

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting-Minutes
January 21, 2014 – 5:30 p.m.
Basement Conference Room - City Hall

Members Present

Ms. Melanie Miller - Chair
Mr. Tim Mohr – Vice-Chair
Mr. Michael Osteen
Mr. Whit Graves
Mr. Justin Sarafin
Ms. Candace DeLoach
Ms. Laura Knott
Mr. Carl Schwarz

Members Absent

Mr. Brian Hogg

Staff Present

Ms. Mary Joy Scala

The new Chair, Ms. Miller, thanked previous Chair, William Adams for his 8 years of service to the BAR, and welcomed new member Carl Schwarz.

- A. Matters from the public not on the agenda - None
- B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled minutes will be discussed at the end of the agenda, but pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning.)

- 1. Minutes November 19, 2013

Mr. Mohr made a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.

Mr. Graves seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (8-0) the minutes on consent agenda.

- C. Projects in Non-Compliance – No Report
- D. Deferred or Previously Considered Items

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 13-08-05
853 & 901 W Main Street
Tax Map 31 Parcel 169 & 170
853-855 West Main LLC, Owner/ Landmark Acquisitions LLC, Applicant
New construction – The Standard (windows and site details)

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

John Matthews represented the applicant. He noted three types of windows for the BAR's review: Andersen Composite, dark color, used in Oakhurst project; Marvin Ultrex Integrity in white; and Silverline (vinyl) in white by Andersen. None of the windows would have muntins. The better windows would be used on Main Street elevation. Composite windows would wrap the corner on Main.

Mr. Mohr preferred that the Marvin Integrity window be used on W Main Street. The BAR had a problem with the dark Andersen Composite window. Ms. DeLoach thought there should be one or two window styles used; not three.

No signage is proposed on top of canopies. Underside is stained wood. Three types of signage: LED light within channel; windows signs for secondary; built-in sign on transformer screen.

Landscape plan was prepared by Neal Beasley with Timmons Group. Ms. Knott preferred substitution of something else for the River Birch. The applicant agreed.

Staff will confirm that the lighting plan was previously approved, and will distribute it to the BAR.

The BAR determined that the canopies, the brick use and color are fine, and the reduction of the overhang also.

The applicant will submit a sketch to Ms. Scala of the six foot high transformer screen wall.

Mr. Mohr made a motion: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Site Elements, I move to find that the two proposed windows, the [Silverline] vinyl window and the Marvin window [without muntins], are appropriate but we want to see some alternates for that subject to administrative approval, and site details as noted by Laura for the trees [something else substituted for River Birch] and additional design work on the transformer fence, satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with those addendums.

Mr. Graves seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (8-0) the motion.

Mr. Osteen suggested having someone from the power company talk to us about reasonable constraints regarding the location of transformers.

.

3. Second Preliminary Discussion

BAR 13-11-04

1002-06 W Main Street and 118 11th St SW

Tax Map 28 Parcels 68 & 70

University Station, LLC & The Ivy Land Trust, Owners/

Campus Acquisitions Holdings, LLC, Applicant

New construction - 1000 W Main Street

Ms. Scala provided the staff report. No action could be taken until City Council approves the Special Use Permit.

The applicant, Stephen Bus with CA Student Living, introduced the project. The architects, Scott Erdy and David McHenry from Erdy McHenry Architecture, LLC, explained changes to the project.

Mark Miller and Erin Hannegan from Mitchell Matthews were also present.

The BAR had a second preliminary discussion, and continued to be very pleased with the project. Some suggestions were: Bring the terra cotta color down in places; present some alternatives for handling the corner (traffic control elements a problem) working with the W Main Street consultant; BAR members said the retail is wonderful; that exterior bike racks should prohibit overnight parking; they liked moving the bike room toward W Main Street; and liked the recessed balconies.

E. New Items

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-01-01

218 West Water Street

Tax Map 28 Parcel 84E

Water Street Shops, LLC, Owner/ Kjellstrom & Lee Construction, Applicant

New windows

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

Mark Kestner, architect, represented the applicant. He explained that the owner wished to add new windows on the South Street façade, and to replace the five existing steel windows on the Water Street façade.

