

BAR ACTIONS

**CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
April 18, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall**



Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR’s jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR’s discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Members present: Melanie Miller- Chair; Tim Mohr- Vice-Chair; Carl Schwarz, Stephan Balut, Emma Earnst, Whit Graves, and Breck Gastinger

Members absent: Justin Sarafin and Corey Clayborne

Staff present: Mary Joy Scala, Historic Preservation Planner; Camie Mess, Assistant Historic Preservation Planner; Reid Saunders, Historic Preservation Intern; Carolyn McCray, Clerk

Melanie Miller called the meeting to order at 5:30.

**5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)
No public comments were made.**

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes

March 21, 2017	Regular Meeting
February 28, 2017	Work Session

Gastinger moved to approve the March 21, 2017 regular meeting minutes and the February 28, 2017 work session minutes. Balut seconded, and the minutes passed 6-0-1 with Graves abstaining because he was not present at the March meeting or the work session.

C. Previously Considered Items

5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR 16-04-04
Downtown Mall
Portions of Tax maps 28, 33, and 53
City of Charlottesville, Owner/ Department of Parks and Recreation, Applicant
Replace existing mall benches

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed [backless] benches do not satisfy the BAR's criteria and are not compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR denies the application as submitted. Mohr seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

NOTE: Doug Ehman was requested to gather one of the original Halprin chairs and to "hold onto it."

6:00 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-03-04
159 Madison Lane
Tax Parcel 090145000
Jeffrey Gore, owner/Bobby Craig, Arapahoe Architects PC, applicant
Handicapped ramp

Balut moved to find that the proposed handicap ramp satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in The Corner ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the recommendations that the light fixture use a warm lamp (3000K or less), a hardy shrub be put in the planter (preferably one from the City's planting list), and if not a planter, then add curbing to protect plantings, and a wheel stop or other device to prevent cars from blocking access to the handicapped ramp. Schwarz seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

D. New Construction

6:20 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 16-01-04
512-514, 600 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 290007000, 290006000, and 290008000
Heirloom West Main Development LLC, Owner/Heirloom West Main Development LLC,
Applicant
Final Details

Miller moved to find that the proposed final details satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC District, and that the BAR approves as submitted the following items:

- **Concrete paving as drawn on the landscape plan**
- **Lighting approved in concept (We need a final plan and to field test before final approval)**
- **Rehabilitation specifications which include:**
 - Interior changes and demolitions
 - Removal of the addition on the second floor of the mini mart building, and other exterior details
 - Repair of windows, brick walls, and the metal roof on the Blue Moon building
 - Repainting brick walls that are currently painted and the metal roof
 - New half-round gutters
 - Replacement of windows to match existing
 - New Corten wall on the back of the Blue Moon building
 - Addition of guard rails as needed
- **We are also asking for minor changes to the landscape plan by:**
 - **Eliminating the blue fescue**
 - **Switching the specified Elm to a disease-resistant American Elm**
 - **Adding a tree grate**
 - **Verifying the proposed vine twines vs clings**

Further, the BAR would like to defer the following items for further information:

- **Glazing [including a sample of the glass]**
- **Final layout and additional studies for mechanical units**

- **Bike racks**

The BAR also approves the window [in the east bay of house behind Blue Moon Diner]with specifications made to match the window above.

Mohr seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

E. New Items

- 6:50 5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-04-01
900 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100078000
Hampton Inn & Suites, Owner/ Janet Miller, Applicant
Hampton Inn Planting Plan

Gastinger moved to find that the proposed planting plan satisfies the BAR’s criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Schwarz seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

- 7:10 6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-04-05
230 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 280001000
Taliaferro Junction LLC, Owner/ Fred Wolf, Applicant
Demolition of Structure – Main Street Arena

Schwarz moved to find that the proposed demolition satisfies the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Earnst seconded. Motion passed (7-0).

