CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW Regular Meeting March 18, 2014 – 5:30 p.m. City Council Chambers - City Hall

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda- None

B. Consent Agenda

- 1. Minutes December 17, 2013 and February 18, 2014
- 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application BAR 14-03-01 501 2nd Street NE Tax Parcel 330019100 Susanna Nicholson, Owner and Applicant Remove Red Maple tree and replace with American Holly

Certificate of Appropriateness Application BAR 14-03-02 503 2nd Street NE Tax Parcel 330019200 Frank and Judith Mueller, Owners and Applicants Remove Willow Oak tree

Mr. Osteen made a motion to approve the minutes from the Consent Agenda and having items # 2 and 3 pulled.

Mr. Mohr seconded the motion.

The BAR approved the minutes (5-0) on the consent agenda.

Ms. Scala provided the staff report for the two items pulled from the consent agenda and stated the items would be heard at the same time.

One of the applicants was present and showed damage that the trees are causing.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

Mr. Osteen agrees that the trees that are there are wrong for the location.

Ms. Knott feels a smaller species tree would be better instead of a holly.

Ms. Millers said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design, I move to find that the proposed removal of a Red Maple tree (to be replaced with an American Holly), and the removal of a Willow Oak tree satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the removal of the red maple to be replaced with a small species tree of the owner's choice; and approved the removal of the willow oak, as submitted.

Mr. Osteen seconded the motion

Motion approved 5-0

C. Projects in Non-Compliance – No Report

D. Preliminary Discussions

4. **Preliminary Discussion** BAR 14-03-06 201 E Market Street City of Charlottesville and County of Albemarle, Owner/ Grimm & Parker Architects, Applicant Tax Parcel 330196000 Replace Jefferson Madison Regional Library windows

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

The applicant Patricia Jessee was present and added that replacement is warranted.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

The BAR asked if they had considered restoration instead of replacement. They inquired on how often has maintenance been done on the windows. They feel the windows are not in bad shape.

This was a discussion only and no action was taken. The BAR suggested finding a different option other than replacing all the windows.

E. Deferred or Previously Considered Items

Ms. Knott arrived during discussion of the next item.

 5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (preliminary discussion Feb 2014) BAR 14-02-03 200 W Main Street Tax Parcel 280010000 William S Banowsky, Jr, Owner/Violet Crown Cinema Charlottesville, LLC, Applicant Demolish mall façade; add new façade

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

The applicant was present and stated they had cleaned up the rendering a little.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

Mr. Osteen said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed new theater facade satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the new façade as submitted, and with the following modifications: the 1996 façade is determined to be non-contributing and may be demolished; the wood soffit material shall be submitted to staff for approval; programmable LED white lighting is approved, with color lighting for special events subject to (on-site) approval.

Mr. Mohr seconded the motion

The BAR approved (6-0)

Ms. DeLoach left the meeting.

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (matters from public Feb 2014) BAR 14-03-03 Tax Parcel 330220000 310 E Market Street Aaron Burr, LLC, Owner/ Claudine Wispelwey, Applicant Courtyard Renovation

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

The applicant was present and added that they are trying to distinguish each entrance to the building.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

The BAR questioned the swinging of the door and if the gate would be operable most of the day and the applicant stated that the gate would be.

Mr. Mohr asked what type of lighting would be used and the applicant stated probably LED lighting.

Ms. Knott said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design & Elements, and Rehabilitations, I move to find that the courtyard renovation proposal satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approved the renovation as submitted, subject to BAR review of the final fence and gate design by email.

Mr. Schwarz seconded the motion

Approved (5-0)

 Certificate of Appropriateness Application (approval Feb 2014) BAR 14-02-01 17 Elliewood Avenue Tax Parcel 090089000 CKW, LLC, Owner/ Matthew McClellan, Applicant Retail Upfit - Country Club Prep

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

The applicant stated they would like to keep the larger open windows.

Mr. Schwarz feels it is a very good design, but opposes it due to the guidelines.

Mr. Mohr feels it would be better if they still had the original openings. He feels the door could be nicer. The applicant stated that the owner still has the original doors.

Mr. Osteen feels the double doors could be used if they were automatic, but handicapped access is an issue.

The BAR would like for the applicant to avoid altering the front façade.

Ms. Miller said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed new retail upfit satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC district, and that the BAR approves the proposed new retail upfit changes to shutters, conversion of door to window in the shed addition, and changes to sidelight on main entrance, but not the changes to the two window openings.

Ms. Knott seconded the motion.

