City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review Staff Memo September 15, 2020



Preliminary Discussion on Requested Certificate of Appropriateness

0 Preston Place, TMP 050118001 and 050118002 Rugby Rd-University Cir-Venable ADC District Owner: Preston Place Properties, LLC Applicant: Leigh Boyes Project: New residence



Background

Year Built:n/a, vacant lotsDistrict:Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADCStatus:n/a

Prior BAR Reviews

<u>August 14, 2017</u> – BAR approved moving <u>to</u> 0 Preston Place the house, porch, chimneys, and east side additions located at 605 Preston Avenue.

Application

• Submittal: Sage Designs drawings *Lewis Residence*, dated February 3, 2022: Sheets S1.1; A1.1; A1.2; A2.1; and A2.2.

Preliminary discussion for proposed new residence.

Discussion

This is a preliminary discussion, no BAR action is required; however, by consensus, the BAR may express an opinion about the project as presented. (For example, the BAR might express consensus support for elements of the project, such as its scale and massing.) Such comments will not constitute a formal motion and the result will have no legal bearing, nor will it represent an incremental decision on the required CoA.

There are two key objectives of a preliminary discussion: Introduce the project to the BAR; and allow the applicant and the BAR to establish what is necessary for a successful final submittal. That is, a final submittal that is complete and provides the information necessary for the BAR to evaluate the project using the ADC District Design Guidelines and related review criteria.

In response to any questions from the applicant and/or for any recommendations to the applicant, the BAR should rely on the germane sections of the ADC District Design Guidelines and related review criteria. While elements of other chapters may be relevant, staff recommends that the BAR refer to the criteria in Chapter II--*Site Design and Elements* and Chapter III--*New Construction and Additions*. Of particular assistance, as a checklist for the preliminary discussion, are the criteria from Chapter III:

- A. Building Types within the Historic Districts: Residential Infill
- B. Setback
- C. Spacing
- D. Massing and Footprint
- E. Height and Width
- F. Scale
- G. Roof
- H. Orientation
- I. Windows and Doors
- J. Porches
- L. Foundation and Cornice
- M. Materials and Textures
- N. Paint [Color palette]
- O. Details and Decoration

From the drawings (to assist with discussion only):

- Roof: Metal, standing seam, dark bronze
- Gutters: K-style or half round
- Downspouts:
- Exterior walls:
 - Base and portion of main house: Field stone
 - o Cement fiber siding, painted
- Trim:
- Columns:
- Cupolas:
- Trellis:
- Doors and windows: Clad wood
- Shutters: Operable, painted.
- Garage doors:
- Lighting:
- Driveway: pea gravel
- Plantings:
- Patios and walks:

Spatial Elements

- Setbacks: Within 20 percent of the setbacks of a majority of the neighborhood dwellings.
 - Average front setback is 43 feet, ranging between 10 feet and 80 feet. The recommended setback for the new building would be between 35 feet and 51 feet.
 - The proposed residence setback is **approximately** 60 feet.
- Spacing: Within 20 percent of the average spacing between houses on the block.
 - Average side spacing is 38 feet, ranging between 22 feet and 62 feet. The recommended spacing for the new building would be between 30 feet and 46 feet from the adjacent buildings.
 - The proposed residence spacing [from 620 Preston Place] is **approximately** 30 feet.
- Massing and Footprint: Relate to the majority of the surrounding historic dwellings.
 - Not including the Preston Court apartments [with a footprint of 42,50 square feet], the average footprint is 2,085 square feet, ranging from 961 square feet to 4,404 square feet. [Three building exceed 3,500 square feet.]
 - The proposed building will have a footprint of **approximately** 4,000 square feet.
- Height and Width: Keep the height and width within a maximum of 200 percent of the prevailing height and width.
 - **Height**. The prevailing height is two stories, with the adjacent apartments at four stories. The recommended max height of the new building would be four stories.
 - The proposed residence will be two stories
 - Width. Not including the adjacent apartments [150 feet facing Grady Avenue and 100 feet facing Preston Place], the average building width is 54 feet, ranging between 32 feet and 104 feet. The recommended max width of the new building would be 108 feet.
 - The proposed building will be approximately 156 feet wide, broken by a 20 foot porte cochere.



Suggested Motions

For a preliminary discussion, the BAR cannot take action on a formal motion.

Criteria, Standards, and Guidelines

Relevant Code provision for Preliminary Discussion

Sec. 34-282. - Application procedures.

