

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

Regular Meeting

July 20, 2010 – 5:00 p.m.

City Council Chambers - City Hall

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed 2 opportunities to speak. The Chair will ask if anyone from the public has questions of the applicant in an attempt to understand the project. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask if anyone from the public has comments. Members of the public will have up to 3 minutes per person to comment. Comments should be limited to the exterior design of the building and site. Comments will not be allowed as to the appropriateness of the project, or about the interior design or uses of the project, etc. Thank you for participating.

Members present: Knight (acting Chair), Coiner, Brennan, Ayres, Adams, Osteen. Members absent: Wolf, Schoenthal, Hogg

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

- 5:00 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes) None**
- B. Consent Agenda** (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled minutes will be discussed at the end of the agenda, but pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning.)

1. Minutes – June 15, 2010

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-07-01

150 Chancellor Street

Tax Map 9 Parcel 109

GTF Homes, LLC, Applicant/ Delta Zeta National Housing Corp, Owner

Re-roof house and replace shingles on dormer sides with hardiplank siding

3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-07-02

205D 2nd Street NW

Tax Map 33 Parcel 174 Lot 2G

John Rhett, Applicant/ Claude Ripley, Owner

Install three custom wood windows in unit 205D

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 10-07-09

207D 2nd Street NW

Tax Map 33 Parcel 174 Lot 2K

John Trimmer, Applicant & Owner

Install new bedroom windows in unit 207D

The minutes and three certificates of appropriateness were approved (6-0) as submitted on the consent agenda, with a condition placed on 150 Chancellor Street to use smooth-grained Hardie siding.

- C. Projects in Non-Compliance (no status report this month)**

- D. Previously Considered Items**

Knight recused self from next item so Brennan acted as Chair.

- 5:10 1. Recommendation (Previously Considered June 2010)**

Establishment of Martha Jefferson Neighborhood Historic Conservation District

Martha Jefferson Neighborhood Association, Applicant

The BAR recommended (5-0-1 with Knight recusing) that City Council should designate the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District:

- **With the boundary as proposed, which is the same as the National Register district boundary;**
- **With contributing resources as proposed in the National Register report;**
- **With design review on the three Entrance Corridor parcels 53-198, 54-8, and 54-9 (which have contributing structures) and on the three Entrance Corridor parcels 53-234, 54-7, and 54-17 (which have non-contributing structures) to be accomplished by the BAR using Historic Conservation District guidelines; and**
- **The BAR defines the architectural character-defining features of the proposed Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District as follows:**
 1. **Encourage one-story front porches**
 2. **Encourage rear garages**
 3. **The levels of a building's stories should be consistent with those on surrounding structures with respect to the natural grade.**
 4. **Do not exclude well-designed, new contemporary architecture.**
 5. **Encourage standing seam metal roofs.**
 6. **Maintain and encourage tree canopy.**
 7. **Concur especially with the following guidelines: maintain neighborhood massing and form; encourage the use of sustainable materials; and limit the height of fences in front yards.**
 8. **Regarding the future development of the hospital properties, the neighborhood's focus has been: not to tear down the old houses; to encourage low density residential development north of Taylor Walk (with the suggestion that Taylor Street be reinstated); and to expect the High Street area to develop as a sensitively designed, high-quality, mixed use development.**
 9. **Good stewardship of Maplewood Cemetery be encouraged.**

Knight returned as Chair.

5:30 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Preliminary Discussion June 2010)
BAR 10-06-02
218 West Water Street
Tax Map 28 Parcel 84
Atwood Architects, Applicant/ Waterhouse LLC, Owner
New Construction, Waterhouse

The BAR approved (5-1 with Adams opposed) in concept the general massing (not withstanding the articulation of all the building facades shown here tonight) and the general material palette (again, not as presented in the drawings shown here tonight) with details (fenestration, façade articulation, exact color and material palette) to return to the BAR for final approval. The Water Street façade is an area of particular concern to the BAR, and further study and refinement is paramount in the board's continuing deliberations.

