

**Werner, Jeffrey B**

---

**From:** Werner, Jeffrey B  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 22, 2024 2:53 PM  
**To:** Jim Shideler  
**Subject:** BAR Action - 207 14th Street, NW

May 22, 2024  
[via email]

Certificate of Appropriateness  
BAR # 24-05-01  
207 14th Street, NW; TMP 090070100  
Rugby Rd-University Cir-Venable ADC District (non-contributing)  
Owner: University Hotel Management LLC  
Applicant: Jim Shideler  
Project: Mural on east elevation

Mr. Shidler.

The CoA for the above referenced project was reviewed by the City of Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review on May 21, 2024. The following action was taken:

Motion to accept applicant’s request for deferral: Schwarz. Second: Bailey. Vote: 8-0.  
Note: In accepting the request for deferral, the BAR also expressed unanimous support for a mural at the proposed location; however, because the actual artwork has not been developed and citing the design guidelines [Chapter 6, Section J, as it relates to murals], the matter was deferred to allow the BAR to formally review the artwork when ready.

For specifics of the discussion, the meeting video is on-line at the link below. This discussion starts at approximately 00:51:00.

<https://boxcast.tv/channel/vabajtzezuuv3iclkx1a?b=votxamw5ejjsilzrhjix>

When the proposed artwork is ready, let me know and we can coordinate the BAR review. We’ll need only the artwork, no new fee or application are necessary for a deferred item. Below is the meeting schedule (with submittal deadlines) for the remainder of 2024.

<b>2024 BAR schedule</b>	
<b>Meeting Date</b>	<b>Submittal Deadline</b>
Tuesday, June 18, 2024	Tuesday, May 28, 2024
Tuesday, July 16, 2024	Tuesday, June 25, 2024
Tuesday, August 20, 2024	Tuesday, July 30, 2024
Tuesday, September 17, 2024	Tuesday, August 27, 2024
Tuesday, October 15, 2024	Tuesday, September 24, 2024
Tuesday, November 19, 2024	Tuesday, October 29, 2024
Tuesday, December 17, 2024	Tuesday, November 26, 2024

If you have any questions, please contact me at [wernerjb@charlottesville.gov](mailto:wernerjb@charlottesville.gov).

Sincerely,  
Jeff

-----  
Jeff Werner, AICP  
Historic Preservation and Design Planner  
City of Charlottesville  
Neighborhood Development Services  
City Hall | P.O. Box 911  
610 East Market Street  
Charlottesville, VA 22902  
Phone: 434.970.3130  
Email: [wernerjb@charlottesville.gov](mailto:wernerjb@charlottesville.gov)

**City of Charlottesville  
Board of Architectural Review  
Staff Report  
May 21, 2024**



**Certificate of Appropriateness**

BAR # 24-05-01

207 14th Street, NW; TMP 090070100

Rugby Rd-University Cir-Venable ADC District (non-contributing)

Owner: University Hotel Management LLC

Applicant: Jim Shideler

Project: Mural on east elevation

---



**Background**

Year Built: 1964 (constructed as a hotel)

District: Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable ADC District

Status: Non-contributing

**Prior BAR Reviews**

February 15, 2022 – SUP request (22-00003) to allow use as a hotel. BAR recommended to City Council the proposed SUP will not adversely impact the ADC District, with the understanding that later alterations to the site or structure require BAR review and an approved CoA.

July 19, 2022 – BAR approved CoA for exterior alterations. (See images in Appendix)

**Application**

Request CoA for a painted mural (within area of approximately 8-ft x 8-ft) on the east elevation, facing 14<sup>th</sup> Street.

**Discussion and Recommendation**

The building's masonry walls are painted. The proposed mural will not obscure or interfere with architectural element. Staff recommends approval of the CoA with the condition that prior to installation of the mural the applicant review with staff a draft of the artwork to:

- a) confirm it does not constitute a commercial sign (if so, the City's sign regs will prevail); and
- b) the colors and content are appropriate for the district (if staff finds they conflict, the matter will be referred to the BAR for a decision, but that referral will not require a formal resubmittal).

### **Suggested Motions**

*Approval:* Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed wall mural at 207 14th Street, NW satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR [approves the request].

Or [approves the request with the conditions recommended by staff].

*Denial:* Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed wall mural at 207 14<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the ADC District, and that for the following reasons the BAR denies the request: [...]

