

**BAR MINUTES
CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
January 17, 2024 – 5:00 PM
Hybrid Meeting (In person at City Space & virtual via Zoom)**



Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). Due to the current public health emergency, this meeting is being held online via Zoom and in person at City Space. The meeting process will be as follows: For each item, staff will make a brief presentation followed by the applicant’s presentation, after which members of the public will be allowed to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves and give their current address. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to speak. Public comments should be limited to the BAR’s jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR’s discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

Members Present: Tyler Whitney, Carl Schwarz, Breck Gastinger, James Zehmer, David Timmerman, Ron Bailey, Cheri Lewis
Staff Present: Patrick Cory, Remy Trail, Jeff Werner
Pre-Meeting:

There was discussion surrounding the items on the agenda.

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 PM/

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda.

No Comments from the Public

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Meeting Minutes November 2023

Ms. Lewis moved to approve the Consent Agenda – Second by Mr. Bailey – Motion passes 6-0 with one abstention (Mr. Schwarz).

C. Deferred Items

No Items

D. New Items

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR # 24-01-01

416-418 West Main Street, TMP 290012000

Downtown ADC District

Owner: A. Cadgene and G. Silverman, Main Street Ltd Tr

Applicant: Greg Jackson, TOPIA Design

Project: Canopies, decks, and patios at north and west facades

Jeff Werner, Staff Report – Request Certificate of Appropriateness for Canopies, decks, and patios at north and west facades:

- A. Canopy over an existing restaurant patio on the northeast corner.
- B. Canopy over the sidewalk and entrance to the upstairs suite on the north side.
- C. Canopy over the entrance patio of a bakery on the northwest corner.
- D. Deck and canopy over the drive and serving the new second level on the west. The center window converts to a door.
- E. Patio and deck for a rear space on the southwest corner.

Greg Jackson, Applicant – The scaffolding that we have up there for construction of the upper addition has a mockup character to it, at least for the central canopy that we're talking about across the sidewalk. We came with a canopy with similar material as 420 West Main Street, a little bit of a canopy over Albemarle Baking Company, and a side deck and canopy. Some of the comments were to go to steel. We have wood for Orzo. There was a feeling that the lighter weight of steel added to the success of 420 and the character of the buildings in that area. There also was a suggestion to explore continuing the canopy across the building façade and maybe even widen out at Albemarle Baking Company to balance out with Orzo. We explored that. With the side, for those who saw it, it had a partial deck and a canopy over the back part of the deck. Some of it was raised and had steps. We leveled that out as suggested and brought the canopy down to align with the lower part of the clear story that is going around the upper addition. Before, we had stepped it up so the canopy over that deck would align with the roof line of the new addition. We now have it with leveling out the deck. We have it aligned to make it work with a flat deck all the way across. What we have also done with that deck is add more of an opaque type of railing for the back side of it and open towards the front. To carry that sentiment of maybe doing more than what we presented at the last meeting, we did what the client has been wanting to do in adding something where the old fish market is back there. There is a cooler occupying that space. There is a desire that all this to improve the exterior space to put a patio and an upper deck that would serve the upper floor of that domed space there. Those are all the different components, decks, and canopies that we are looking at presenting. We are using the same type of language of the metal, of the tube. We're going to go for darker gray. We're proposing a darker color, probably towards a warmer gray. This has a nod to a softer color. Orzo had wanted wood. We have wood pearlins in this design. There is a layer of wood in the pearl level that is above the rafters and below the white poly roof. It would be there at a regular rhythm 3 feet on center. We covered a lot that was suggested. It has a comprehensive layout. Some of the initial images are context. On this image, you can see that the side deck is now flat with the canopy roof lowered. It is set back. We didn't want to bring it into the side of the building. There is a desire not to have it fully open but have some area that is covered for that upper area. That canopy on the side deck sets back coming from the corner of the existing building. There are columns that hold for the front part of the poly roof and metal framing. There are columns of 3 over Orzo coming out of the existing brick planters that are there with the wooden slats. It is constructed coming off those. There are 2 columns off the Albemarle Baking Company. For the stretch between those two, they are supported by gables or pipes. That was suggested by the structural engineer and lends to the character of those types of canopies. With the old fish market building, those are all enclosed with a cement panel railing. It is like what we have done across the street. We're looking at using that for that back section. We have it in the back of that upper deck on the side. We are trying to have a little bit of enclosure knowing that the parking is there. There is a lot of activity. Those are the type of railings for those decks. We do enclose the patio down below in that back parking area. That illustrates the same construction method throughout these, which are slightly different from what we did at 420. There was a call for simplicity. This is simple architecture of post and beam and rafter and perins for such a roof. They are tube construction and tube elements, 6X6 and 4X10 and 4X6. The perins are roughly 2X2.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC

