

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
September 19, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.
City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Justin Sarafin; Breck Gastinger; Stephan Balut; Carl Schwarz; Emma Earnst; Corey Clayborne (late)
BAR Members Absent: Tim Mohr, co-chair; Whit Graves
Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala, Camie Mess, and Carolyn McCray

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:30pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

Mark Kavit, 406 Altamont Street, read a written statement pertaining to the Monticello Dairy project, about a public meeting that was scheduled for Sept. 16th, which was cancelled.

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Minutes August 14, 2017 and August 15, 2017 Regular Meetings

Schwarz moved to approve the August 14, 2017 and August 15, 2017 minutes. Gastinger seconded. Approved (5-0-1, with Sarafin abstained).

C. Deferred Items

5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-08-05
419 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 530062000
Holly Ridge, LLC, Owner/ Clifford H. Fox, Applicant
Window Replacement

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed replacement windows satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown

ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with preferences of 5/8" muntins (if available in this window product), not to use tinted glass (VLT 70 or more is permitted), and the BAR is supportive of all three color choices. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).

- 6:00** **3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-06-05
632 Park Street
Tax Parcel 520114000
Kaitlyn Marie Henry, Owner/ Rick Uhler, Uhler and Company, Applicant
Front Porch Addition and Window Replacement

Schwarz moved to accept the applicant's deferral for the front porch. Balut seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed window removal on the north side of the original house satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the request, with the caveat that the brick (infill) is recessed. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (5-1, with Miller opposed).

The applicant agreed to repair, rather than replace, all the windows in the original part of the house.

- 6:20** **4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 16-12-03
1600 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 050110000
Neighborhood Investments-PC, LP, owner/ Henningsen Kestner Architects, Inc,
applicant
Revised Landscape Plan

Gastiner moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed landscape plan satisfies the BAR's criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC District, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Earnst seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).

D. New Items

- 6:40** **5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-04
327 6th Street SW
Tax Parcel 290188000
Ryan L. Rooney and Kevin G. Badke, Owner/Chris Crehan, Applicant
Window Replacement

Clayborne arrived.

Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed replacement windows satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the clarification that all the windows will be consistent in trim (pick a trim from the existing windows and then match that around the house, keep the one-over-one at the front right elevation, and all the other windows will be consistent in glazing (there is a consensus of two-over-two),

except for the two windows in the front door, which should be four-over-four. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (7-0).

The Chair had concerns about the roof replacement, and requested that the applicant appear at a future meeting to discuss.

7:00 **6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-08
632 Preston Place
Tax Parcel 050124000
JRB Preston Place, LLC, Owner/Robert Berndt, Applicant
Window Replacement

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed replacement windows on the basement level satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road- University Circle- Venable ADC district, and that the BAR approves the replacement of the basement windows as proposed (Marvin Integrity windows and the 6/1 muntin pattern.) Balut seconded. The motion was approved (7-0).

Sarafin moved to accept the applicant's deferral on the upper level windows. Balut seconded. The motion was approved (7-0). If the applicant chooses to repair, rather than replace, the upper windows, that may be approved administratively.

7:20 **7. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-09
1111 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100055000
University of Virginia Medical School Foundation, Owner/Linda Weldon, Applicant
Basement Window Replacement

Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed replacement windows satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Clayborne seconded. The motion was approved (7-0).

7:40 **8. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-03
Coal Tower (East Water Street)
Tax Parcel 570157A00
Choco Cruz, LLC, Owner/LPDA, Applicant
C&O Row Park

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed landscaping plan in concept satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this individually protected property and that the BAR approves the application as submitted in concept, but would like to see specific details such as plants species, location, lighting, and signage (if included) to come back to the BAR at a later date. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (7-0).

8:00 **9. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-09-05

1400 Wertland Avenue
Tax Parcel 090074000
Fourteenth Street Mall, LLC, Owner/ Alberto Namnum, Applicant
Storefront Alterations

Sarafin moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed exterior alterations satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Rd-University Circle-Venable Neighborhood ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with lighting fixture details to be circulated by email for administrative approval at a later date. Earnst seconded. The motion was approved (7-0).

8:20 10. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 17-09-07
118 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 280016001-009
M&O Corporation, Owner/ Jim Boyd, Grimm and Parker, Applicant
Rooftop Additions

The applicant is requesting a preliminary discussion, but did not attend the meeting and requested deferral.

8:40 11. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 17-09-06
810 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 300002000
Allan H Cadgene, Owner/ Bruce Wardell, BRW Architects, Applicant
Union Station Expansion

CAS noted the addition is not deferential to the historic building.

BG said greater site plan consideration is needed- where do you enter the building? The west façade of 2nd story should match east façade because it is visible from trains.

SB said massing and composition of buildings is appropriate. Noted roof pitch differences; no good way to resolve. Agreed with CAS that arch is a “near miss” should be shallower to match segmental arches over windows.

There was discussion how to articulate the addition so it is distinct from rest of building. Perhaps gray brick with matching mortar. Mousetooth detail on existing building was discussed.

There was discussion about pulling the baggage addition back from the front of the main building.

The owner should be asked if the original Union Station (now Wild Wings) could revert back to a station use, eliminating the need for an addition?

9:00 12. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 17-09-01
946 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 310060000
Dairy Holdings, LLC, Owner/ Chris Henry, Applicant
Partial Demolition

This is a preliminary discussion, so no action was taken.

The BAR asked if the small house on Wood Street could be documented.

The BAR did not have a problem with the proposed demolitions of roof appendages. They said to look into holding the building corner on rear east side so that you can tell where the building ended. Ration new openings on 10th Street – look for old windows to reuse.

9:20 13. Preliminary Discussion
BAR 17-09-02
946 Grady Avenue
Tax Parcel 310060000
Dairy Holdings, LLC, Owner/ Wendie Charles, Applicant
Additions

This is a preliminary discussion, so no action was taken. The applicant has only submitted massing drawings at this time.

SB noted they could create new entrances in existing openings, but don't change the openings. The new entrance should be deferential to the main entrance.

BG: Regarding landscaping, it should be simple and straightforward. Keep the quiet simplicity that is at home among the other industrial buildings on Preston. Don't try to be too "pretty."

CC: Great presentation. Maintain dialogue with 10th & Page community-engage them.

Any future additions to the rear of the site would fall under Entrance Corridor review, rather than BAR review. There were questions about the allowable heights in future phases.

E. Other Business

9:40 14. PLACE report Since Mohr was not at the meeting there was no PLACE report.

9:50 F. Adjournment 10:30 p.m.