Ms. Miller, Mr. Mohr, Mr. Osteen and Ms. DeLoach like the existing windows. Mr. Schwarz did not see the logic of keeping the existing windows.

The Chair confirmed informally that everyone was agreeable to the new windows on the South Street side.

Mr. Mohr said that he is against replacing with the same as the new windows above; that the new fenestration was chosen to reflect these original windows. He suggested maintaining the sense of lightness of the original design, but to bring it up to modern technology.

Ms. Miller suggested that the applicant defer the Water Street window replacement. He agreed.

Mr. Sarafin said the original windows should be documented better.

Mr. Osteen said this is a unique situation, and only a couple windows that should be done right.

Mr. Graves asked the applicant's objections to replacing the windows in-kind.

Mr. Kestner said a lot of persons were involved in the decision.

Mr. Mohr made a motion to approve the South Street windows as drawn.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (8-0) the motion.

The BAR then focused on the Water Street window replacement request.

Mr. Kestner asked if the BAR was OK with replacement if the replacement window was similar to the existing windows.

Mr. Osteen asked who felt strongly about keeping the existing windows. Ms. DeLoach, Ms. Miller, and Mr. Osteen did. The BAR wanted to see photos to show the windows are beyond repair.

Ms. Knott said she wants to see a comparison between the existing windows and proposed.

The Monticello Dairy brew pub was mentioned as an example of successful window repair. Quality Welding and Preston Carter were mentioned as possibilities for repair.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-01-02

401 East Main Street

Tax Map 53 Parcel 59

East Mall, LLC, Owner/ Fourth and Vine, LLC, Applicant

New storefront

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

Jeff Dreyfus represented the applicant. He said he is not seeking approval of the awnings or signage tonight; he wants approval of the elevations.

Ms. Knott asked if there was precedent for the corner entrance in historic photos. Mr. Dreyfus said he had not found any historic photos.

Mr. Schwarz said that nothing is being proposed that could not be reversed.

Mr. Graves said the corner treatment makes sense on this busy thoroughfare; and that it would be a great improvement.

Mr. Osteen objected to the round awnings on the second floor. Mr. Mohr, Mr. Sarafin, and Ms. Knott agreed. She said the two buildings have the same windows with surrounding ornament.

There was discussion whether the paint colors were sufficiently different, and if they would be different from the adjacent building.

Mr. Sarafin made a motion: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed new storefront design satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the signage and awning and paint color to come back to the BAR.

Ms. Miller seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (8-0) the motion.

Mr. Graves recused himself from voting on the last item and left the meeting.

Ms. Miller said she knew the applicants but felt she could be objective.

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-01-03

743 Park Street

Tax Map 52 Parcel 52

Shigehiro Oishi and Jaesook Lee, Applicants/ Robt B Hall, RN & Barbara Hamner, Owner

Demolition of addition and shed; new addition

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

Jaesook Lee represented the applicants.

There was discussion about building the new addition on the existing foundation.

There was discussion about holding the new addition off the existing house to show where the original house ended.

Ms. Knott made a motion: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolitions, I move to find that the proposed demolition of the rear screen porch, the rear roofs and the outbuilding satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the addition of documentation of the outbuilding and other parts being demolished with photos, and the outbuilding with measured drawing of the footprint and photos of details and located on the plat.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (7-0) the motion.

The BAR asked for more information from the architect: how to turn the corner, and siding materials and colors. The applicant is proposing Marvin aluminum clad wood windows, and Hardi siding.

The applicant requested deferral of the new addition.

Ms. Miller made a motion to accept the applicant's deferral.

Ms. DeLoach seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (7-0) the motion.

The BAR wants to see materials and color choices, plan drawing (including stepping the addition back at the house corner) and three elevations.

G. Other Business

7. PLACE Task Force update – Tim Mohr gave an update: Rachel Lloyd and Fred Wolf are the new Chair and Co-Chair. Richard Price is still Secretary. PLACE created several subcommittees. Minutes are posted. SIA is now part of the Comp Plan. Keller and Mohr are now allowed to vote. Some BAR members want PLACE agendas so they can attend.

Melanie Miller wants follow-up discussion with either the Building Code Official or Fire Marshal to understand why the Commonwealth Skybar tent structure was disapproved after the BAR approved it.

H. Adjournment 8:55 p.m.