

Board of Architectural Review
Minutes
March 15, 2016

Location: City Council Chambers-City Hall

Members Present: Vice-Chair-Tim Mohr; Members Justin Sarafin, Carl Schwarz, Kurt Keesecker, Whit Graves, Emma Earnst, Stephen Balut (abstained from voting)
Staff Present: Camie Mess, Preservation Assistant, Margaret Stella, Preservation Intern.

Members Absent: Chair-Melanie Miller, Laura Knott

Call to Order: 5:35 Tim Mohr calls meeting to order

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes)

B. Consent Agenda

1. Minutes February 17, 2016

Justin moves to approve the minutes with Laura's corrections, Carl Schwarz second.

C. Deferred Items

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-02-01

105 3rd Street NE

Tax Parcel 330232000

Neal Guma, Applicant/Mary Leavell, Owner

Removing the barber pole from the front of the building

Staff presented application.

Wish to remove the barber pole until they vacate the building, when they would replace it. Pole is similar to the historic vestige signs, ghost signs. Barber on downtown mall would like to have this one as his own to tribute the historic barber shop.

Owner does not like it, willing to repair and put it back when they vacate.

Public Comments/Concerns:

Rebecca Quinn: Doesn't think you should worry about mixed messages of the barber pole and the current space as an art studio. She wants it kept, and wouldn't mind it at the shop around the corner. Can it be restored and stored, then reinstalled?

Board Comments/Questions/Concerns:

Sarafin: Has the applicant talked to the Barber Shop?

Neal: They talked to the owner of the store, and she was agreeable to it.

Mohr: Likes the idea of repurposing it to the other barberpole because it is part of the downtown mall. They would have to apply to be able to stick it on their building.

Keesecker: It needs to be removed for repair anyways.

Schwarz: would like that the pole have the original address recorded on it.

Schwarz moved to find the removal of the barber pole satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with a letter of agreement (submitted to staff) between the owner of this building and the owner of a barber shop on 2nd Street NE, near central Place on the Mall, that there is an arrangement for the sign to be kept and fixed. The original address of the pole (105 3rd Street NE) should be marked inside the pole. Sarafin second. Motion passed (6-0-1, with Balut abstained.)

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 15-09-06

206 West Market Street

Tax Parcel 330270000

Biarritz, LLC, Owner/David Ackerman, Wolf Ackerman Design, Applicant

Three story addition with fire stair and partial roof deck over second story

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

n/a

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

n/a

4. **Certificate of Appropriateness**

BAR 16-02-06

1105 Park Street

Tax Parcel 470007000

Nicholas Caffericlo & Elaine Alpern, Owners/ Keith Scott, Applicant

Demolition of rear additions; new wrap around porch and rear additions

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

n/a

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Schwarz-about the addendum

Keesecker- Asks about the screen line.

Keesecker moved to find that the proposed new addition, new garage/gym building, and general site layout work satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted (with amended plans and perspectives dated 3/14/2016) with a landscape plan and roof specifications to be submitted at a later date. Schwarz amended the motion, that the landscape plan, details and specifics related to the pools and terraces to be submitted at a later date, but the proposed driveway is OK. Mohr seconded. Motion passes (6-0-1, with Balut abstained)

6:29 Schwarz is recused.

5. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-01-01

200 2nd Street SW
Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000-280075000
Powe Studio Architects, Applicant/Market Plaza LLC, Owner
Refinements to building and plaza and landscape design

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Rebecca Quinn: How far does the angled roof extend from the wall? (re: the residential entrance)

Rebecca Quinn: Residential entry way, would not like to see it at the full height to the lenth.

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Question the negative space

Powe: prefers to not make a recessed area

Keesecker: Light questions, will they go the full 30ft?

Powe: no, they won't, we are offering to light the south street sidewalk, since its half public and half private. I'm also offering to remove them. Since code says were not to light city rights of way. But the offer stands to light them.

Keesecker: its possible to make second street entrance and make some of them more important than the others, how different would it be if the 5ft was less prominent, and kept this one to the original design, would that keep the same effect?

