

BAR ACTIONS
CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
August 14, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair; Breck Gastinger; Stephan Balut; Carl Schwarz; Emma Earnst
BAR Members Absent: Justin Sarafin; Whit Graves; Corey Clayborne
Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala, Camie Mess, Reid Saunders, Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:30pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes) None

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes July 18, 2017 Regular Meeting

Schwarz moved to approve the July 18, 2017 minutes. Balut seconded. Approved (4-0-2, with Mohr and Earnst abstained).

C. New Items

5:40 2. Special Use Permit (SUP) Recommendation
BAR 17-08-09
201 West Water Street
Tax Parcel 280012000
Black Bear Properties, LLC, Owner/Clark Gathright, Applicant
SUP Recommendation

Mohr moved to find that the proposed special use permit to allow increased density (from 43 units per acre to 101 units per acre) and additional building height (from 70 feet to 94.17 feet), for the redevelopment of 201 West Water Street into a mixed use development will not have an adverse impact on the Downtown ADC District, and the BAR recommends approval of the Special Use Permit, subject to the usual BAR review, and subject to the rooftop appurtenance and balconies meeting current regulations with the following modifications. Schwarz seconded. The motion passed (5-1, with Miller opposed)

- The BAR would like the base details to wrap around the building**
- The implication of the high quality of materials**

- The BAR would like the applicant to investigate the idea of real windows on the north face
- The BAR does not approve the concept of a full level garage
- The BAR would like to see at least the leading corner of the first floor as a functional commercial space
- Also, the BAR has a concern for public safety with cars backing out into a public street

6:10 **3. Preliminary Discussion**
 BAR 17-08-03
 430 North 1st Street
 Tax Parcel 330088100
 David and Nancy Hughes, Owner/ Outlaw Design Company, Applicant
 Street Additions

Since this is a preliminary discussion there is no suggested motion.

The large part of the discussion was centered around the front entrance bridge and the symmetry of the house. The members present felt this is the most character defining feature of the structure, and were hesitant to see it changed. It was suggested if the applicants wanted a front occupiable space, that they sink it down or make it symmetrical. Another suggestion was to make the cantilevered canopy reinforcements less noticeable keeping with the original designs intention. The BAR thought the side and back additions were appropriate according to the guidelines.

6:30 **4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
 BAR 17-08-11
 158 Madison Lane
 Tax Parcel 090129000
 Alpha Chi Omega NHC, Owner/ Kevin Blair, Applicant
 Replace Roof Railing

The applicant moved for a deferral.

Schwartz moved that the BAR accepts the applicant’s request for deferral. Bault seconded. The motion passed (6-0).

The BAR suggested that the applicant look into a composite chippendale railing, as the guidelines do not permit using vinyl to replace a wooden railing.

6:40 **5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
 BAR 17-08-09
 510 17th Street NW
 Tax Parcel 050064000
 Zeta Beta House Corp of Gamma Phi Beta Sorority Inc., Owner/ Garrett Rouzer, Applicant
 East Elevation Addition and replacement of window sashes

The applicant moved for a deferral.

Schwartz moved that the BAR accepts the applicant’s request for deferral. Mohr seconded. The motion passed (6-0).

The BAR requires additional information and suggested the applicant looks at cornice details, the gutters, dimensioned elevations for all three sides, window surveys, submit a cut sheet for the light fixture, and differentiate between the original structure and the new addition.

7:10 **6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 17-08-12
605 Preston Place and 506-512 Preston Place
Tax Parcel 050111000 and 050116A00-050116E00
Preston Place Neighborhood Investments PC, LP, and Preston Place Properties, LLC,
Owner/Julie Dixon, Applicant
Move building and demolition of wall

Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolitions and Moving, I move to find that the proposed (1) moving of 605 Preston Avenue house, porch and chimneys, and the east side additions to 506-512 Preston Place, and (2) demolition of the rear additions of the house satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Mohr seconded. The motion passed (4-2, with Gastinger and Schwarz opposed).

Bault moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Demolitions and Moving, I move to find that the proposed demolition of part of the stone wall at 500-512 Preston Place satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Mohr seconded. The motion passed (6-0).

7:40 7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-08-13
506-512 Preston Place
Tax Parcel 050116A00-050116E00
Preston Place Properties, LLC, Owner/Julie Dixon, Applicant
Renovation of building

The applicant moved for a deferral.

Schwartz moved that the BAR accepts the applicant's request for deferral. Balut seconded. The motion passed (6-0).

The renovation of the structure was not discussed because the east additions are now moving with the house instead of being demolished, as originally proposed. This changes the overall design, so this application will come back for BAR approval. The BAR requested larger, scaled drawings of all elevations.

8:00 8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-08-05
419 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 530062000
Holly Ridge, LLC, Owner/ Clifford H. Fox, Applicant
Window Replacement

Schwartz moved that the BAR defer the application. Mohr seconded. The motion passed (6-0). The applicant will be required to come to next month's BAR with the requested information.