No Questions from the Public

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD

Mr. Whitney – With the wood pearings, are those intended to be painted?

Mr. Jackson – They will probably be stained and sealed so that there is a consistency to try to get to a desired medium, dark brown.

Mr. Whitney – Is it a similar dark color to the steel below?

Mr. Jackson – Yes, in tone. It will have some wood feel to it.

Mr. Whitney – The side deck is intended to rest on the neighboring building.

Mr. Jackson – That is correct. We walked through that with the engineer. The thought was with that outer wall addition to that building, we can extend up from those blocks and create a resting pad, probably just one layer of blocks running across there to support that so that it will rest on its neighbor.

Mr. Timmerman – You have a wood decking. What kind of wood is that?

Mr. Jackson – EPay is what we're talking about. The suggested framing for that will be a steel super-structure with wood framing in there. We will put the decking on top of that.

Mr. Timmerman – When you look up from underneath, you're going to see a steel structure and then you will see the wood. The wood decking will be exposed.

Mr. Jackson – That is correct.

Mr. Timmerman – With the polycarbonate, you said that is the same that you put in across the street.

Mr. Jackson – That is correct.

Mr. Timmerman – What is that product? Is that a cow wall? I haven't looked at it too closely.

Mr. Jackson – It is manufactured. We started using it on other projects and kept going. It is made in Texas. They keep changing their individual names. They call their company Cover Your Pergola. There are different types of products within their line.

Mr. Timmerman – My last question is about the pull-in. Is that 3 or 4 parking spaces? Is that going to remain as parking? Was the intent to keep that as parking? What is that courtyard going to be used for?

Allan Cadgene, Applicant – The intent was to keep all the parking.

Mr. Jackson – The intent is to keep all that functioning as it is. The canopies are extending out to the areas that are pedestrian. The parking and the circular drive are maintained.

Mr. Timmerman – I was looking at one of the pictures. It has the trees in the front. Are all those trees in the same position? Currently, what you do is that you pull in over that section that is white. I am assuming that is a new paver that leads into the Albemarle Baking Company.

Mr. Jackson – Yes. It is interesting if you walk out there. There are a lot of different paving surfaces. The vehicles drive over several different surfaces, especially when you go around back. We're going to clean it up quite a bit. It is going to be left. There is material going from the sidewalk off the street from Albemarle Baking Company.

Mr. Timmerman – I was wondering if that parking or treescape was changing. It doesn't look like it other than you might put new paving in leading to the Albemarle Baking Company.

Mr. Jackson – You can see from that image shown, the drone shot that the vehicle drives over that area. There is a little bit of paved. It is a little bit of a gray area there as you drive over the sidewalk to get into the space.

Mr. Zehmer – Your renderings have 2 different colors for the driveway to the back parking lot. In some images, it is shown as red. In other images, it is gray or white with paving blocks. What is your intent there?

Mr. Jackson – We haven't discussed this much. There is a lot of construction going on right through there now. There is the red-stamped pavement that is further back. I can imagine that being continued to the street.

Mr. Cadgene – What you show in front of the bakery, that would remain asphalt at the very beginning of it. Since it is not raised up there, you must drive through there. There is some concrete sidewalk there now.

Mr. Jackson – I think that he is talking about the drive to the rear parking lot.

Mr. Cadgene – I get that is stamp concrete. That should be red.

Mr. Jackson – We would take what is in front of the building back if you look at that aerial photo and bring that to the street.

Mr. Cadgene – That area was beat up because we decided it was an appropriate time to underground the utilities. We undergrounded the utilities to the extent that we could, maybe in anticipation of the day that West Main Street would underground utilities. We wouldn't have to rip everything up again.