Mohr moved to find that the proposed changes to the landscaping, site, and building satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines, and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the following changes:

- plaza material selection approved
 - lighting package with controls approved as discussed, and preferably 2700K for light fixture 2 with the rest 3000K
 - residential entrance to be revisited with other options
 - plaza benches approved
 - hanger doors approved
 - roof top garden approved
 - tree plantings approved
 - design for the residential entrance to be circulated and approved via e-mail
 - solar panels on the roof to be circulated and approved via e-mail
- Sarafin seconded. Motion passes (5-0-2, with Schwarz recused and Balut abstained)

D. New Items

6. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-03-02

800 East Market Street

Tax Parcel 530160000

City of Charlottesville, Owner/Facilities Dev./Public Works Dept., Applicant

Exterior improvements to front and west side of the site

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Mohr moved to find that the following proposed site changes satisfy the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the site plan part of the application as submitted, except that the changes below are to be circulated and to be approved administratively if possible:

- canopy redesign
 - work some signage into the canopy design – see what that means for the other signage you have, with the understanding that it’s all going to stay key to what City graphics standards are, so it is clear to the public that it is a city owned building
 - the possibility of adding more street trees
 - step material (concrete or granite would be accepted)
 - the possibility of adding more bicycle parking
- Sarafin seconded. Motion passes (6-0-1, with Balut abstained)

7. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)**
 BAR 16-03-01
 887 Locust Ave
 Tax Parcel 510002000
 Michael Fitts, Owner/Eric Rogan, Applicant
 Replace rear 2nd story porch addition

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Keesecker moved to find that the proposed new addition satisfies the BAR’s criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Neighborhood Historic Conservation District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the following modification: that the planes are broken between the addition and the original house and that the eave line is broken as well. Mohr seconded. Motion passes (6-0-1, with Balut abstained.)
[Submit a plan for the record that shows the break.]

8. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
 BAR 16-03-04
 36 University Circle
 Tax Parcel 060092000
 Margaret Nelsons Spethmann, G.P.A. , Owner/Russell Skinner, Applicant
 Renovations, including addition of a rear garage, two front dormers, enclose rear porch and update infrastructure

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Sarafin moved to find that the proposed changes to the dwelling and the new garage satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, aside from the design of the two dormers on the front façade to come back later (probably when the siding decisions possibly come back) and additional information on the condition of the existing windows, particularly on the street side façade, to come back to the BAR in the future. Mohr seconded. Motion passes (6-0-1, with Balut abstained)

9. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-03-03

513 14th Street NW

Tax Parcel 050087000

Lane Bonner, Owner/Wassenaar & Winkler Architects, Gregory Winkler, Applicant

Two story plus attic addition

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Mohr moved to find that the proposed addition does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines, because of its size, and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC district, and that the BAR does not approve the application as submitted. Schwarz seconded. Motion passes (4-2-1, with Keesecker and Graves opposed, and Balut abstained)

E. **New Construction**

10. **Certificate of Appropriateness**

BAR 15-10-08

550 East Water Street

Tax Parcel 530162300

Neal Sansovich, Owner/ Andrew Baldwin, Applicant

New Mixed-Use Complex

Staff present application.

Public Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Board Questions/Concerns/Comments:

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed new mixed-use building satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application, as submitted with the following conditions:

- Planting and lighting plan
 - Revised mortar detail
 - How the applicant intends to deal with site walls and fencing
 - Continuing design development on warming up façade on street side and west elevation.
- Keesecker seconded. Motion passes (5-0-2, with Graves recused, and Balut abstained)

Staff was asked to verify that guidelines E.2,3 in New Construction and Additions were considered. What is difference between guideline and regulation?

F. Other Business

11. **Discussion- remaining conditions**

BAR 15-08-04

NW Corner of Ridge St. and Cherry Ave.

Tax Parcel 290145000-147000, 290149000-151000, 290157000

Charlie Armstrong, Owner/ Cherry Avenue Investments LLC, Applicant

Proposed new construction of a Marriot Hotel on the NW corner intersection of Cherry Avenue and Ridge Street.

The BAR affirmed that all the remaining conditions of approval had been satisfied except two: The corner plaza brick façade and the related signage.

12. PLACE Report-

Laura Knot attended in Tim Mohr's place. Tim wrote a memo promoting 3D model for City. Kurt Keesecker attended, and presented "Five Easy Pieces." He said PLACE did not get to the other four items on the agenda.

G. Adjournment: 10:20 p.m.