

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
July 19, 2016 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

Members Present: Miller, Chair; Mohr, Vice-Chair; Sarafin; Knott; Schwarz; Balut; Earnst.

Absent: Keesecker; Graves.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

Mark Kavitt discussed his research on fencing.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes June 21, 2016

Sarafin moved to approve the minutes, Balut seconded, and the minutes passed (6-0-1, with Knott abstained).

C. Previously Considered Items

5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-02-06
1105 Park Street
Tax Parcel 470007000
Nicholas Cafferillo & Elaine Alpern, Owners/ Keith Scott, Applicant
Landscape Plan

Sarafin moved to find that the proposed landscape plan satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this Individually Protected Property, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Earnst seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

6:00 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-03-03
513 14th Street NW
Tax Parcel 050087000
Lane Bonner, Owner/Wassenaar & Winkler Architects, Gregory Winkler, Applicant
Two Story/Attic Additions – Final Details

Mohr moved to find that the proposed addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC

district, and that the BAR approves the application with the following provisos: a landscape plan, and the detailing of the railing found on the North side of the building to come back for administrative approval. The brick and the ADA lift are approved as submitted. Schwarz seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

- 6:20 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-01
400 West High Street
Tax Parcel 330154000
Carolyn Polson, Owner/Applicant
Removal and replacement of dead and diseased trees

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as indicated on the plan created at this meeting on July 19, 2016, by Laura Knott, and we allow the applicant 6 months to plant the plan:

- Plant a large shade tree directly in front of the house to the right of the front walk, and on the corner of Altamont Street and the alley**
- Shift the October Glory Maple downhill a few feet as indicated on the drawing**
- Shift the Dogwood inside the fence**
- Eliminate the Willow Oak**
- And shift the Black Gum slightly away from the Maple.**

The overall plan can be seen on a sketch, and it is three (3) large trees, one (1) medium tree, and one (1) small tree. Balut seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

D. New Items

- 6:40 5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-03
402 Altamont Street
Tax Parcel 330152000
Elizabeth Sutphen, Owner/Applicant
Backyard privacy fence

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed new fence satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted (both styles and colors), and approves the repair of the steps and the shed, negating the window replacement (to come back at a different time). Balut seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

- 7:00 6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-05
420 Park Street
Tax Parcel 530120000
Edward H. Bain, Jr., Owner/Applicant
Red maple tree removal and replacement

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed tree removal satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the tree removal, but requests that the tree be replaced with a large tree from the City's tree list, in the same location. The applicant will be given a year and a half to complete this, with an extension, if needed, by administrative approval. Mohr seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

- 7:20 7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-07

Downtown Mall, between 6th Street and 7th Street
Tax Map 53
City of Charlottesville, Owner/Department of Parks and Recreation, Applicant
Move lamp posts & install synthetic tree grates

Balut moved to find that relocating four light poles as submitted does not satisfy the BAR's criteria, and we stipulate that Mary Joy and at least two members of the BAR will visit the mall to verify the new lamps will be compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, that the BAR will approve that new layout administratively after that meeting takes place. Schwarz seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

Balut moved to find that the redesign of ten tree grates does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR recommends that the grates located around damaged or threatened trees may be temporarily replaced by plastic grates, for no longer than six months until another solutions is found to replace those grates with metal grates that are similar to the existing grates on the Downtown Mall. The cantilever frames are approved as submitted. Knott seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

7:40 **8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-02
801 Park Street
Tax Parcel 470020000
Daniel Krasnegor & Kristin Jensen, Owners/Michael Savage, STOA Design & Construction,
Applicant
Garage renovation work and removal of some trees/plantings around the property

Sarafin moved to find that the proposed garage renovation work and tree/planting removals as well as brush along the property line satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. With the specification to wait until winter, then prune the hollies and save them if possible, per Ms. Knott's comments. Mohr seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

8:00 **9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-04
1509-11 University Avenue
Tax Parcel 090078100
Amorgos LLC, Owner/William Adams, Train Architects, Applicant
Renovation of store façade and interior

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed storefront reconstruction in concept satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC District, and the BAR approves the application for the following items: the 13'-8" opening height, the painting of the brick, and the general configuration of Scheme B, with the parapet height staying as it exists. Mohr seconded. Motion passed (7-0)

8:20 **10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-07-06
1000 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100068000 and 100070000
Campus Investors C'ville 1000 W. Main, LLC, Owner/Virginia Wilson, Loughridge
Construction, Applicant
Exterior Additions - painted metal rail, perforated metal screen, and wall louver

Mohr moved to find that the proposed additions satisfy the BAR's criteria, and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and the BAR approves this application, pending administrative review of the existing railing designs, with finished wood table tops [on silver or black café furniture], and the color and detail of the chiller cabinet [and wall louvers] as submitted. Earnst seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

Following administrative review of the railings, the BAR decided that the café railing should match the silver-colored horizontal railings that are installed on the rest of the building.

E. New Construction

8:40 **11. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-01-04
512-514, 600 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 290007000, 290006000, and 290008000
The Janice D Perkins Revocable Tr, Owner and Sylvia Braxton,/Jeff Dreyfus, Applicant
New Construction – Final Details

The BAR did not take action, but made comments:

General

- Great presentation
- Generally, keep it simple.

Frontispiece needs work

- The box proper is great, but have reservations about the piece that comes forward.
- Needs to be more subtle in terms of scale. Rear building could be graphite but front building needs more life.
- The commercial streetfront needs more pizzazz.
- Front building has a lot going on but lacks human understanding.
- Work on frontispiece- scale more subtle; more lively

Materials and color

- Too industrial and gloomy for W Main Street; sharp edges, cold materials
- Prefer light nighttime view but not sure it shows what you intended
- Like red Corten; not black; struggling with vertical metal panels; need to warm it up.
- Use darker color where you want it to recede, like on north wall
- Too much contrast; too busy and hard.
- Prefer current blue of Blue Moon Diner, and color of Gabe's buildings on West Main. This is multiple shades of graphite.
- Lean towards #16.2 – less contrast; like razor's edge between stories; like combination of perforated metal and fiber cement.
- Like it all the same color
- Less contrast reduces jarring effect
- 16.3 version is massive, brooding

Historic buildings

- The rear building should be a backdrop for the two historic buildings; like use of Corten
- Like historic buildings – creating backdrop

Windows and rooftop appurtenances

- Open to continuing discussion about vinyl or fiberglass but would set a precedent – prefer aluminum clad.
- Rooftop appurtenances as shown not a problem.

F. Other Business

9:00 **10. PLACE Report- Tim Mohr**

Green infrastructure work session instead of PLACE meeting

Mohr also discussed the appeal to City Council by an abutting owner of 550 E Water Street BAR approval

Schwarz discussed utility conflicts – a challenge to locate trees within utility clearances.

Staff was asked to check on the William Taylor Plaza –the sidewalk width requirement and if a bus pullover in the right turn lane is a requirement.

Also on 200 2nd Street SW- is the site plan different than BAR approval?

1000 W Main Street critique – dryer vents, terra cotta, yellow color

9:10 G. Adjournment 10:25 p.m.