### **Criteria, Standards, and Guidelines**

#### **Review Criteria Generally**

Per Chapter 34, Div. 5.2.7. C.2:

- a. In considering a particular application the BAR will approve the application unless it finds:
  - i. That the proposal does not meet specific standards set forth within this Section or applicable provisions of the City's design guidelines; and
  - ii. The proposal is incompatible with the historic, cultural or architectural character of the district in which the property is located or the IPP that is the subject of the application.
- b. The BAR will approve, approve with conditions, or deny applications for Certificates of Appropriateness in accordance with the provisions of this Section.
- c. The BAR, or City Council on appeal, may require conditions of approval as are necessary or desirable to ensure that any new construction or addition is compatible with the scale and character of the Architecture Design Control District, Individually Protected Property, or Historic Conservation District. Prior to attaching conditions to an approval, due consideration will be given to the cost of compliance with the proposed conditions as well as the goals of the Comprehensive Plan. Conditions may require a reduction in height or massing, consistent with the City's design guidelines and subject to the following limitations: [Not germane to this request.]

#### **Standards for Review and Decision**

Per Chapter 34, Div. 5.2.7. D.1:

- a. Review of the proposed construction, reconstruction, alteration or restoration of a building or structure is limited to exterior architectural features, including signs, and the following features and factors:
  - i. Whether the material, texture, color, height, scale, mass, and placement of the proposed addition, modification or construction are visually and architecturally compatible with the site and the applicable District;
  - ii. The harmony of the proposed change in terms of overall proportion and the size and placement of entrances, windows, awnings, exterior stairs, and signs;
  - iii. The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant;

- iv. The effect of the proposed change on the adjacent building or structures;
- v. The impact of the proposed change on other protected features on the property, such as gardens, landscaping, fences, walls, and walks;
- vi. Whether the proposed method of construction, renovation, or restoration could have an adverse impact on the structure or site, or adjacent buildings or structures;
- vii. When reviewing any proposed sign as part of an application under consideration, the standards set forth within Div. 4.11. Signs will be applied; and
- viii. Any applicable provisions of the City’s design guidelines.

**ADC District Design Guidelines**

[Chapter 1 Introduction \(Part 1\)](#)

[Chapter 1 Introduction \(Part 2\)](#)

[Chapter 2 Site Design and Elements](#)

[Chapter 3 New Construction and Additions](#)

[Chapter 4 Rehabilitation](#)

[Chapter 5 Signs, Awnings, Vending, and Cafes](#)

[Chapter 6 Public Improvements](#)

[Chapter 7 Moving and Demolition](#)

**Pertinent Design Review Guidelines for Public Design and Improvements:**

Chapter 6 Public Improvements

J. Public Art, Statues, & Fountains

1. Maintain existing features related to public art, statues and fountains.
2. Public art is preferred that offers a place-making role in celebrating and communicating the history and culture of the districts.
3. Develop an appropriate relationship between materials, the scale of artwork and the surrounding environment.
4. Choose artwork that is appropriate for the current general character of the site.
5. Consider the appropriateness of the sculpture base.
6. Public art, statues, and fountains shall be maintained as accessible to the public.
7. A mural’s appearance, materials, colors, size, and scale should be compatible with the building and historic district of which the building is a part.
8. The use of neon, luminescent, or reflective paint or materials is discouraged.
9. A mural should not obscure or distort the historic features of a building, and should not cover an entire wall.
10. Murals painted on primary facades are rarely permitted and strongly discouraged.
11. In general, previously unpainted masonry should be left unpainted.
12. Painting directly onto the walls of a non-contributing building, or adding a mural to a previously-painted, non-primary elevation of a contributing building will be considered on a case-by-case basis.
13. In general, murals should be created on removable material, not directly on a building wall; installed on framing that allows water to weep between the mural and the wall; and attachments should not irrevocably damage the building.
14. Mural art that constitutes a sign shall conform to the sign regulations.

**Appendix:** From the July 2022 CoA request for exterior alterations

Existing 14<sup>th</sup> Street elevation (2022)



Approved alterations to 14<sup>th</sup> Street elevation (2022)



Proposed mural created by the "Charlottesville Mural Project" on the front side of the hotel building at 207 14th Street NW (facing 14th street) on the upper left side of the frontage of the building. This will not be a sign of any sort that would promote the hotel or anything else, nor would it be political in nature in any shape or form, but simply an @ 8'x8' decorative mural which would embrace the color theming and style of the 1960's timeframe, which is the theming of the mid-century modern hotel. Image below indicates proposed location.



Mural will not encroach on belt course, window, or other architectural elements.







View south on 14th Street, NW



View north on 14th Street, NW