

**City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
Minutes
November 18, 2014
City Council Chambers-City Hall**

Members Present:

Melanie Miller - Chairperson
Tim Mohr – Vice Chairperson
Carl Schwarz
Candace DeLoach
Justin Sarafin
Laura Knott
Whit Graves
Brian Hogg

Staff Present:

Mary Joy Scala

The Chairperson, Melanie Miller, called the meeting to order at 5:34.

A. Matters from the Public – No one asked to speak.

B. Consent Agenda –

1. Minutes October 21, 2014

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 13-10-01

418 17th Street NW

Tax Parcel 090008000

Beta Bridge LLC, Owner/ Daggett & Grigg Architects, Applicant

Pergola Design

Mr. Hogg move to approve the Consent Agenda (Minutes & Application), seconded by Mr. Sarafin, motion passes. 6-0-2. (Mr. Mohr and Ms. DeLoach recuse)

C. Deferred or Previously Considered Items

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-08-01

12 Elliewood Avenue

Tax parcel 090088000

Youn Soon Lee, Owner /Stephen Lee, Applicant

New front patio and paint building

The shrubs that were in front of the property in 2011 have since been removed; it is unknown when this landscaping was taken out. The applicant has also painted the

building. The paint job looks professional and with landscaping could significantly enhance the visual experience of the passerby.

The paint job looks professional and is located in a part of the street that also has unique colors (in example Para Coffee), so it could fall under #5 in the Guidelines for New Construction and Additions. With the addition of a little landscaping the color would not seem so out of place and could significantly enhance the visual experience of the passerby. Colors can always be changed.

Mr. Stephen Lee, Applicant asked the Board to please approve the color and they will plant shrubs or grass in the spring.

Mr. Hogg said the patio is the problem. One solution is to use brick to make it consistent with the other properties. A hard edge would be better.

Mr. Lee said he will go with the landscaping.

Mr. Schwarz said others have planting out front and there are shrubs in other places. He suggested put some mulch down now to keep the paint clean.

Ms. Miller said you can plant shrubs year around as long as the ground is not frozen.

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, **Mr. Schwarz** moved to find that the painting of the exterior, to approve landscaping in the Spring by staff, seconded by **Mr. Hogg**, satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC district, and to come back for administrative approval of the landscape plan in the spring, motion passes 7-1, **Ms. DeLoach** voting against.

[Tim did not speak into his microphone. Can't hear Mr. Hogg very well.]

Discussion regarding the fence along the RR tracks near the Corner parking lot.

Ms. Miller said the BAR was contacted by a Corner business owner with concerns about the design of the black metal fence recently erected along Chancellor Street at the Corner.

Mr. Hogg said it is atrocious where it goes along beside Rugby Road. He said it feels like you are walking around a prison yard.

Mr. Sarafin asked if is this something the railroad wanted.

Mr. Hogg said the City wanted it too.

Mr. Schwarz said it is the same fence that is around Friendship Court and no one has made a fuss about that.

Mr. Sarafin said what about the fencing across from the C&O restaurant where the parking lot is located.

Mr. Hogg said this type fence would be fine at a parking lot or across a vacant lot, but two feet from the sidewalk is ridiculous. There are sections that are 4 and 5 feet higher than what you see in the photograph.

Mr. Sarafin said the installation of it right against the guard rail is really awkward.

Mr. Schwarz said it is pulled back two feet maybe and a big chunk of it is three feet when you get close to Rugby Road.

Mr. Sarafin said there is not much space there and is a perfect place for trash to collect there.

Mr. Schwarz said he hates the fence just for the purpose of the fence and the fact that it is destroying connectivity in our town and he feels that's an argument with the railroad. He commented is it worth the city paying more money to put a new one in.

Mr. Hogg asked where is the argument for this to be appropriated in terms of the criteria that we use to evaluate most alterations, what possible criteria would apply to this is an appropriate change for this streetscape. He said there are none. He said spending the money, connectivity is not in the BAR purview, but what is the argument for this being appropriate.

Mr. Sarafin asked has this come before this Board before.

Mr. Hogg said the municipal government ignores the Boards they have constituted to do historic preservation. He said this is one in a long line of municipal actions that has happened without our review.

Mr. Sarafin said the project is unacceptable to have a three to four hundred thousand dollar project in the district that should've come under the purview of this Board and the first we see of it is the half mile stretch now erected on Chancellor Street.

Mr. Mohr said things like the furniture on the downtown mall from Parks and Rec are put in place without having a review from the BAR as well. He feels this should be brought up to Council.

The BAR conclusions were that, although connectivity is not within the BAR's purview, the installation of a \$300,000-400,000 project is under its purview, and this installation does not meet design guidelines. There is a fairness issue that City projects require review like other property owners. It needs to be brought up to City Council.

