

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
June 21, 2016 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Members Present: Sarafin; Balut; Schwarz; Miller, chair; Keesecker; Graves; Earnst; Mohr, vice-chair

Members Absent: Knott

Staff Present: Scala; Mess; Perks

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

Mark Kavitt would like to appeal an administrative approval made about a fence to be built by his neighbor behind his property at 402 Altamont Street.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes May 17, 2016

Schwarz moved to approve the minutes, Keesecker seconded, and the motion passed (7-0-1, Sarafin abstained).

C. Previously Considered Items

5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-03-04

36 University Circle

Tax Parcel 060092000

Margaret Nelsons Spethmann, G.P.A., Owner/Russell Skinner, Applicant
Front Dormer Redesign

Graves moved to find that the revised dormers and plan to remove aluminum siding satisfies the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road- University Circle- Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following modifications:

- **Keep existing windows, but with new storms**
- **Patching/repairing of the existing shingles after removing the aluminum siding**
- **Move to a two dormer option as shown on the drawings submitted to the BAR at the meeting.**

Balut seconded. Motion approved (8-0).

6:00 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-03-03
513 14th Street NW
Tax Parcel 050087000
Lane Bonner, Owner/Wassenaar & Winkler Architects, Gregory Winkler, Applicant
Two Story/Attic Additions – Details

Mohr moved to find that the proposed addition satisfies the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following modifications:

- **The BAR would like to see:**
 - **A sample of the brick as proposed**
 - **Alternate ramp plans or see the project go to a walkway with a lift – the objective being to keep as many of the existing trees as possible**
 - **A finished landscape plan with larger trees and more planting options that mimic what is already going on in the district**

Balut seconded. Motion approved (7-1 with Sarafin opposed).

6:20 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 15-11-04
225 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 330233000
Jim Cheng, Owner/Bruce Wardell, BRW Architects, Applicant
Exterior Alterations

Sarafin moved to find that the proposed new changes to the existing building satisfy the BAR’s criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, noting that the canopy should be 4 feet so that the leader of the Ginkgo tree at 5 feet will not have to be cut.

Balut seconded. Motion approved (7-0-1 with Keesecker recused).

The BAR also confirmed that the windows will have SDL’s with spacer bars, and the brick will not be sealed.

D. New Items

6:40 5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 16-06-02
518 17th Street NW
Tax Parcel 050066000
Charlottesville VA House Corp (Alpha Phi), Owner/George Stone, Applicant
Fence Replacement

Graves moved to find that the proposed fence satisfies the BAR’s criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted.

Prior to installation, the BAR would like to see samples of the new aluminum fence; the BAR would also be open to looking at any alternative fences that could be better. The BAR approves the removal of the existing fence.

Sarafin seconded. Motion approved (8-0).

7:00 **6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-06-05
150 Chancellor Street
Tax Parcel 090109000
Delta Zeta National Housing Corp., Owner/John J. Grottschall for Zeta Corp., Applicant
Front Yard Landscaping

Keesecker moved to find the proposed landscaping changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC District and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Balut seconded. Motion approved (8-0).

7:20 **7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-06-01
111 West High Street
Tax Parcel 330111000
Marianne & Gerry Starsia, Owner/Applicant
Exterior Renovations - Tree Removals, Window/Door Exchange, and Porch Renovations

Sarafin moved to find that the proposed exterior changes satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Schwarz seconded. Motion approved (8-0).

7:40 **8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-06-03
1397 West Main Street (Boylan Heights)
Tax Parcel 100004000
West Main Street LLC, Owner/Dan Zimmerman, Alloy Architecture, Applicant
Addition of Second Story Deck

Schwarz moved to find the proposed addition of a second story deck satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the following modifications:

Administratively, the BAR would like to see:

- **Lighting plan**
- **Lower decks to be rebuilt to have the same material/quality as the upper deck**
- **Edges of the second story balcony to be reworked where they meet the brick**
- **New concept figured out for the Christian's sign**

Balut seconded. Motion approved (8-0).

8:00 **9. Preliminary Discussion**
BAR 16-06-04
1211 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100059000
1817 House LLC, Owner/Ryan Hubbard, Applicant
Porch Demolition, Porch Expansion, and Streetscape

The applicant is requesting a preliminary discussion, so no motion is needed. In general, the BAR did not want to see the existing porch removed; they suggested considering ways to accommodate the business plan at the rear, or to find a creative way to push out the porch to gain additional space, but still distinguish new work from old. They did not think the octagonal porch was compatible with a federal style building.

E. Other Business

8:20 10. PLACE Report – Tim Mohr noted 3-D software discussion (UVA is using City Engine); desire to get it up and running in the SIA area. There is a green initiative, City Green, to integrate all levels of green infrastructure.

Other:

Keesecker said there are areas of town where zoning conflicts with use patterns. He suggested a work session to make a list of top ten areas where zoning conflicts with what is there currently, to prepare for future code audit work. (14th Street, Booker Street and Starr Hill examples were mentioned).

Mary Joy said William Taylor Plaza Phase 2 is ready to move forward and they have requested a work session. The BAR was in agreement with that plan to schedule a work session for preliminary discussion, provided the BAR can receive documents a week ahead and the applicants should come prepared to the meeting.

Stephen Balut asked about the BAR's purview to specify maintenance techniques on a historic building or offer advice on building code issues.

Melanie Miller asked if 400 West High Street and 120 West High Street could now be considered applications in non-compliance.

Tim Mohr asked about the Violet Crown glass and the Landmark Hotel.

Tim Mohr asked Mark Kavitt what he wanted to say about cast iron.

Carl Schwarz said Starr Hill residents he talked with do not want an ADC or a Conservation District designation. Keesecker said Woolen Mills neighborhood does want a Conservation District.

Melanie Miller referenced a letter from Genevieve Keller regarding the Halprin designed chairs on the Mall, and suggested that the BAR reply back as a body to endorse those views.

Other topics were the poor condition of the Second Street crossing, and Tim Mohr noted an article about Cincinnati.

8:30 F. Adjournment 9:30 p.m.