(c) A pre-application conference with the entire BAR is mandatory for the following activities proposed within a major design control district: (4) Development having a projected construction cost of three hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$350,000.00) or more;

Review Criteria Generally

Sec. 34-284(b) of the City Code states that, in considering a particular application the BAR shall approve the application unless it finds:

- (1) That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this division or applicable provisions of the Design Guidelines established by the board pursuant to Sec.34-288(6); and
- (2) The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the protected property that is the subject of the application.

Pertinent Standards for Review of Construction and Alterations include:

- (1) Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable design control district;
- (2) The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs and signs;
- (3) The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;
- (4) The effect of the proposed change on the historic district neighborhood;
- (5) The impact of the proposed change on other protected features on the property, such as gardens, landscaping, fences, walls and walks;
- (6) Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;
- (7) Any applicable provisions of the City's Design Guidelines.

Pertinent ADC District Design Guidelines

Chapter 1 Introduction (Part 1) Chapter 1 Introduction (Part 2) Chapter 2 Site Design and Elements Chapter 3 New Construction and Additions

Chapter II – Site Design and Elements

Chapter III – New Construction and Additions A. Introduction

3. Building Types within the Historic Districts

^{• • •}

When designing new buildings in the historic districts, one needs to recognize that while there is an overall distinctive district character, there is, nevertheless, a great variety of historic building types, styles, and scales throughout the districts and sub-areas that are described in Chapter 1: Introduction. Likewise, there are several types of new construction that might be constructed within the districts the design parameters of these new buildings will differ depending on the following types:

b. Residential Infill

These buildings are new dwellings that are constructed on the occasional vacant lot within a block of existing historic houses. Setback, spacing, and general massing of the new dwelling are the most important criteria that should relate to the existing historic structures, along with residential roof and porch forms.

- B. Setback
- 1) Construct new commercial buildings with a minimal or no setback in order to reinforce the traditional street wall.
- 2) Use a minimal setback if the desire is to create a strong street wall or setback consistent with the surrounding area.
- 3) Modify setback as necessary for sub-areas that do not have well-defined street walls.
- 4) Avoid deep setbacks or open corner plazas on corner buildings in the downtown in order to maintain the traditional grid of the commercial district.
- 5) In the West Main Street corridor, construct new buildings with a minimal (up to 15 feet according to the zoning ordinance) or no setback in order to reinforce the street wall. If the site adjoins historic buildings, consider a setback consistent with these buildings.
- 6) On corners of the West Main Street corridor, avoid deep setbacks or open corner plazas unless the design contributes to the pedestrian experience or improves the transition to an adjacent residential area.
- 7) New buildings, particularly in the West Main Street corridor, should relate to any neighborhoods adjoining them. Buffer areas should be considered to include any screening and landscaping requirements of the zoning ordinance.
- 8) At transitional sites between two distinctive areas of setback, for instance between new commercial and historic commercial, consider using setbacks in the new construction that reinforce and relate to setbacks of the historic buildings.
- 9) For new governmental or institutional buildings, either reinforce the street wall through a minimal setback, or use a deep setback within a landscaped area to emphasize the civic function of the structure.
- 10) Keep residential setbacks within 20 percent of the setbacks of a majority of neighborhood dwellings.

C. Spacing

- 1) Maintain existing consistency of spacing in the area. New residences should be spaced within 20 percent of the average spacing between houses on the block.
- 2) Commercial and office buildings in the areas that have a well-defined street wall should have minimal spacing between them.
- 3) In areas that do not have consistent spacing, consider limiting or creating a more uniform spacing in order to establish an overall rhythm.