The BAR approved (5-0)

 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (preliminary discussion Jan 2014; Approval of massing/site Feb 2014)
 BAR 13-11-04
 1002-06 W Main Street and 118 11th St SW
 Tax Parcel 280068000 and 280070000`
 University Station, LLC & The Ivy Land Trust, Owners/
 Campus Acquisitions Holdings, LLC, Applicant
 New construction - 1000 W Main Street – Details

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

The applicants were present and gave a brief presentation and they also went over signage.

Mr. Mohr feels that the amount of information on the signage can be simplified.

The BAR is in support of staff recommendation on the signs, but they are disappointed with the change in material.

Ms. Miller asked if there was anyway the trees could be bigger to go with the scale of the building. The applicant stated they are working with UVA to design the p ark.

Mr. Osteen said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction, I move to find that the following details satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves the following details: materials to include recycled cementitious panels, terra cotta, board-formed concrete base, window arrangement and design, lighting as submitted, picket and glass railings, landscaping to be reviewed by email, and conceptually approved per staff comments the comprehensive signage plan for future consideration.

Mr. Mohr seconded the motion

The BAR approved (5-0

9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application BAR 14-03-05 500 Court Square Court Square Condo Association, Owner/ Chris Weatherford, Applicant Tax Parcel 530096000 Change baluster material

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

The applicant was present and brought in sample material that is being proposed.

The BAR appreciates what the applicant is proposing.

Mr. Osteen said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed fiberglass baluster material satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in this district, and that the BAR approves the change in baluster material from painted copper to fiberglass as submitted.

Mr. Mohr seconded the motion

The BAR approved (5-0)

4

10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (deferred Jan 2012) BAR 14-04-07 608 Preston Place Tax Parcel 050108000 Psi Chapter of Sigma Chi Fraternity House Corp, Owner/ John Matthews, Applicant Sigma Chi Renovations and Addition

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

Ms. Valerie Long was present and provided a little more details.

There were no questions from the public.

Ms. Miller asked if the applicant had given any thought in restoring the original windows and the applicant stated that the windows aren't original and they are replacing the replacement windows.

Mr. Mohr asked if the number of bedrooms have increased and the applicant stated yes, but not the number of beds.

Comments from the public

Steve Herbert, House Corporation explained the history of the house's previous renovations.

Don Sauer, Alumni and former Planning Commission Chairperson feel the house is in desperate need of repairs.

Michael Kramer, feels the house needs an upgrade and things should be done so active brothers can enjoy living in the house.

Michael Guthrey, house company stated that the neighbors are very supportive to what is being proposed and the house really need an upgrade.

The BAR feels it is a good thing not to have people in opposition and they appreciate the changes.

Mr. Schwarz said, having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, and for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed renovation and additions satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the renovations and addition as submitted, with bollards added to protect hedges, and option to use a metal roof over the additions.

Ms. Knott seconded the motion

The BAR approved (5-0

F. New Items

11. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

 BAR 14-03-04
 852 W Main Street
 Tax Parcel 300003000
 Charlottesville Properties I, LLC, Owner/ Greenberg Farrow, Applicant
 Restaurant Upfit – World of Beer

Ms. Scala provided the staff report.

The applicant David Behrens was present and explained what is being proposed and the exterior changes to what had already been approved.

There were no questions or comments from the public.

Mr. Mohr inquired about the retaining wall and whether or not there will be a fence around the transformer.

The applicant stated that there will be a curve in the retaining wall. He also stated that the Fire Marshall has given them two alternatives in order to have fire tables.

Ms. Miller asked if the applicant had considered putting the stage towards the rear. The applicant stated they had already pulled it back from where the developer wanted it.

Mr. Osteen is really missing the five trees and feels the BAR is not getting the big things they need in this project. He would like to see a more basic design.

The BAR feels the applicant is not doing their design by the plans the BAR had approved for the developer. They suggested that the applicant ask for a deferral.

Mr. Osteen made a motion to accept the applicant's request for a deferral.

Mr. Mohr seconded the motion.

The BAR accepted (5-0) the applicant's deferral request. Some issues are curved retaining wall and wide stair; no pergola next to building; 5 Japanese Maple trees as shown on landscape plan, or 3 larger ones; need distressed wood sample; perhaps move blade sign to stair entrance; reduce sizes of wall and blade signs; accommodate street tree.

G. Other Business

12. PLACE Task Force update – Tim Mohr PLACE heard presentation of Belmont Bridge. Another presentation planned at Tom Tom festival in Belmont. Only the organizational/transparency subcommittee has met to date. W Main Street subcommittee to meet soon.

H. Adjournment 11:05 p.m.