

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
Minutes
December 18, 2012
Council Chambers-City Hall**

Present:

Syd Knight, Chair
William Adams, Vice-Chair
Melanie Miller
Whit Graves
Michael Osteen
Tim Mohr
Brian Hogg
Candace DeLoach

Also Present:

Mary Joy Scala
Kristin Rourke

- A. Matters from the public not on the agenda-There were none**
- B. Consent Agenda** (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled minutes will be discussed at the end of the agenda, but pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning.)
- 1. Minutes October 16, 2012 Approved (5-0)**
- C. Projects in Non-Compliance – No report**
- D. Other Business**
- 1. 2012 Preservation Awards**
The Preston A. Coiner Best Preservationist Award – Preston A Coiner (Posthumous)
Julie Coiner received the award for Preston Coiner.
Best Designer Award – Frederick A. Wolf, Jr.
Dave Ackerman received the award for his business partner, Fred Wolf.
- 2. New BAR appointee**
Justin Sarafin, historian
- E. Previously Deferred Items – None**

Candace DeLoach and Brian Hogg arrived at the meeting.

- F. New Items**
- 1. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 12-12-01
120 East Main Street
Tax Map 28 Parcel 26
Fred Wolf, Wolf Ackerman Design, Applicant

120 East Main LLC, et al, Owner
Storefront renovation

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.
There were no questions or comments from the public

Questions from the Board

- **Will the steel be painted?**

The applicant, Dave Ackerman, responded by saying the steel will be gray-preferably a dove gray.

Comments from the Board

The Board feels this will be a big improvement over what is there now. They feel the improvement makes it have a more traditional storefront.

Mr. Adams said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed storefront renovation satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this contributing property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Graves seconded the motion.

Approved (7-0) as submitted at the meeting [the version without fixed glass above the doors].

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 12-12-02

16 Elliewood Avenue

Tax Map 9 Parcels 97

The Biltmore – Andy McClure, Applicant/Geary Albright, et al, Owner
Seasonal Tent

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Andy McClure was present and added that he felt the color fits a little better with the building.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

Questions from the Board

- They asked if the applicant would take the tent down if the Board voted no.

The applicant stated that he would prefer not to take the tent down.

Comments from the Board

- **A darker color awning would be better because it disappears.**
- **Feel that the tent in that location would not have an effect on the streetscape.**
- **The tent will not be blocking the view of any other buildings.**

Mr. Graves said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Tents, I move to find that the proposed outdoor tent satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted

Mr. Hogg seconded the motion.

Approved (6-1 with Miller opposed) as submitted.

- 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 12-12-03
601 West Main Street
Tax Map 32 Parcel 171
Gabriel Silverman, Applicant/Main Street West, LLC, Owner
Revisions to previously approved new addition

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Greg Jackson, handed out some additional changes that included a little more detailed information.

There were no comments or questions from the public.

Questions from the Board

- Does the footprint show an additional layer than previously?
- Are the lights integrated with the building signage and will there be lights in the canopy?
- Will the canopy be custom made?

Mr. Jackson stated that there is a south side set back but the west wall is on the property line. He also stated that the lights that are currently there will be used and there is no plan to put lights in the canopy. The green canopy will be custom made.

Comments from the Board

- The Board feels that the mint green canopy is odd. The balcony is unusual for the building type and the spacing of the lighting does not match elements of the building. They felt that additional lights located higher would be better. Lights in the canopy would actually be enough. They would like to see the railings on the balcony made lighter.

Mr. Mohr said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, and New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed revisions to the previously approved new addition satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following details to be submitted for administrative approval: railings, canopies, lighting (not necessarily right now).

Mr. Knight seconded the motion

Approved (7-0).

- 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 12-12-04
402 Park Street
Tax Map 53 Parcel 115

Mike Christian, Applicant/Crestar Bank, Owner
Retaining wall

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicant, Mike Christian, was present and explained the reason for the retaining wall.

There were no comments or questions from the public.

Questions and Comments from the Board

- **Was a fence ever considered?**

The applicant stated that the adjacent property owners didn't want a fence they wanted to be able to go over the wall.

The Board feels this is the best hidden wall they have seen.

Mr. Adams said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed retaining wall satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Mr. Graves seconded the motion.

Approved as submitted (7-0).

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 12-10-04

852-854 and 858-860 West Main Street

Tax Map 30 Parcel 3 and 4

AUDG Holdings, LLC, Applicant

Merchants Acquisitions, LLC and Fluvanna Holdings, LLC, Owner

New construction of Charlottesville University Housing

Mary Joy Scala presented the staff report.

The applicants were present.

There were no questions from the public.

Questions from the Board

- **What size brick and stucco will be used?**
- **What is the size of the windows in each unit?**
- **Will the vegetation be kept on the south side with all of the trees?**
- **What color is the balcony material?**
- **What type of mechanical systems and where will they be placed?**

The applicant stated that regular size brick will be used and stucco. He also stated that some of the vegetation will be replanted, but they have no control over the railroad and its plantings.

Mr. Knight said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed new construction of a mixed use building satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West

Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the general mass, scale, footprint, and general architectural design of the building, with the requirements that:

- *additional architectural details be submitted for the main façade conditions found on both West Main Street, and the south and west facades;*
- *special attention given to possibility of using brick rather than stucco in spandrel panels;*
- *alternate material be considered for some or all of stucco on south side of site;*
- *special attention be given to parapet and cornice condition at 5th floor on West Main Street facade;*
- *color of aluminum storefronts be reconsidered as suggested;*
- *a substantial landscape planting including large native deciduous trees be installed within area between RR r/w and property;*
- *consideration of other material for the penthouse facades;*
- *these studies to include consideration for appropriate sizes and proportion of windows.*

Mr. ----- seconded the motion.

Approved (6-1 with Adams opposed).

G. Other Business

Adams, Miller and Scala met and discussed work program for the next year:

1. **Keep calendar of preservation events: BAR meetings, PLACE meetings, Preservation Virginia conference, etc.**
 2. **Schedule training session/work session early in the year.(February)**
Schedule joint meeting to facilitate communication with PLACE task force, and City Council if available, later in the year. (summer)
 3. **Improve web site.**
 4. **Post BAR electronic submissions online for public benefit.**
 5. **Investigate feasibility of paperless BAR meetings (ipads for BAR members?).**
 6. **Create mechanism for media inquiries and responses. Meet with Miriam Dickler, Charlottesville Office of Communications, to discuss providing project background and correct info regarding BAR's role.**
 7. **Update guidelines as needed (ex: review Richmond's mural guidelines)**
 8. **Other topics for further discussion: West Main Street build-out massing; long-term tents issue.**
- **The BAR wants to resume PowerPoint displays for the public benefit during meetings.**
 - **At February work session possibly revisit guidelines regarding West Main Street, tents and murals.**

H. Adjournment to Annual Holiday Dinner at Zocolo 8:00 p.m.