Mr. Schwarz – Have you thought about lighting? It looks like all the lighting on the building is up above the canopies. You're going to lose some lighting in the site walls that are wrapped Orzo's patio. Is there going to be any lighting on this?

Mr. Cadgene – I haven't installed it yet. It is a long tube lighting. Think of it as strip lighting in a long tube. There should be something under the canopy as well as something above the canopy. I am not sure I have fully planned that out. I do have the stuff that I just bought. We haven't yet installed it in a project. I want to see how it works. It would be some kind of LED strip lighting underneath the canopy. You could put lighting on the face of the building. It would not be as disruptive to the tenants to put it on the top under the canopy.

Mr. Jackson – There is lighting that is to be installed that is shown in the CAD drawings that was approved by the BAR that came along with the addition and all those goose-type lamps that face down. It would probably illuminate. It would still shine through this type of translucent. That probably should be some more specific lighting below. The Orzo patio area already has some lighting ingrained into the floor, the concrete,

and maybe the sidewalls. Anytime you put up a canopy, you want to have some lighting with it. You think of the string lights. We have not addressed that.

Mr. Schwarz – The way you frame this on the adjacent restaurant, there was fascia that went around the canopy. It looks like you're going to have the beams and the pearlins end. Is that the intention? If so, I assume all those are going to be. If they are hollow tube steel, you are going to have a cap at the end of each of them. Is that correct?

Mr. Jackson – That is correct. We talked about it in September. We also brought some fenestration for the Michie Courtyard. We're talking about that pavilion there across the street. That has tube construction and the rafters. A lot of those elements are capped as well. In between the two large areas, Orzo, and Albemarle Baking Company, it would be like the 420 and that you see a band in that respect along the sidewalk canopy.

Mr. Schwarz – How does the drainage work for this? I assume that with the decks, the water drains through. For the area where you have the polycarbonate, how does that work?

Mr. Jackson – They slope from the building out at about 1 percent.

Mr. Schwarz – Are you going to have the water shoot off the end or are you going to have a gutter there?

Mr. Jackson – I assume out on the end. At 420, we have this system. We have these fins that are called rain handlers that diffuse any amount of thicker water coming off the edge there rather than a gutter to capture it.

Mr. Schwarz – I think that I see that. I should have looked closer.

Mr. Jackson – It is hard to see in the image. Where it could matter is at the Albemarle Baking Company where there is still a pedestrian pathway outside of that edge. With all the others, if you drop a plumbing line, it is at the curb to the parking area. The sidewalk is under the roof. Everywhere else you're walking perpendicular to that.

Mr. Schwarz – You do think that you would have the gutter there. Do you think that you would have a dispersal like you have next door?

Mr. Jackson – Those rain handlers are an interesting way to do it.

Mr. Cadgene – I think along the narrow façade. If you're sitting in front of Orzo and you have rain, they are meant to protect you from rain. We must be prepared to put a small gutter if we need it to protect the people sitting underneath.

Mr. Jackson – The outside edge of Orzo goes past the sidewalk and drops. That is a big overhang from the patio area. The Albemarle Baking Company is where you have an edge that drops there. Most traffic is coming from the sides. I doubt people are going to be walking in off the sidewalk straight into that area. For practical means, they are usually coming in from the back parking lot or the side parking lot. It seems like it is a certain condition where it is just enough rain where there is extra rain coming off that edge. If it was me, I wouldn't put anything. In a sense, we have done enough from nothing.

Mr. Schwarz – As far as I am concerned, you're the architect and Mr. Cadgene owns the building. I am curious as to what we will end up seeing. That is more of my concern.

Mr. Jackson – I suggest we leave it clean and simple like that.

Mr. Cadgene – I am in favor of that unless it creates a problem. I don't think it will for most of it. Unless it creates some kind of problem for people sitting there. It has been Ok at 420. I have gotten negative feedback that would need more. They are certainly a cleaner solution.

Mr. Jackson – For the other poly canopy on the upper deck, that would slope backwards rather than towards the deck.