5:50 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Deferred from September 2009)
BAR 09-09-01
410 Altamont Circle
Tax Map 33 Parcel 124
John M Anderson Construction Co, Applicant/ Charles Johnston, Owner
One story addition with basement

The BAR approved (6-0) the addition as submitted, with the stipulation that the prefinished metal roof shall not have a ridge vent.

E. New Items

6:10 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 10-07-10
220 East Main Street

Tax Map 28 Parcel 36
Pam Marraccini, Applicant
Exterior Paint Color

The BAR approved (6-0) a muted earth tone gold color as chosen by the applicant and administratively approved by staff.

- 6:30** **5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 10-07-05
125 Chancellor Street
Tax Map 9 Parcel 137
Alpha Tau Omega Holding Corporation, Applicant & Owner
Installation of new pre-painted standing seam metal roof panels and new Philadelphia gutter system

The BAR approved (6-0) a new pre-finished metal roof of a dark color (preferably dark bronze) but with ridge vents not permitted; and subject to administrative approval of a ½ round copper gutter system to be circulated by staff to the BAR for review prior to approval.

- 6:50** **6. Council-Requested Review**
BAR 10-07-04
401 4th Street NW
Tax Map 32 Parcel 26 Lots 15A and 15B
BRW Architects for Virginia Supportive Housing, Applicant/
Virginia Supportive Housing, Owner
New Construction for The Crossings at 4th and Preston.
Sixty single occupancy efficiency units.

Having considered the design and appearance of the proposed SRO facility in the context of its location on Preston Avenue and near the historic areas of Downtown and West Main Street, the BAR recommended (6-0) to generally endorse the scale, materials, massing and general design of the project, and recommended the following:

- 1. Revise the fence design and configuration to create a more civic space on Preston Avenue. If the fence cannot be reduced in height, then suggestions are to move the fence back to the plaza; to use brick piers with “green” fence between; or use a 2 foot high brick seat wall with 4 foot fence on top; or make the fence more transparent on top.**
- 2. Replace the yellow brick with red brick. (But keep the molded type brick).**
- 3. Simplify the planting plan (with fewer plants and species, and larger trees) to allow easier maintenance and to be in keeping with the simplicity of landscape design along Preston Avenue. Open up and simplify the transition area from public sidewalk to building at the front entrance on 4th Street.**
- 4. Do not use a chain link fence in the rear – keep the same fence as in the front.**
- 5. Add a large shade tree at the point on the Preston Avenue to shade the sidewalk and plaza area.**
- 6. Larger street trees should be used on 4th Street in concert with the rhythm of the building. (It is recommended that the overhead utility lines along 4th Street are relocated underground to allow the larger trees.)**

- 7:10** **7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 10-07-06
222 South Street
Tax Map 28 Parcel 95
Michael Stoneking, Applicant/ Blue Moon Fund, Owner
New solar panel array in rear yard

The BAR approved (6-0) the applicant’s request for deferral. The BAR could not support as submitted. The issue is scale. Revisit issues, talk to neighbors and architect before resubmitting. Suggest looking at other examples. Could become a model design for solar panels in historic district.

- 7:30** **8. Preliminary Discussion**
BAR 10-07-07

5 Gildersleeve Wood
Tax Map 11 Parcel 18
Cynthia Deupree, Applicant/ Deren Bader and Paul Lyons, Owners
New studio and office in rear yard

Preliminary comments made. The BAR could not support the proposal in current form. Mass and details are problematic. Outbuildings should be deferential to, and reflective of, the main structure. Note that accessory dwellings are not permitted in this zoning district.

7:50 11. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 10-07-08
600 Preston Place
Tax Map 5 Parcel 109
Mackenzie Woolner, Applicant/ Christopher Winter, Owner
Extend deck and remove tree

Preliminary comments made. The BAR will support something that improves the site, but do not want to establish a lax precedent.

1) requesting that improvements be made to the existing structure, specifically the lattice. 2) extend the hedge and insure that it is maintained (especially that it is trimmed) 3) generally supportive of deck extension and two tree removals, provided applicants do what they can to screen the area below the new deck extension, that screening is consistent with the replacement, and that the skirting is not lattice.

F. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 5 minutes) **None**

G. Other Business

8:10 H. Adjournment **9:05 p.m.**