



Actions
City of Charlottesville
Board of Architectural Review
Regular Meeting
May 20, 2025 5:30 p.m.
Hybrid Meeting (In-person in Council Chambers and virtual via Zoom)

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review. Staff will introduce each item, followed by the applicant's presentation, which should not exceed ten minutes. The Chair will then ask for questions from the public, followed by questions from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. For each application, members of the public are each allowed three minutes to ask questions and three minutes to offer comments. Speakers shall identify themselves and provide their address. Comments should be limited to the BAR's purview; that is, regarding only the exterior aspects of a project. Following the BAR's discussion and prior to taking action, the applicant will have up to three minutes to respond.

5:00 **Pre-Meeting Discussion** (Location: NDS conference room, 610 E. Market Street.)

5:30 **Regular Meeting**

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda [or on the Consent Agenda]

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Meeting minutes April 15, 2025.

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application** [*Removed from Consent Agenda for discussion.*]
BAR #25-0076
218 West Market Street, TMP 330276000
Downtown ADC District
Owner: Cavalier Hospitality LLC
Applicant: Jeff Levien
Project: Demolition of contributing structure
Note: BAR previously approved a demolition CoA, which recently expired.

Approval [~~with approval of the Consent Agenda~~]: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find that the proposed demolition of 218 West Market Street satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application *as* application with the following conditions:

- BAR staff approval of the demolition permit is contingent upon:
 - Applicant will submit for the record documentation and photographs of the existing building.
 - BAR approval of a COA for this building's replacement.
 - An approved building permit for construction of that replacement.
 - Completion of a Phase I archaeological investigation.

Motion: Mr. Rosenthal **Second:** Ms. Lewis **Vote:** 7-0

C. Deferred Items - N/A

D. New Items

3. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR #25-0079
759 Belmont Ave, TMP 580172000
North Downtown ADC District
Owner: Viewmont Associates LLC
Applicant: Dan Bracey on behalf of Elaine Oakey
Project: Chimney removal

Approval: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed chimney removal and subsequent repairs to the roof and parapet satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this IPP, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- Prior to removal, the east chimney will be photographed and documented, including a dimensioned sketch, such that the chimney could be reconstructed at a later date. That documentation will be submitted for the BAR archive.
- Repairs to the remaining masonry will be completed using material, mortar, and methods appropriate for early-19th century masonry.
- The standing-seam metal roof will be repaired so as to match the existing pan widths and the joints will be crimped, including the ridge.
- The BAR encourages the owner to store on-site bricks removed from the chimney, such that can be re-used if the chimney is later reconstructed.

Motion: Mr. Schwarz **Second:** Mr. Birle **Vote:** 7-0

4. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application – Deferred by applicant**
BAR #25-0077
540 Park Street, TMP 520183000
North Downtown ADC District
Owner: Patrick & Jessica Fenn
Applicant: Douglas Croker
Project: Window replacements

Applicant elected to defer their application to speak with the property owner regarding window selection (double-hung in lieu of casement). Deferral motion made by Ms. Lewis and seconded by Mr. Rosenthal. Vote to accept the applicant's deferral: 7-0.

5. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR # 25-0068
1301 Wertland Street, TMP 040303000
Wertland Street ADC District
Owner: 1301 Wertland LLC JSB
Applicant: Edward Carrington, Seven Development
Project: Demolition of contributing structure

Denial: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find that the proposed demolition of 1301 Wertland Street does not satisfy or the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is not compatible with this property nor other properties in the Wertland Street ADC

District [staff corrected that the ADC District was Wertland Street], and for the following reasons the BAR denies the application:

The Board of Architectural Review concurs with staff's summary of the specific criteria within the guidelines to not recommend demolition, and makes these additional comments as to denial of the application:

- There is no public necessity to demolish the structure.
- There is public purpose and interest in preserving the structure.
- Protection of this property against threats has continued for more than half a century.
- No demonstration of intent to move or relocate the structure, or to find an alternative to demolition.
- The applicant is not present to address the BAR, nor available to answer questions.
- The proposed demolition would adversely affect the other contributing structures in the historic district, because this [the Wertenbaker House] is the anchor in the Wertland ADC District.
- There has been no reason stated for demolition which is one part of the ADC Guidelines for which the BAR should be informed, and the applicant did not appear to provide that information. The BAR can only assume it is for redevelopment purposes.
- There has not been an economic feasibility study for rehabilitation or reuse of the structure.
- The applicant has not demonstrated they have exhausted all other alternatives prior to submitting an application for demolition.
- The applicant has not offered to document the building to the Secretary of Interior's Standards if demolition did ever take place.
- This property is significant to the history of the City of Charlottesville and the University of Virginia as being the residence of the University's longest serving librarian who was selected by Thomas Jefferson.

Motion to deny: Ms. Lewis **Second:** Mr. Rosenthal **Vote to deny the application:** 7-0

6. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR # 25-0078

Downtown Mall – 4th St. E & 2nd St. W.

Owner: City of Charlottesville

Applicant: Riaan Anthony, Director, Parks & Rec

Project: Repairs to Mall vehicular crossings at 4th Street East and 2nd Street West

Approval: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find the proposed Repairs to Mall vehicular crossings at 4th Street East and 2nd Street West satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with the Downtown Mall and this ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- The soldier course border should continue up to the tactile strip [band] but not across the vehicular lane.
- The BAR recommends there should be a landscape architect involved who is qualified to advise on historic landscapes.
- The BAR would like to be included in material and color selection and be provided a workmanship mock-up to review.

Motion: Mr. Zehmer **Second:** Ms. Tabony **Vote:** 7-0

7. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application – Deferred by applicant**
BAR # 24-0038
218 West Market Street, TMP 330276000
Downtown ADC District
Owner: Cavalier Hospitality LLC
Applicant: Bob Pineo, Design Develop
Project: Construction of multi-story hotel

Applicant elected to defer their application to further refine the design after receiving feedback from the BAR during discussion. Deferral motion made by Mr. Zehmer and seconded by Ms. Tabony. Vote to accept the applicant's deferral: 7-0.

E. Other Business

8. **Staff questions and updates**
- Martha Jefferson House – door replacement (1600 Gordon Ave.)
 - ~~144 Chancellor Street update re: Demo CoA appeal~~
 - New NRHP listings & nomination –
 - ~~James Minor House (1817 Fendall Ave.)~~
 - ~~Campbell Hall (UVA School of Architecture)~~
 - Thomas & Alena Hammond House (1708 Yorktown Dr.)
9. **Staff discussion**
- ~~Window replacement: Identify scenarios and circumstances from prior requests.~~
 - ~~Pedestrian light fixtures~~

F. Adjourn (10:26 p.m.)