- 7:30 7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-04-06
215 West Water Street
Tax Parcel 280009000
Man U LLC, Owner/ Fred Wolf, Applicant
Demolition of Structure – Escape

Balut moved to find that the proposed demolition satisfies the BAR’s criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Schwarz seconded. Motion passed (5-2, with Gastinger and Earnst opposed). [NOTE: The BAR distinguished the context of this building from the historic context of the Mono Loco building].

- 7:50 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-04-07
615 Lexington Avenue
Tax Parcel 520170000
Francesco Ronchetti, Owner/ Sigora Solar, Applicant
Proposed Solar Panel

Graves moved to defer the application. Miller seconded. Motion passed (7-0). The BAR feels that the owner of the structure needs to be in attendance in order to hear the neighborhood’s concerns about the building.

8:10 **9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-04-03
301 15th Street NW
Tax Parcel 090094000
Pavilion, LLC, Owner/ Verizon, Applicant
Proposed cell antenna

Schwarz moved to approve a COA for BAR 17-04-03, proposing installation of wireless communication transmission equipment on the roof of a building located at 301 15th Street NW, because the proposed installation is architecturally compatible with the character of this property and of the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District. This approval is subject to the following conditions:

- (1) All communications/ transmission equipment, and related facilities, shall be installed in accordance with a coordinated Concealment Plan approved by this BAR. The Concealment Plan hereby approved for this property as follows:**
- Communications/ transmission equipment, and related facilities, shall be disguised by, or disguised as, architectural features, fixtures, or building appurtenances. Concealment elements created for the sole purpose of disguising or hiding such equipment and facilities shall be treated, considered and reviewed in the same manner as the architectural features, fixtures or appurtenances they mimic.
 - In the aggregate, all architectural features, fixtures and appurtenances shall not exceed such number, and shall be of such massing, type and appearance, as may be compatible with similar features, fixtures and appurtenances on other building(s) within this ADC District. Approval of a concealment element for one installation does not guarantee approval of the same concealment element(s) for all future installations.
 - All future installations of communications/ transmission equipment shall be in accordance with this Concealment Plan.
- (2) The current application proposes only one (1) antenna/data node, and related equipment and facilities, to be installed on or adjacent to the roof of the existing commercial building. Consistent with the above-referenced Concealment Plan, this proposed installation shall be installed and disguised as follows:**
- The proposed antenna/data node shall be enclosed within a cornerstone installed for the purpose of concealing the antenna/ data node, and placed at the eastern corner of the parking garage structure, at the top of the garage walls.
 - The materials of the cornerstone enclosure shall be a color that is a neutral, light color that closely matches the light-grey concrete of the parking garage façade.
 - The cornerstone enclosure shall itself have a height of 3"2" feet or less. No portion of the antenna/ data node shall extend beyond the cornerstone enclosure. It must sit directly upon the garage column and match the cross-section.
 - The equipment cabinet (approximately 24 inches (L) x 20 inches (W) x 11 inches (D)), two remote radio heads, and a diplexer, and any and all other equipment and facilities supporting the operation of the antenna/ data node, shall be mounted on a uni-strut frame attached to the interior side of the existing parapet wall at the top of the garage structure. No part or portion of any supporting equipment of facilities shall be visible at ground level from any adjacent street or property. The equipment will be located below the levels of the sloped roof of the attached apartment building within the mechanical equipment well. The conduit to serve the equipment shall be located on the interior surface of the interior wall and not visible from the exterior.

Miller made an amendment to switch the word designed by to disguised by in Number 1. Gastinger seconded the amendment. Balut seconded the motion. Motion passed (7-0).