Mr. Schwarz – Your image for the fiber panels, it shows a reveal system. Is that the intention?

Mr. Jackson – That is my assumption that we would use that same type of reveal. It is actually used over on the wing that extends out on the other side of this whole complex that contains the back side of the parking lot where the railroad tracks are located. It is used in another part of the building complex in addition to across the street and other places. That aluminum type of reveal would be used.

Mr. Cadgene – It is the cleanest installation. The example that Mr. Jackson gave you was from behind the Afghan Market. We did a project there.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

No Comments from the Public

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD

Mr. Schwarz – I don't have any concerns. Due to the industrial nature of this building and the industrial nature of the additions going on to it, it is Ok. A lot of these details will be figured out in the drawings. I am concerned about lighting. We need to have a way to review that or have staff review that. I don't know if we can make a motion that gives lighting review to staff.

Mr. Gastinger – Lighting came up in the review of the earlier project. As I recall, there was some question about the color of the light. I would be comfortable if the lighting matches that that was deployed there.

Mr. Schwarz – When you say the earlier project, do you mean next door?

Mr. Gastinger – That's correct. It may not have been installed.

Mr. Schwarz – I am trying to remember what lighting I have seen up there.

Mr. Jackson – In the sample images, we use the string lights. I think that those are adjustable. I found those to be very successful for situations like that because they are highly adaptable. It creates a spirit and is effective without a big glare.

Mr. Schwarz – We always put the condition maximum of 3000 Kelvin and dimmable. If something is too bright, we can always reduce it later or ask the owner to reduce it later.

Mr. Werner – That is fine. We're not talking about parking lot lights or stadium lights.

Mr. Schwarz – I would be concerned if wall packs started appearing on the side of the building.

Mr. Werner – What we have now and what is shown, if something pops up out there that is not shown. It is Ok if you want to address it. Our standard preference that lamping be dimmable, require it be no higher than

3000k color temperature and a CRI of 80. I am finding that most of these catenary lights that are out in the market fit. I don't have any problem if you want to say that you ask to share with staff. No lighting is currently proposed.

Mr. Schwarz – Are we Ok with the wood? I don't know if it is in our guidelines. We don't want the wood to fade into weather over time. Is that a concern?

Mr. Gastinger – It is a minor component. I feel that it won't be that visible. I have a functional concern. Wood in that condition under the translucent panels might work. That is not our purview.

Mr. Jackson – I am Ok with opaque. I prefer to get a consistency. It is a stronger finish with the seal. I am sure that we would share that concern of the wood's quality being able to withstand the forces (sun and heat). We're going to try to get as strong of a wood as possible. It doesn't have to be wood. We could switch to a metal. There is a certain ease when you have wood applying all that roofing. I thought it would soften it up. Even if we did metal 2X2s, maybe a thinner wall, so it could be screwed into, we could maybe paint that brown as well to have a little bit of color up there.

Mr. Cadgene – If we were to use metal, I would want it to be all the same color.

Mr. Whitney – If it is steel, it should match the steel below.

Mr. Jackson – I am fine with that. The gray that I am thinking about has a warmness to it as it is.

Mr. Zehmer – Does anyone have objections to the wood? That is what is submitted in the application.

Mr. Whitney – Are there any issues with this building touching the adjacent building? These are 2 different historic properties. I understand that we're to avoid columns. It is clean to have it rest on the other building. Could that be an issue in the future?

Mr. Cadgene – That is an addition. We had to add that yellow piece onto the building for bathrooms. That is an addition on the older building.

Mr. Schwarz – These buildings are funky and unique. It is going to be obvious that this polycarbonate is new. It doesn't bother me.

Mr. Bailey – It looks cleaner that way.

Mr. Whitney – The canopy on the front is nice, clean, and thin. One of the defining features of the existing building is that brick work and how it curves up. I don't know if that accent brick is modeled correct. If there is any way for the tie rods to be inset from those so they don't sit in between the 2 curves of the accent brick, it would help those read as the defining piece.

Mr. Jackson – I agree. Those are laid out in a rhythm. They haven't been placed. I totally agree with that. We can try. That one that is over there looks close enough to the edge that it is maybe unnecessary, close enough to the support of the other larger structure of Orzo. That is a good point. We will make sure that is not awkward. I would have centered it between those two if I had to have it there. You could take it out and move them over.