- 4) Multi-lot buildings should be designed using techniques to incorporate and respect the existing spacing on a residential street.
- D. Massing and Footprint
- 1) New commercial infill buildings' footprints will be limited by the size of the existing lot in the downtown or along the West Main Street corridor. Their massing in most cases should be simple rectangles like neighboring buildings.
- 2) New infill construction in residential sub-areas should relate in footprint and massing to the majority of surrounding historic dwellings.
- 3) Neighborhood transitional buildings should have small building footprints similar to nearby dwellings.
 - a. If the footprint is larger, their massing should be reduced to relate to the smallerscaled forms of residential structures.
 - b. Techniques to reduce massing could include stepping back upper levels, adding residential roof and porch forms, and using sympathetic materials.
- 4) Institutional and multi-lot buildings by their nature will have large footprints, particularly along the West Main Street corridor and in the 14th and 15th Street area of the Venable neighborhood.
 - a. The massing of such a large scale structure should not overpower the traditional scale of the majority of nearby buildings in the district in which it is located.
 - b. Techniques could include varying the surface planes of the buildings, stepping back the buildings as the structure increases in height, and breaking up the roof line with different elements to create smaller compositions.
- E. Height and Width
- 1) Respect the directional expression of the majority of surrounding buildings. In commercial areas, respect the expression of any adjacent historic buildings, which generally will have a more vertical expression.
- 2) Attempt to keep the height and width of new buildings within a maximum of 200 percent of the prevailing height and width in the surrounding sub-area.
- 3) In commercial areas at street front, the height should be within 130 percent of the prevailing average of both sides of the block. Along West Main Street, heights should relate to any adjacent contributing buildings. Additional stories should be stepped back so that the additional height is not readily visible from the street.
- 4) When the primary façade of a new building in a commercial area, such as downtown, West Main Street, or the Corner, is wider than the surrounding historic buildings or the traditional lot size, consider modulating it with bays or varying planes.
- 5) Reinforce the human scale of the historic districts by including elements such as porches, entrances, storefronts, and decorative features depending on the character of the particular sub-area.
- 6) In the West Main Street corridor, regardless of surrounding buildings, new construction should use elements at the street level, such as cornices, entrances, and display windows, to reinforce the human scale.
- F. Scale

- 1) Provide features on new construction that reinforce the scale and character of the surrounding area, whether human or monumental. Include elements such as storefronts, vertical and horizontal divisions, upper story windows, and decorative features.
- 2) As an exception, new institutional or governmental buildings may be more appropriate on a monumental scale depending on their function and their site conditions.

G. Roof

- 1) Roof Forms and Pitches
 - a. The roof design of new downtown or West Main Street commercial infill buildings generally should be flat or sloped behind a parapet wall.
 - b. Neighborhood transitional buildings should use roof forms that relate to the neighboring residential forms instead of the flat or sloping commercial form.
 - c. Institutional buildings that are freestanding may have a gable or hipped roof with variations.
 - d. Large-scale, multi-lot buildings should have a varied roof line to break up the mass of the design using gable and/or hipped forms.
 - e. Shallow pitched roofs and flat roofs may be_appropriate in historic residential areas on a contemporary designed building.
 - f. Do not use mansard-type roofs on commercial buildings; they were not used historically in Charlottesville's downtown area, nor are they appropriate on West Main Street.
- 2) Roof Materials: Common roof materials in the historic districts include metal, slate, and composition shingles.
 - a. For new construction in the historic districts, use traditional roofing materials such as standing-seam metal or slate.
 - b. In some cases, shingles that mimic the appearance of slate may be acceptable.
 - c. Pre-painted standing-seam metal roof material is permitted, but commercial-looking ridge caps or ridge vents are not appropriate on residential structures.
 - d. Avoid using thick wood cedar shakes if using wood shingles; instead, use more historically appropriate wood shingles that are thinner and have a smoother finish.
 - e. If using composition asphalt shingles, do not use light colors. Consider using neutralcolored or darker, plain or textured-type shingles.
 - f. The width of the pan and the seam height on a standing-seam metal roof should be consistent with the size of pan and seam height usually found on a building of a similar period.
- 3) Rooftop Screening
 - a. If roof-mounted mechanical equipment is used, it should be screened from public view on all sides.
 - b. The screening material and design should be consistent with the design, textures, materials, and colors of the building.
 - c. The screening should not appear as an afterthought or addition the building.
- H. Orientation
- 1) New commercial construction should orient its façade in the same direction as adjacent historic buildings, that is, to the street.
- 2) Front elevations oriented to side streets or to the interior of lots should be discouraged.

