

**City of Charlottesville  
Board of Architectural Review  
January 17, 2012  
Minutes**

**Present:**

Syd Knight, Vice Chair  
Preston Coiner  
Candace DeLoach  
Melanie Miller  
William Adams  
Brian Hogg  
Michael Osteen  
Whit Graves

**Not Present:**

**Also Present:**

Mary Joy Scala

Mr. Knight convened the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

**Announcements:**

**Tim Mohr was introduced as the new member of the BAR.**

**A. Matters from the public not on the agenda-None**

**B. Consent Agenda**

1. **Minutes – December 20, 2011**
2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from August 2011)**  
BAR 11-08-03  
400-480 Rugby Road  
Tax Map 9 Parcels 3, 4, 5  
Sanford Wilcox, Applicant/ Westminster Presbyterian Church, Owner  
Walkway, signage, side porch improvements

**The BAR approved the consent agenda (9-0) with Osteen and Mohr abstaining on the December minutes because they were not at that meeting, and Hogg abstaining from 400 Rugby Road.**

**Projects in Non-Compliance –No report**

**C. Previously Deferred items**

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from December 2011)**  
BAR 11-12-04  
201 E Main Street  
Tax Map 33 Parcel 240.1  
Central Place Limited Partnership, Owner/ Fabian Kuttner, Applicant  
Replace cloth awnings with Corten steel awnings

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Fabian Kuttner was presented and added that the Corten looks just like regular steel

### **Questions from the Public**

There were none

### **Questions from the Board**

- What is in the space now
- Will all three spaces be done
- Has an Engineer been consulted to see if the building can withstand the awning

The applicant stated that all three spaces will be done.

### **Comments from the Public**

There were none

### **Comments from the Board**

- Material is not appropriate
- The awning is appropriate for this building retail space
- Intrigued by the material and the choice
- Feels that the material could be problematic
- White/Corten is an issue, Brick/Corten is not an issue

*Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Signs, Awnings, Vending & Cafes, I move to find that the proposed Corten awnings satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application in concept and material, with additional architectural detailing to be submitted to the BAR for discussion and approval*

**The BAR approved (5-4 with Hogg, Coiner, Adams, and Osteen opposed)**

- 4. Certificate of Appropriateness (Details continued from December 2011)**  
BAR 11-09-08  
600 Preston Place  
Tax Map 5 Parcel 109  
Will Teass, AIA, Applicant/ Xi Chapter of Theta Chi Alumni Corp, Owner  
Enlarge fraternity with three-level addition for five additional bedrooms

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Will Teass was present and added that a new curb cut will be on Grady Avenue

### **Questions from the Public**

There were none

### **Questions from the Board**

- How high are the flood lights mounted on the building
- Will the grade be dropped at the sidewalk crossing

The applicant stated that the flood lights would be 9ft above porch on Grady Ave side and higher on the other side.

### **Comments from the Public**

There were none

### **Comments from the Board**

- Appreciate the effort the applicant has put forth.
- Flood lights aiming straight down will put a glare on the Grady side
- Like the trash enclosure to be painted a dark color
- Very impressed with the level of detail

*Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the additional details satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the new addition with modifications suggested at the meeting as to railings [vertical black pickets], curb cut, and dark green stain on the trash enclosure, and with the condition that, if the existing [vinyl] windows are replaced in the original structure [as the BAR previously recommended], that project information must be submitted to staff for approval. [Confirm that they will be Marvin aluminum clad wood, with lites to match existing, and SDL's with muntins permanently affixed to exterior with spacer bars.]*

**The BAR approved (7-2 with Deloach and Miller opposed)**

**[Please note on site plan the 5 feet setback for the trash enclosure.]**

### **5. Preliminary Discussion and Special Use Permit Recommendation (Deferred from June 2011)**

BAR 11-06-13  
608 Preston Place  
Tax Map 5 Parcel 108  
Mitchell/Matthews, Applicant/  
Psi Chapter of Sigma Chi Fraternity House Corp., Owner  
Renovations & addition to fraternity house

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report

The applicant, Mr. Matthews was present.

**The BAR accepted (9-0) the applicant's request for deferral.**

**BAR issues focused on the effect on the character of the historic district, the effect on the building independent of surroundings, and the architectural detailing.**

**The program is too intensive for the site (double the square footage);**

**enormous increase in impervious area;**

**need to use landscaping to screen activities;**

**the house corporation should join the conversations that the architect has been having with the neighborhood, (the real issues are programmatic and managerial – need agreement how special events and parking could be handled);**

**the addition does not meet the guidelines in terms of extent of demolition, size in relation to house, effect of building and activities pushed to the property lines;**

**project is overwhelming and out of scale to house and neighborhood.**

**6. Certificate of Appropriateness (Details continued from November 2011)**

BAR 10-07-07

5 Gildersleeve Wood

Tax Map 11 Parcel 18

Deren Bader & Paul Lyons, Owners

Front yard renovations: Changes to exterior lighting and shed addition

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Deren Bader was present and she had nothing to add.