The BAR requested more information:

- 1. How old are the windows?**
- 2. What exactly is broken?**
- 3. Comparing muntin dimensions between the old windows and the proposed replacements.**

8:20 9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-07-01
425 2nd Street NE

Tax Parcel 330085000
James E. and Lynn K. Garnett, Owner/ James E. Garnett, Applicant
Construct new front wall, front walk, and install gates

Gastinger moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the revised proposal changes (found in an e-mail to Camie Mess, dated August 14th, around 1pm) to the front wall, front walk, and landscape satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted pending a resubmittal and approval of the revised landscape plan, and seeing the brick on site. Earnst seconded. The motion passed (6-0).

F. Other Business

8:50 10. PLACE report

Mohr did not attend the PLACE meeting, but would like to mention they are having a meeting about how building height is measured Thursday August 17 from 1-2:30, in the basement conference room.

9:00 G. Adjournment 10:15pm

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
August 15, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair; Breck Gastinger; Stephan Balut; Carl Schwarz; Emma Earnst; Corey Clayborne
BAR Members Absent: Justin Sarafin; Whit Graves
Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala, Camie Mess, Reid Saunders, Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:35pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes) None

B. New Items

5:40 1. Rapid Flashing Beacons in Historic Districts

The applicant requested a deferral.

Schwarz moved that the BAR accept the applicant's request for deferral. Gastinger seconded. The motion passed (7-0).

They felt the street was too small for such a large installation and the BAR requested a work session with the BAR, PLACE, the City traffic engineer, and Public Works to discuss other options.

6:00 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-08-04
525 Valley Road
Tax Parcel 110043000
John Butler, Owner/Applicant
Minor Exterior Renovations

Gastinger moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements and City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to

find that the proposed minor exterior renovations satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Oakhurst-Gildersleeve ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Balut seconded. The motion passes (7-0).

- 6:20** **3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-08-10
406 Altamont Street
Tax Parcel 330150000
Robert Troxell, Owner/Applicant
Tree Removal

Gastinger moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed tree removal satisfies the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the recommendation that a small size of a large species shade tree replace the current tree being taken down. Clayborne seconded. The motion passes (7-0).

- 6:40** **4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-12-03
1600 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 050110000
Neighborhood Investments-PC, LP, Owner/ Henningsen Kestner Architects, Inc,
applicant
Landscape Plan

Gastinger moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed landscape, lighting plan, and tree demolition plan satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the stipulation that the applicant return to the BAR with an updated planting plan for the plantings in the three yards, that shows at least a one-to-one replacement for the removed trees. Balut seconded. The motion passes (7-0).

C. New Construction

- 7:00** **5. Preliminary Discussion**
BAR 17-08-02
Belmont Bridge
Public Right of Way, Tax Map 53 and 58
City of Charlottesville, Owner/Applicant
Belmont Bridge Design

Since this is a preliminary discussion there is no suggested motion. Some comments are:

- The combination of landscaping, engineering, and planning is going in the right direction, but there needs to be more cohesion and an overall design philosophy. The seat walls, rails and lighting seem too disparate. CSX screen needs to be integrated more.**
- The furniture color must be black like the Mall street furniture. Furniture could be more creative design, but must fit more into the design and character of the Downtown ADC.**

- Reduce the amount of concrete with more stone, wood, green space, planters, or possibly different materials such as xeriscape gravel. Green screens may not survive the hot and exposed locations.
- Fix the “kinks” in the most attractive feature – the continuity of line, gracefulness of curve that connects the pedestrian way into the bridge.
- Pavement colors could look dated quickly. Consider more muted colors or textured variations.
- Look further into a dual purpose for the parking area.
- Integrate more of the senses (touch, sound, sight, etc.) Introduce bright colors under bridge.
- Supportive on the tunnel underpass, but wished the circulation was more fluid in the design; streamline approach to it.
- Keep pedestrian crosswalk for now until future development changes current pedestrian patterns.
- Complete discussion at :

http://charlottesville.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=2

7:40

6. Preliminary Discussion

BAR 17-08-01

230 West Main Street

Tax Parcel 280001000

Taliaferro Junction LLC, Owner/ Fred Wolf, Applicant

Ice Park Arena Redevelopment

Since this is a preliminary discussion there is no suggested motion. Some comments are:

- The idea of the arcade/gallery is the key part of this whole design concept, the BAR wants this to be welcoming to all pedestrians, not just the building users. Open it up more to the sky; celebrate it more on Water Street.
- Go for higher in lobby area – it looks squished
- The massing is sensitive to the proportion of the mall, Water Street, and the walkway into the mall
- The garage feels a little out of place with how it sticks out from the façade, look at different options
- Make sure to take into account soil volumes that will be needed on the terraces if they are going to green occupiable spaces. Also, keep the heights in mind when you are designing those spaces.
- Keep in mind how the building’s façade is going to be articulated when designing this massive structure (i.e. breaking up the façade)
- The BAR is very supportive of the massing submitted at the meeting, and they are grateful the applicant is looking at building it by-right
- Complete discussion at :

http://charlottesville.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=2

8:40 D. Adjournment 9:40pm