

MINUTES OF THE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

MARCH 22, 1988

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOM

PRESENT

Robert Moje, Chairman
Larry Herbert
Rob Freer
Margaret Van Yahres

ABSENT

Douglas Gilpin
Jean Hiatt
Don Sours

STAFF PRESENT

Mr. Moje called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and called for the consideration of the minutes.

A. MINUTES

Mr. Freer moved approval of the minutes for the February 23, 1988 meeting with the following correction:

Page 2, 4th paragraph; change this paragraph to read "Mrs. Van Yahres mentioned the possibility of using the City's arborist to assist the Department of Community Development in reviewing the developer's plans for protection of trees." The motion was seconded by Mrs. Van Yahres and unanimously passed by all members present.

B. APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. BAR 88-2-298

1113 West Main Street
New Vertical Fence
Bernard Caperton, Applicant

Mr. Boger briefly presented the staff report and concluded his presentation by stating that the staff had no major objections to the proposed fence.

Mr. Caperton, the applicant, was presented and Mr. Freer asked him why the fence was erected differently than originally proposed.

Mr. Caperton explained that he was out of town when his wife learned that the adjoining owner had filed an application with the City to construct a fire exit at the rear of the building. At that time, she thought they ought to get moving on their fence.

Mr. Freer asked if there was still a need for the fence, since the "Mineshaft" had solved their fire escape problem by coming out the front of the building. Therefore, the fence may no longer be necessary.

Mr. Caperton said the "tunnel" has always been a haven for drunks and has looked bad for years. The fence would screen this area and prevent access to it through his property.

Mrs. Van Yahres agreed with Mr. Caperton that the fence would hide an eyesore. Mrs. Van Yahres also said that Mr. Caperton has done a good job landscaping the parking areas and the fence is compatible with this work.

Mr. Moje asked about the signs. Mr. Caperton said he would take the existing tenant signs and put them on the fence.

Mr. Moje further stated that he preferred to have the fence stained, instead of being left natural in color.

After further discussion, Mrs. Van Yahres moved to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new vertical fence as proposed with the condition that the fence be stained or bleached within a year from this date unless it has naturally turned grey. The motion was seconded by Mr. Herbert and passed by the following voted: Ayes: Moje, Van Yahres, Herbert; Noes: Freer; abstentions: 0

- 2. BAR 88-3-299 500 Park Street
First Presbyterian Church
New Vestibule
VMDO, Architects, Applicant

At the request of the applicant, this item was removed from the Agenda and will be resubmitted at a later date.

- 3. BAR 88-3-300 423-425 North First Street
Landscaping & Park Bench
Catherine T. Womack, Applicant

Mr. Boger briefly presented the staff report. Ms. Womack was presented and showed the Board photos of the proposed park bench. Ms. Womack stated that the Community Development staff had recommended some landscaping in conjunction with the special use permit application. The park bench was included in the landscape plan to develop a passive recreational space.

Mrs. Van Yahres said she would encourage that use of shade trees, which are more in keeping with the historical character of the street. The two buildings have a fairly blank facade and shrubs won't help much.

Ms. Womack expressed concern about the use of shade trees because the tenants would lose light in their dwelling units.

Mrs. Van Yahres said shade trees would actually help keep the buildings cool in the summer and hide the power lines from view. Mrs. Van Yahres also questioned if the proposed park bench was appropriate.

Mr. Herbert and Mr. Freer agreed with Mrs. Van Yahres concerning the use of shade trees. Mr. Freer also expressed concern about the design and location of the park bench.

Mr. Moje expressed concern about the park like appearance of the proposed

bench. Careful thought should be given to designing or selecting a bench that blends in with the setting. The bench should not have the appearance of being temporary but should look like it belongs in the area. For example, the bench at the corner of Queen Charlotte Square looks and feels like it belongs in that area.

Mr. Malcolm Bell, 433 N. First Street (abutting property owner) said he didn't object to the proposed bench, but the landscape plan needs a more cohesive approach to tie it all together.

Ms. Womack expressed concern about how exposed the foundations are and that is what strikes you when you first look up at the buildings. She also noted that getting the site plan approved has become more expensive then the actual landscaping and would like to know what kind of trees does the Board want.

Ms. Van Yahres said the Board wants the design of the landscape plan to be more comprehensive. The applicant needs to carefully select landscape materials that are appropriate for a historic street and delete inappropriate materials.

Mr. Moje said he thought the plan was too haphazard, and a good landscape plan should help the appearance of the buildings and this historic street.

After further discussion, Mr. Freer made the motion to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the landscape plan and park bench as submitted. The applicant should rethink the landscape plan trying to incorporate into it appropriate landscape materials such as shade trees for a downtown historic neighborhood. Also the park bench should be designed to blend into the site and surrounding residential area instead of having the appearance and feeling of being plunked down. The motion was seconded by Mrs. Van Yahres and was unanimously passed by all members present.

4. BAR 88-3-301

433 North First Street
Proposed Fence and Landscape Plan
Malcolm & Ruth Bell, Applicant

Mr. Boger briefly presented the staff report and recommendations. Mr. Bell was present and stated that he would like approval of the fence and lilac hedge. After a brief discussion with Mr. Bell on the proposed color of the fence, Mrs. Van Yahres made the motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a 3'4" picket fence and a lilac hedge along the right front property line of the site at 433 North First Street. Although white is an acceptable color for the picket fence, the Board would prefer the fence being painted Mission Grey, which would compliment the existing grey railing on this front porch. The motion was seconded by Mr. Freer and was unanimously passed by all members present.

5. BAR 88-3-302

601 Park Street
Exterior Repair
Samuel E. Darnell, Applicant (Comyn
Hall)

Mr. Boger briefly presented the staff report and recommendation. After a brief discussion on eliminating the built-in gutters on the north and south sides of the old addition, Mr. Herbert moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted. Mrs. Van Yahres seconded the motion and was unanimously passed by all members present.

6. BAR 86-4-257

605 Waston Avenue
Proposed Fence (Amendment)
Mr. James Camblos, Applicant

Mr. Boger briefly presented the staff report and recommendation. After a brief discussion with Mr. Camblos, Mr. Herbert moved to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed fence as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Freer and was unanimously passed by all members present.

7. BAR 88-3-303

222-224 Court Square
New Room
Dan Phillips, Applicant

Mr. Boger briefly reviewed the history of the project with the Board. Mr. Boger stated that the original manufacturer of the shingles is no longer in business, and the company now manufacturing the roof shingle will not guarantee the original product.

After considerable discussion with Mr. Phillips, Mr. Herbert made the motion to approve the use of the black mineral fiber shingle with the condition that a guarantee be submitted by the owners that they will keep the slate-like appearance and if the product fades, chips, warps, etc., the owners will take immediate corrective action, otherwise the existing slate shingles must be replaced with slate. The motion was seconded by Mr. Freer and was unanimously passed by all members present.

C. OTHER BUSINESS

Queen Charlotte Square - There was a brief discussion on the awnings recently erected on the E. Jefferson Street side of Queen Charlotte Square. It was the unanimous opinion of all members present that the awnings were not approved by the Board. The Board requests the staff to inform the developer that the awnings had not been approved.

D. MATTERS BROUGHT BY THE PUBLIC NOT ON THE AGENDA

There were none

E. CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

There was none

F. BOARD MEMBERS' REPORTS

There were none

G. DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT REPORT

There was none

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

FMB/adb