

**BAR ACTIONS**

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE  
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW**

**Regular Meeting**

**January 17, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.**

**Neighborhood Development Conference Room - City Hall**



**Members present: Chair Melanie Miller; Justin Sarafin, Carl Schwarz, Stephen Balut, Whit Graves, Corey Clayborne.**

**Members Absent: Vice-Chair Tim Mohr, Emma Earnst (landscape architect position is currently vacant)**

**Staff present: Mary Joy Scala, Camie Mess, Reid Saunders**

- 5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes) None**
- B. Consent Agenda** (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)
  - 1. Minutes**
    - December 20, 2016 Regular Meeting (Not available yet)
    - January 5, 2016 Work Session on revisions to Historic Conservation District ordinance and guidelines

**Sarafin moved to approve the Jan 5, 2017 work session minutes. Schwartz seconded, and the minutes passed 3-0-3 with Graves, Clayborne, and Balut abstained because they were not present at the work session meeting.**

**C. Previously Considered Items**

- 5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
  - BAR 16-01-01
  - 200 2<sup>nd</sup> Street SW
  - Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000, 280072000, 280073000, 280074000, 280075000
  - Market Plaza LLC, Owner/ Powe Studio Architects, Applicant
  - Perimeter Landscape Revisions

**Graves moved to find that the proposed revisions to plantings and hardscape details satisfy the BAR’s criteria and guidelines, and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the changes as submitted. Sarafin seconded, and the motion passed 5-0-1, with Schwartz recused.**

**D. New Items**

- 6:00 3. Preliminary Discussion**
  - BAR 17-01-01

301 East Jefferson Street  
Tax Parcel 330204000  
Congregation Beth Israel, Owner/ BRW Architects, Applicant  
Temple addition

**Since this was presented as a preliminary discussion no motion is necessary. General comments were: massing approach is strong; a simpler, prefer a more transparent addition; prefer a more contemporary box that does not compete with existing design; overhangs are the most competing element; butterfly angle should not be different from the existing gable angle; concerns with NW corner: raising the narrow addition too high (existing proportion is striking) and impeding on sanctuary.**

- 6:20**            **4.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-01-05  
615 Lexington Ave  
Tax Parcel 520170000  
Lyll Harris and Francesco Ronchetti, Owner/ Dan Zimmerman- Alloy,  
Applicant  
New Construction- Artist's Studio/Apartment, Carport, and Screened Porch

**Clayborne moved to find that the proposed accessory apartment/studio, carport, and screened porch addition satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Schwarz seconded, and the motion passed 4-2, with Miller and Sarafin opposed.**

- 6:40**            **5.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-01-02  
103 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 3302550200  
Virginia Pacific Investments LLC, Owner/ Kevin Schafer, Applicant  
Mezzanine and Rooftop Terrace

**Graves moved to find that the proposed roof terrace addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, and the lighting fixture is appropriate. Clayborne seconded, and the motion passed 6-0.**

- 7:00**            **6.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-01-03  
416-418 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 290012000  
Main Street Association LLC, Owner/ Greg Jackson, Applicant  
Roof replacement

**At the applicant's request for a decision rather than deferral, despite the BAR's encouragement for the applicant to request a deferral, Graves moved to find that the proposed new roof addition does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR does not approve the application as submitted, specifically because the hip roof is not compatible with the historic building and the historic district. Balut seconded, and the motioned was denied 6-0.**

- 7:20            7.        **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-01-04  
1517 University Ave  
Tax Parcel 090081000  
Sheetz Rep: Thomas Columbus Jr, Tenant/ Natalie Feaver Profile AI, Applicant  
Exterior Modifications

**Bault moved to find that the proposed exterior modifications satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the friendly suggestion to consider changing the doors to solid wood doors without the banding, and the BAR strongly encourages the option to paint the muntins white. Schwartz seconded, and the motion passed 6-0.**

**E.        New Construction**

**Whit Graves left the meeting.**

- 7:40            8.        **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 16-08-05  
NW Corner of Ridge Street and Cherry Ave (William Taylor Plaza  
Phase 2)  
Tax Parcel 290147000, 290146000, 290145000  
Cherry Ave Investments LLC, Owner/ Management Services Corp., Applicant  
Landscape Plan and Final Details

**Schwartz moved to find that the landscape plan for the proposed new residential building satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Ridge Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the landscape plan as submitted and asks that the applicant give consideration to the trees on the south end of the building, and the BAR would like to approve administratively a final plan with every tree with its species, what lighting fixture will be used for the (exterior) porch balconies, and more details on the Corten wall (approve with the Corten wall turning the corner) and the BAR wants to see a Phase I site plan adjusted to match [this plan in the area of the plaza]. Clayborne seconded, and the motion passed 5-0.**

**8:10    F.        Other Business**

9.            **Recommendation:** Revisions to the Historic Conservation District Ordinance and Design Guidelines.

**Schwartz made a motion to recommend to City Council approval of the Historic Conservation District zoning text amendments as presented, but striking Sec. 34-34(f) , and approval of the Historic Conservation District guidelines, striking Guideline #3 under Building Materials and textures; and to add a recommendation to refer to the Secretary of the Interior Standards in the Introduction. Sarafin seconded and the motion was approved 5-0.**

10.          **Miller asked if staff could send a letter to Council and NDS that we need these problem s [i.e., 615 Lexington Avenue] identified before they become problems.**

**Miller made a motion to request that the City identify a process to flag building permits that are proposed in any historic district [ADC, Historic Conservation, and IPP's]. Clayborne seconded and the motion passed 5-0.**

**8:45 G. Adjournment 10:00 p.m.**