D. New Items

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-11-02

540 Park Street
Tax Parcel 520183000
Tobias and Lynn Dengel, Owner/ Julie Dixon, Applicant
Addition of a sunroom and two small entry porches

The applicant proposes the addition of a sunroom and two small entry porches on the rear of the house below the existing 2nd story sunroom. All will be under a low, sloped, hipped roof and will enlarge the space by 5'-6" on all sides.
The proposed addition meets the guidelines.

Julie Dixon, Architect, said they are adding metal roof to match the existing roof and to retain the existing gutter system.

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, **Mr. Graves** moved to find that the proposed new rear addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application and the metal roof will be approved administratively, seconded by **Mr. Hogg**, motion passes 8-0.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-11-01
1309 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100016000
RAAJ Charlottesville, Owner/ Darrell Slomiany, Applicant
Exterior Changes

1309 West Main Street is a non-contributing building in the West Main Street ADC District. It was built in 1966 as a Howard Johnson Hotel and Restaurant. Sometime after 1996 and before 2004 the building was renovated, and the red brick was covered over.

The current applicant is proposing to rehabilitate the building to be used as the Graduate Hotel.

The building will be painted four colors (two shades of dark gray, off-white, and pale gray-blue), and portions will be finished with new thin brick in dark charcoal gray.

All the windows on the upper floors will be retained. The existing two-story section along West Main Street will have more extensive changes, with new storefront added, and a balcony over the existing garage entrance.

New square footage will be enclosed on the roof with bronze metal siding for use as a restaurant.

Signage is permitted in the same location as the current Red Roof Inn sign, but it must be reduced in size by 30%.

The drawings need clarification – all the gray colors look too similar to distinguish. It is not clear which surfaces are being covered with thin brick.

The new appurtenance level story is not an attractive addition. Perhaps window are needed on the West Main Street elevation.

Information is needed on the new storefront materials. The railing materials should be specified.

It appears that all the signage will be changed, which will go through an administrative approval process.

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, **Ms. Schwarz** move to find that the proposed building rehabilitation changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property, and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, seconded by **Mr. Sarafin**, the BAR approved (8-0) the changes with the following modifications that will be submitted digitally for circulation to the BAR before staff approval:

1. Mechanical screen to be pulled back from West Main Street [to align with penthouse wall].
2. Provide windows on the [penthouse] West Main Street façade.
3. Provide internal spacer bars on the ground floor [SDL] windows.
4. The lower rail shall match the penthouse rail.

The BAR also made the following friendly suggestions:

1. The penthouse should be black or dark gray instead of bronze color.
2. The existing transformer to the west of Mellow Mushroom should be screened.

Brian Hogg recused himself from the next two items and left the meeting.

7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-11-03

1106 and 1108 West Main Street

Tax Parcel 100064000 and 100065000

Carr Hospitality, Owner/Austin Flajser, Applicant

Demolition of 1106 West Main Street and 1108 West Main Street,

The applicant is requesting approval to demolish the Sycamore House building. There are several addresses associated with this building and the abutting parking lot: 1102; 1106; 1108; 1106-1112.

The BAR does not consider what the possible new use of the property would be, only whether or not the building merits preservation.

Ashley Cooper represented the applicants. She said that the Sycamore House does not warrant preservation. Looking at the Studio Arts building does not contribute to the west main street corridor. The applicant did a lot of research, this was a residential district. She said it is important to think of this as a West Main sub area. She said research shows the

building was built in 1947. This is a benefit to the public to demolish this building for the redevelopment of West Main and this redevelopment follows the lead from the Battle Building.

Ms. Miller said in making a case for demolition, will there be trees added to the development. The applicant said yes, trees will be added.

Mr. Mohr doesn't feel it merits a lot of concerns because the timeline for that block is already erased.

Mr. Sarafin said it doesn't define the corner at all.

Mr. Mohr asked Ms. Scala about recording and photographing the building for preservation.

Ms. Knott asked that the applicant document the footprint and take photos before the building is demolished. She said Preservation Piedmont has an arrangement with UVA Special Collections to store the documentations.

Mr. Sarafin asked that it be documented and recorded as well.

Ms. Miller said the building meets the guidelines for demolition.

Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolition, **Mr. Mohr** moved to find that the proposed demolition of the Sycamore House Building satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application subject to documentation with a footprint drawing and photos of the building elevations and streetscape prior to demolition, seconded **Mr. Schwarz**, motion passes 7-0.

8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 14-11-03

1106 and 1108 West Main Street

Tax Parcel 100064000 and 100065000

Carr Hospitality, Owner/Austin Flajser, Applicant

Recommendation for Special Use Permit, and Preliminary Discussion

The Sycamore House (currently occupied by Studio Art Shop) is a contributing property located in the West Main Street ADC District. The Sycamore House is a two story brick building built in either 1935 (VA Historic Landmarks Commission survey form) or 1947 (applicant) for a Spotless store, and was then used for a series of restaurants.

The West Main Street ADC District was created in 1996. It is not designated as a State or National Register District.

The applicant and BAR should be aware that West Main Street is currently being studied for a new streetscape, along with a proposal for Form Based Code.