8:30 **10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 17-04-04
1605 Gordon Avenue
Tax Parcel 050070000
R & I Buildings CO, LC, Owner/ Verizon, Applicant
Proposed cell antenna

Schwarz moved to approve a COA for BAR 17-04-04, proposing installation of wireless communication transmission equipment on the roof of a building located at 1605 Gordon Avenue, because the proposed installation is architecturally compatible with the character of this property and of the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District. This approval is subject to the following conditions:

(1)All communications/ transmission equipment, and related facilities, shall be installed in accordance with a coordinated Concealment Plan approved by this BAR. The Concealment Plan hereby approved for this property as follows:

- Communications/ transmission equipment, and related facilities, shall be disguised by, or disguised as, architectural features, fixtures, or building appurtenances. Concealment elements created for the sole purpose of disguising or hiding such equipment and facilities shall be treated, considered and reviewed in the same manner as the architectural features, fixtures or appurtenances they mimic.
- In the aggregate, all architectural features, fixtures and appurtenances shall not exceed such number, and shall be of such massing, type and appearance, as may be compatible with similar features, fixtures and appurtenances on other building(s) within this ADC District. Approval of a concealment element for one installation does not guarantee approval of the same concealment element(s) for all future installations.
- All future installations of communications/ transmission equipment shall be in accordance with this Concealment Plan.

(2)The current application proposes only one (1) antenna/data node, and related equipment and facilities, to be installed on the roof of the existing commercial building. Consistent with the above-referenced Concealment Plan, this proposed installation shall be installed and disguised as follows:

- The proposed antenna/data node shall be enclosed within a stealth concealment sleeve (“vent pipe sleeve”) installed solely for the purpose of concealing the antenna/ data node.
- The vent pipe sleeve shall be a color that is a neutral, light-gray tone similar to other vent pipes that extend above roofs within the ADC District. The vent pipe sleeve shall not be more than 12” inches in diameter, nor shall it extend more than 4’-5” above the parapet. No portion of the antenna/ data node within the vent pipe sleeve shall extend above the top of the vent pipe sleeve.
- The proposed antenna/ data node shall be mounted on a non-penetrating, ballasted sled placed in the southeastern corner of the roof of the building. No portion of the sled shall be visible from any adjacent street or property, unless it is within the vent pipe sleeve.
- The equipment cabinet (approximately 24 inches (L) x 20 inches (W) x 11 inches (D)), two remote radio heads, fiber optic coupler, and all other equipment and facilities supporting the operation of the antenna/ data node, shall be mounted on a rooftop equipment frame that, itself, is approximately six (6) feet wide and five (5) feet tall. The equipment frame shall be set back at least 13 feet from the adjacent building facades, or such greater setback as necessary to preclude any portion of the equipment frame from being visible at ground level from any adjacent street or property. Conduit for the equipment shall be designed to mimic the existing downspouts on the building.

Mohr seconded. Motion passed (6-1, with Miller opposed).

8:50 11. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-04-02
1521 University Avenue
Tax Parcel 090082000

Gastinger moved to deny a COA for BAR 17-04-02, proposing installation of wireless communication transmission equipment on the roof of a building located at 1521-1527 University Avenue, because the proposed installation(s) and concealment feature is NOT architecturally compatible with the character of this property or the Corner ADC District. The nature and placement of the proposed “chimney” is not typical or common within this ADC District relevant for the structure, and is not in keeping with the commercial character of the existing building. The following Standards and Guidelines are referenced:

- **Standard #3 for the review of construction and alterations related to the interior standards for rehabilitation [Sec 34-276 (3) The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation set forth within the Code of Federal Regulations (36 C.F.R. §67.7(b)), as may be relevant]**
- **page 25 related to roofs**
- **page 28 related to building exterior roofs.**

Balut seconded. Motion passed (5-2 with Schwarz and Graves opposed).

9:10 F. Other Business

- 12. PLACE Report – there will not be a place report until Thursday because their meeting was postponed. He and a few other members of PLACE met at Open Grounds with a couple people from UVa, who discussed the beginning of a lighting code. Also, the Belmont Bridge charrette is happening April 17th-19th, so please stop by to see what designs are being discussed.**

9:20 G. Adjournment 10:38 p.m