**Questions from the Public**

There were none

**Questions from the Board**

- Wattage of the lighting of the pier
- Will the front door have the same fixtures

The applicant stated that the front door lights will have a globe on them

**Comments from the Public**

There were none

**Comments from the Board**

- Fixtures draw a lot of attention
- Really like the motion sensor control
- The stone pier is appropriate

***Mr. Hogg said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed lighting and shed changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the applicant preferring R-2 fixture on the existing stone pier, the motion detector lights, and the changes to the shed roof as submitted.***

**The BAR approved (9-0)**

**D. New Items**

- 7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 12-01-02  
First Street and Main Street  
Tax Map 28/33  
City of Charlottesville, Owner/ Steve Trumbull, Applicant  
First and Main Medallion

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

**Questions from the Public**

There were none

**Questions from the Board**

- **How big is the medallion**

The applicant stated that the medallion will be 4ft across and will only take that space.

**Comments from the Public**

There were none

**Comments from the Board**

- Really like the idea and feels it is very appropriate.

*Mr. Adams said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Public Improvements, I move to find that the proposed marker satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.*

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (8-1 with Hogg opposed)**

- 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 12-01-01  
1003 W Main Street  
Tax Map 10 Parcel 51  
Studio House LLC, Owner/ Jozo Andelic, Applicant  
Add corrugated metal awning to Balkan Bistro

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant was not present

**Questions from the Public**

There were none

**Questions from the Board**

There were none

**Comments from the Public**

There were none

**Comments from the Board**

- The Board has no problem with the application

*Mr. Osteen said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Signs, Awnings, Vending & Cafes, I move to find that the proposed new canopy satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the canopy, with a condition that all exposed wood must be painted a neutral color to match the storefront and the color must first be approved by staff.*

Mr. Graves seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (8-0-1 with Hogg abstaining)**

- 9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 12-01-04  
1308 & 1310 Wertland Street  
Tax Map 10 Parcels 10 & 11  
Dinsmore, LLC, Owner/ Daggett & Grigg, Applicant  
New 4-story apartment building with 12 units and commercial space

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Jim Grigg was present and added that the 1210 house and the cinder block garage will be demolished.

**Questions from the Public**

There were none

**Questions from the Board**

- **Will the buildings be attached**
- **Is there a reason why the stairs are in the front of the building**

The applicant stated that it would be too problematic to have the buildings attached and the stairs will not work in the front of the house.

**Comments from the Public**

There were none

**Comments from the Board**

- No problem with the demo of the back of the house
- The colors white and beige come forward and present more mass
- Hardy board could be more calmer and something more fun could be achieved
- Generally comfortable with the idea

*Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and for New Construction, I move to find that the additional details satisfy the BAR’s criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the mass and general architectural concept of the structure, including the 4-story height on top of a parking level, and the demolition of a cinderblock structure behind 1308, and an [1970’s] addition on the rear of 1310, and trees as noted, with the requirement that the applicant return to the BAR with full architectural detailing on the building.*

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (5-4 with DeLoach, Hogg, Miller, and Adams opposed)**

- 10. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
 BAR 12-01-03  
 1250 Wertland Street  
 Tax Map 10 Parcel 25  
 Wertland, LLC, Owner/ Daggett & Grigg, Applicant  
 New 4-story boarding house

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

**Questions from the Public**

There were none

**Questions from the Board**

- Where will the mechanical equipment be located
- Was a garage door considered

The applicant stated that the mechanical equipment will be located on the roof and it will be screened. A garage door was considered, but feels it will be vandalized.

## Comments from the Public

There were none

## Comments from the Board

- Feel that the garage door is an interesting idea
- Strong reservation pertaining to the entrance on 12<sup>th</sup> Street
- The door could be divided into two
- Why don't the band go around the entire building

The applicant stated that the band was chopped to bring the scale down.

*Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the additional details satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following modifications; the building as submitted with the condition that the following shall be submitted to the BAR for approval:*

- 1. Manufacturer's product information and color samples for all major building materials, including the courtyard material;*
- 2. Configuration of access to the plaza from 12-1/2 Street exterior of building to be further resolved (it needs to read as an entry to the building, and the stairway needs to be more of an event than it is);*
- 3. Detail for inclusion of garage doors on 12-1/2 Street.*

Mr. Coiner seconded the motion.

**The BAR approved (7-2 with Hogg and Osteen opposed)**

- F. Matters from the public not on the agenda -None**
- G. Other Business – Work session on tent guidelines scheduled for Tuesday January 31 at 5 pm in NDS Conference Room**

**8:10 H. Adjournment 8:45 pm**