiday Dinner – 528 Locust Avenue 9:10 pm