

**BAR ACTIONS**

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE  
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
Regular Meeting  
April 19, 2016 – 5:30 p.m.  
City Council Chambers - City Hall**



Welcome to this Regular monthly meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. Comments shall be limited to the BAR’s jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site.

For each item, staff will summarize the staff report, after which the applicant may have up to **ten minutes** to present their submittal. Members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak on each item: up to **three minutes** to ask questions, and up to **three minutes** to comment. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then questions from the BAR. After questions are closed, the applicant may take a seat and allow discussion to proceed. The Chair will ask for comments from the public, then comments from the BAR. Following the BAR’s discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to **three minutes** to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

**PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.**

**Members present: Miller, chair; Mohr, vice-chair; Balut, Sarafin, Schwarz, Keesecker, Earnst, Knott**

**Members absent: Graves**

**Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala, Camie Mess, Margaret Stella**

**5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)**

**David Thomas 500 Court Square questioned the BAR’s proper considerations of Guidelines.**

**B. Consent Agenda** (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

**1. Minutes** March 15, 2016

**Keesecker moved to approve the minutes; Schwarz seconded and the minutes passed (6-0-2, with Miller and Knott abstained.)**

**C. New Items**

**5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-04-04

Downtown Mall

Portions of Tax maps 28, 33, and 53

City of Charlottesville, Owner/ Department of Parks and Recreation, Applicant

Replace existing mall benches

**Schwarz moved to accept the applicant’s request for deferral, and Miller seconded. The request was approved (8-0).**

**Before the BAR was willing to accept the backless benches, they asked the applicant to provide a map showing the current location on the Downtown Mall of all the existing benches and chairs, and to research a possible replacement chair with a back, made of wood and metal. The BAR may want to keep some chairs with backs in addition to the backless benches.**

**6:00 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-04-02

212 Ridge McIntire Road  
Tax Parcel 330155L00  
Omni Hotels, Owner/Thurman Shifflett, Applicant  
Tree Removal

**Sarafin moved to accept the applicant's request for deferral, and Keesecker seconded. The deferral request was approved (8-0).**

**The BAR asked to see a planting plan for the parking lot, perhaps with a proposal for specific species of trees to replace two trees where they are currently located in the islands, but to replace the third tree near the parking structure with up to three smaller trees in the planting strip near the street. After you submit the plan, your application will be re-scheduled.**

**6:20            4.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 16-04-01  
1022 Grove Street  
Tax Parcel 230039000  
Kathryn L. Mintz, Owner/Applicant  
Replace deteriorating windows, install storm window and screens

**Schwartz moved to find that the proposed window replacement satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted using the aluminum-clad wood windows, with the recommendation of looking into the size of the muntins [to match the dimensions of the existing window muntins as closely as possible using SDL's with exterior and interior affixed muntins with spacer bars]. Also, the storm windows should not be put back. Keesecker seconded. The motion passed (7-1, with Miller opposed).**

**6:40            5.        Comprehensive Signage Plan**

BAR 16-04-03  
1000 West Main  
Tax Parcel 100068000 & 1000700  
Campus Investors C'ville 1000 W Main, LLC, Owner/Applicant  
Amendment to approved comprehensive signage plan

**Schwartz moved to find that the proposed comprehensive signage plan satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR recommends this application as submitted with the following modifications: the applicant will resubmit the sign concept for the glass on retail spaces, to be administratively approved. Knott seconded. The motion passed (8-0).**

**D.        New Construction**

**7:00            6.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 15-09-05  
425,501,503 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 320175000, 320176000, 320177000  
William H. Atwood, Applicant/The Sutton Group, Owner  
New mixed use development

**Sarafin moved to find that the proposed new mixed-use complex satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following to come back:**

- **Full lighting plan**
- **Landscape/site plan with particular emphasis on the arcade and urban park entrances**
- **Greater detail on the windows and glass specifications**
- **Canopy details**
- **Materials palette**

- **Additional study of the detail and articulation (massing is fine) of the Commerce Street facade on the street and second level**
- **Comprehensive storefront and garage door details**

**Mohr seconded. Motion passed (6-2, with Miller and Keesecker opposed)**

**7:30            7.        Certificate of Appropriateness**  
 BAR 15-10-08  
 550 East Water Street  
 Tax Parcel 530162300  
 Neal Sansovich, Owner/ Andrew Baldwin, Applicant  
 New Mixed-Use Complex – Details

**Sarafin moved to find that the proposed new mixed-use building details satisfy the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application, as submitted, with the clarification that upon installation of the lighting, it is adjusted appropriately. Knott seconded. The motion passed (8-0).**

**8:00            8.        Discussion- remaining condition**  
 BAR 15-08-04  
 NW Corner of Ridge St. and Cherry Ave.  
 Tax Parcel 290145000-147000, 290149000-151000, 290157000  
 Charlie Armstrong, Owner/ Cherry Avenue Investments LLC, Applicant  
 Proposed new construction of a Marriot Hotel on the NW corner intersection of Cherry Avenue and Ridge Street – plaza facade design

**Schwarz moved, and Mohr seconded, to find that the proposed new construction satisfies the BAR’s criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Ridge Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves (7-1 with Knott opposed) Option B for the plaza façade design as submitted, except with the modification that all windows [and doors] on the far east block either have muntins [SDL’s with exterior- and interior -applied muntins with spacer bars], or none have muntins, exclusive of the storefront doors going into the retail space under the main canopy [which should not have muntins].**

**8:20    E.        Other Business**

9.        Discussion- Administrative Approvals

**General consensus was to make sure that the board members reply to the e-mails sent by Mary Joy in a timely manner. Reply all can be used, and it is up to the specific members of the board if individually they want to use this response or reply only to Mary Joy. Applications without clear resolution at the BAR meeting should be deferred rather than approved subject to administrative approval with emails.**

10.      Discussion-Conservation district ordinance

**Amendment for Conservation District Ordinances recommended for rear demolitions on corner lots (8-0.)  
 Amendment for Conservation District Ordinances recommended for having to obtain approval to paint [previously unpainted] brick on case by case basis (7-1, with Schwarz opposed.)**

11.      Discussion- Confederate memorials

**City Council did not yet take action to appoint a Blue Ribbon Committee. The BAR confirmed they must review any proposed changes to statues in ADC districts.**

12.      Preservation Virginia BAR Training sessions

**Sarafin encouraged BAR members to attend an upcoming training session.**

13.      PLACE Report

**PLACE discussed 3D modeling of the City and lighting study. The BAR wants to schedule a work session with PLACE and Planning Commission.**

**The BAR discussed their role in reviewing the Design Guidelines as noted in the West Main Street rezoning action.**

**9:00 F. Adjournment 10:30 p.m.**