I. Windows and Doors

- 1) The rhythm, patterns, and ratio of solids (walls) and voids (windows and doors) of new buildings should relate to and be compatible with adjacent historic facades.
 - a. The majority of existing buildings in Charlottesville's historic districts have a higher proportion of wall area than void area except at the storefront level.
 - b. In the West Main Street corridor in particular, new buildings should reinforce this traditional proportion.
- 2) The size and proportion, or the ratio of width to height, of window and door openings on new buildings' primary facades should be similar and compatible with those on surrounding historic facades.
 - a. The proportions of the upper floor windows of most of Charlottesville's historic buildings are more vertical than horizontal.
 - b. Glass storefronts would generally have more horizontal proportions than upper floor openings.
- 3) Traditionally designed openings generally are recessed on masonry buildings and have a raised surround on frame buildings. New construction should follow these methods in the historic districts as opposed to designing openings that are flush with the rest of the wall.
- 4) Many entrances of Charlottesville's historic buildings have special features such as transoms, sidelights, and decorative elements framing the openings. Consideration should be given to incorporating such elements in new construction.
- 5) Darkly tinted mirrored glass is not an appropriate material for windows in new buildings within the historic districts.
- 6) If small-paned windows are used, they should have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with permanently affixed interior and exterior muntin bars and integral spacer bars between the panes of glass.
- 7) Avoid designing false windows in new construction.
- 8) Appropriate material for new windows depends upon the context of the building within a historic district, and the design of the proposed building. Sustainable materials such as wood, aluminum-clad wood, solid fiberglass, and metal windows are preferred for new construction. Vinyl windows are discouraged.
- 9) Glass shall be clear. Opaque spandrel glass or translucent glass may be approved by the BAR for specific applications.

J. Porches

- 1) Porches and other semi-public spaces are important in establishing layers or zones of intermediate spaces within the streetscape.
- L. Foundation and Cornice
- 1) Distinguish the foundation from the rest of the structure through the use of different materials, patterns, or textures.
- 2) Respect the height, contrast of materials, and textures of foundations on surrounding historic buildings.
- 3) If used, cornices should be in proportion to the rest of the building.

- 4) Wood or metal cornices are preferred. The use of fypon may be appropriate where the location is not immediately adjacent to pedestrians.
- M. Materials and Textures
- 1) The selection of materials and textures for a new building should be compatible with and complementary to neighboring buildings.
- 2) In order to strengthen the traditional image of the residential areas of the historic districts, brick, stucco, and wood siding are the most appropriate materials for new buildings.
- 3) In commercial/office areas, brick is generally the most appropriate material for new structures. "Thin set" brick is not permitted. Stone is more commonly used for site walls than buildings.
- 4) Large-scale, multi-lot buildings, whose primary facades have been divided into different bays and planes to relate to existing neighboring buildings, can have varied materials, shades, and textures.
- 5) Synthetic siding and trim, including, vinyl and aluminum, are not historic cladding materials in the historic districts, and their use should be avoided.
- 6) Cementitious siding, such as HardiPlank boards and panels, are appropriate.
- 7) Concrete or metal panels may be appropriate.
- 8) Metal storefronts in clear or bronze are appropriate.
- 9) The use of Exterior Insulation and Finish Systems (EIFS) is discouraged but may be approved on items such as gables where it cannot be seen or damaged. It requires careful design of the location of control joints.
- 10) The use of fiberglass-reinforced plastic is discouraged. If used, it must be painted.
- 11) All exterior trim woodwork, decking and flooring must be painted, or may be stained solid if not visible from public right-of-way.
- N. Paint [Color palette]
- 1) The selection and use of colors for a new building should be coordinated and compatible with adjacent buildings, not intrusive.
- 2) In Charlottesville's historic districts, various traditional shaded of brick red, white, yellow, tan, green, or gray are appropriate. For more information on colors traditionally used on historic structures and the placement of color on a building, see Chapter 4: Rehabilitation.
- 3) Do not paint unpainted masonry surfaces.
- 4) It is proper to paint individual details different colors.
- 5) More lively color schemes may be appropriate in certain sub-areas dependent on the context of the sub-areas and the design of the building.
- O. Details and Decoration
- 1) Building detail and ornamentation should be consistent with and related to the architecture of the surrounding context and district.
- 2) The mass of larger buildings may be reduced using articulated design details.
- 3) Pedestrian scale may be reinforced with details.















MATERIALS COLOR SCHEME -PAINTED (LIKELY WHITE) CEMENT FIBER BOARD SIDING, PAINTED (LIKELY WHITE) TRIM, PAINTED (LIKELT WHITE) TRIM, PAINTED (LIKELT WHITE) TRIM, MIX OF GRAYS & BROWNS FIELD STONE, DARK BRONZE METAL ROOF, GUTTERS & DOWNSPOUTS, BLUESTONE PAVERS, GRANITE COBBLESTONES, GRAY PEA GRAVEL.