Mr. Schwarz – There are 2 strips of reddish brick curve at the top as opposed to turning at a 90-degree angle.

Mr. Jackson – On page 14, that is close enough to where the less deep canopy between the two larger ones connects to the Orzo side. That rod wouldn't be necessary. We can adjust the other rods to be balanced out.

Mr. Timmerman – In relation to that, it looks like the signage is now blocked. Most of these shots look like they are taken a little higher than eye level. I don't know if signage is in our purview. There is a nice composition the way that it looks right now. I don't know if you have gotten that far to think about that. It does appear that the signage is getting blocked from view by the canopy. It changes the composition.

Mr. Gastinger – I was going to comment on that as well. In a preemptive way, I could imagine that the applicant might want to shift the text to the west. The new canopies recenter the building in a different way.

Mr. Jackson – We're talking about the Main Street Market starting on the other side of the vertical racing stripes. That would fit the new canopy area well and bring it up a little higher.

Ms. Lewis – In focusing on the guidelines, which is our purview, it is an appropriate application. The additions of balconies and decks don't destroy historic elements for the most part that characterize the property. The new work is going to be differentiated from the old. Because of its industrial car, auto sale background, the elements that are being introduced seem compatible with it and complement it, so they don't destroy the building.

Mr. Jackson – I sent an email earlier today of the survey from 1999. It showed a canopy across the front of that. That speaks to what he said. There were a lot of canopies along that street edge, especially along that façade.

Mr. Timmerman – Do you know why the building was at an angle?

Mr. Werner – The way that the parcel line was set. A lot of these parcels are not square. They are parallelograms in a lot of places. I know that there was a lot of manufacturing here. There might have been walls that they followed. You must remember that West Main didn't have a lot of stuff. It wasn't like you wouldn't notice your building was an angle to a neighboring building.

Motion – Mr. Schwarz – Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for ADC District, I move to find that the canopies, decks, and patios at the north and west facades at 416-418 West Main Street satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted and with the following conditions:

- **Any lighting that should be added should be reviewed administratively by staff. It should have a color temperature not to exceed 3000 Kelvin, be dimmable, and have a color rendering index of a minimum of 80, preferably 90.**
- **The tie rods for the canopies should be coordinated to not conflict with the accent brick on the front of the building.**
- **Consider adjusting the signage to the front of the building.**
- **The stain on the wood should be an opaque stain or paint.**

Second by Mr. Bailey. Motion passes 7-0.

E. Other Business

3. Preliminary Discussion

715-729 West Main Street

West Main Street ADC District, TMPs 320151000 et al

Applicant: Mitchel Mathews Architects

Project: New construction, redevelopment of site.

- Staff introduced the proposed project area and parcels to the members of the BAR.
- One of the key questions is the fate of the 2 contributing structures, Mel's Diner (built in the 1960s and added as a contributing structure in 2014) and the building at the corner of 8th and West Main (built in 1896).
- These parcels are zoned ZX-5 under the new zoning.
- The presumption is that the 3 parcels would be combined for the project. Two of the parcels are part of the West Main Street Historic District and front on West Main Street.
- The applicant presented their proposal for a new building and development to be built on the site. The presentation included a conceptual plan of what the new building might look like.
- Mr. Zehmer had a question about the retention of Mel's Restaurant on the property. Mr. Zehmer is against the demolition of the front of the restaurant but open to demolition on the back of the restaurant.
- Other members of the BAR also asked questions and provided comments for the applicant on how to improve the proposed project.
- There was concern about the potential impacts on the residential neighborhoods outside of the historic district.
- Mr. Gastinger stated that the horizontal banding does run counter to the Guidelines.
- Mr. Schwarz did have some concerns about the streetscape standards with this project. Pedestrians coming into the district walk behind the property.
- Mr. Schwarz did mention that the applicant should try to keep the 2-story part of the building.
- There was consensus that the massing of the proposed building was good.
- The applicant has a very good understanding and direction for the project going forward.

4. Staff Questions/Discussion

5. Design Guidelines Discussion

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:30 PM.