The BAR is being asked to make a recommendation regarding the proposed special use permit (SUP), and to make preliminary comments on the building and site design. The SUP goes to a public hearing on December 9, and to City Council, probably in January 2015.

Carr Hospitality has requested a special use permit for a hotel development consisting of a hotel with 150 rooms and a restaurant on the West Main Street frontage. The parking garage contains 90 spaces; 83 are required. A SUP has been requested that includes:

- additional building height (from 70 feet by-right maximum to 101 feet maximum);
- modification of the setback from 11th Street SW (reduction from 10 feet to six feet); and
- modification of the stepback on 11th Street SW (reduction from five feet to no stepback).

Mr. Mohr said plans show a 6 foot wide sidewalk from 11th street. He asked what is the actual dimension of the sidewalk, and the applicant responded, that is the actual dimension. He asked if the appurtenance is strictly mechanical.

Mr. Mohr asked if they have been coordinating with NDS, that there is no plan adopted, the plan on the wall shows the drop off, intended to be a bus stop. He said they still need a bus stop there if they can find another spot for one.

Mr. Flasier would rather have the drop off in the front on West Main Street.

Mr. Mohr said there are bike lanes to contend with.

Public Comment

Travis Pietila from the Southern Environmental Law Center –said there are concerns about the height of this proposal in regards to the West Main Street Study. The city is going through a process of developing a new form based code for West Main. The new code is being developed due to concerns about the current zoning and special use permits limits for West Main including current limits on overall heights. One of these concerns is being addressed by the proposed new zoning envelope that was presented to the public this summer showing a reduction in allowable heights from 101 feet down to 70 or 80 feet. This new hotel proposal asks for the maximum height allowed under the current zoning 101 feet plus the additional 16 feet. A form based code may not have been adopted yet but a lot of work has gone into these initial recommendations and a lot of public input. At the very least it is safe to say that it shows the community is having second thoughts whether this proposed height is appropriate for West Main and we hope you will keep this in mind as you review this proposal.

Mr. Schwarz said 11th street is not a great street, back of the parking garage, the corner decreases the setback turning it into an alley way which will prevent you from putting landscaping, 50% must have landscaping. He said there is no way of getting street trees there.

Mr. Sarafin approving the demolition, on the corner with block long backdrop of the parking garage, said he doesn't take issue with the height, if it would mask the parking garage, and that's an improvement. There really is a bit of second thoughts about the zoning we are currently working with. He really appreciates the comments from Travis, but for himself he is fine with the height. The setback on 11th warrants more discussion.

Mr. Mohr doesn't have a problem with height. He has mixed feeling with the sidewalk on 11th street which is a smaller cross street and wonders what does zoning hold for the corner across from it. He said the upper portion of the building is nice and finds the project appealing to him.

Ms. DeLoach said she does not want to see another traditional red brick building with a modern design. She commented we don't need any more red brick buildings.

Ms. Knott said the hotel will liven up that street. She has no problem with the setback and stated there are many streets that are not tree lined. She is happy with it and supports the SUP as it stands. She said trees are not necessary.

Mr. Graves is support of the setback and the height and the SUP as well

Mr. Sarafin said not requiring the setback is preferable to hide as much of the garage as possible. He said there is no room for trees and feels this is a well design building on the corner.

Mr. Schwarz said West Main Street is beautiful with the trees, even though it's a little crowded. If the trees don't survive 15 years, then replace them.

Mr. Sarafin said at the corner entry he has no issue with the setback.

Ms. Miller said she likes the pallet with the terra cotta.

Before City Council takes action to permit the proposed use, they must consider the BAR's opinion whether there are any adverse impacts to the West Main Street ADC district that could be mitigated with conditions. A special use permit is an important zoning tool that allows City Council to impose reasonable conditions to make a use more acceptable in a specific location, and to "protect the welfare, safety and convenience of the public."

The BAR recommended (5-2 with Schwarz and Miller opposed) that the proposed special use permit will not have any adverse impacts on the West Main Street ADC district. [The dissenters were concerned about the 11th Street setback/stepback modifications.]

The BAR made some preliminary comments that were generally favorable, with some disagreement over the terra cotta color. Some questioned the glass coefficient of light transmittance.

Mr. Graves moved to find that the proposed special use permit to allow additional building height (from 70 feet to 101 feet), with a modification to allow a six foot setback on 11th Street SW, and a modification to allow no stepback on 11th Street SW, for the development of a new hotel and restaurant at 1106-1108 West Main Street, will not have an adverse impact on the West Main Street Architectural Design Control (ADC) District, and the BAR recommends approval of the special use permit, subject to the usual BAR review, seconded by **Ms. Knott**, motion passes 5-2 with Schwarz and Miller opposed.

E. Other Business

9. PLACE Task Force update – Tim Mohr made a report about the most recent PLACE meeting on November 13.

10. Adoption of Revised By-laws

Motioned by Mr. Sarafin Seconded by Ms. Knott. Motion passed 7-0 to accept the by-laws as revised.

F. Adjournment 8:15 pm