

## BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE  
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
Regular Meeting  
November 21, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.  
City Council Chambers - City Hall



**BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair; Justin Sarafin; Breck Gastinger; Stephan Balut; Carl Schwarz**  
**BAR Members Absent: Whit Graves; Emma Earnst; Corey Clayborne**  
**Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala and Camie Mess (late)**

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

**PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.**

**Miller called the meeting to order at 5:30 pm**

**5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)**

**B. Consent Agenda** (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

**1. Minutes**      October 17, 2017      Regular Meetings

**Schwarz moved to approve the October 17, 2017 minutes with spelling corrections. Balut seconded. Approved (5-0-1 with Mohr abstaining).**

**C. Deferred Items**

**5:40 2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 17-07-01

425 2<sup>nd</sup> Street NE

Tax Parcel 330085000

James E. and Lynn K. Garnett, Owner/ James E. Garnett, Applicant

Proposed Landscape Plan

**Gastinger moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposal changes to the landscape satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the friendly suggestion to switch the tree species to either Sugar Maple or Red Maple in front, and either Japanese Maple or Paper Bark on Hedge Street. Balut seconded. The motion was approved (6-0)**

- 6:00**            **3.      Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-09-07  
118 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 280016001-009  
M&O Corporation, Owner/ Jim Boyd, Grimm and Parker, Applicant  
Rooftop Additions

**Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed new additions satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted except the BAR wants to see final details and drawings to be approved administratively, and cut sheets on the windows and lighting. The location of two colors (green and orange) may be flipped. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).**

- 6:20**            **4.      Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-09-06  
810 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 300002000  
Allan H Cadgene, Owner/ Bruce Wardell, BRW Architects, Applicant  
Union Station Expansion

**Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed new addition satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the West Main Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with the following stipulations: both garage doors shall be painted a similar or the same color as the brick, and the roof may be either real slate or synthetic slate. Schwarz seconded. The motion passed (6-0).**

- 6:40**            **5.      Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-08-09  
510 17<sup>th</sup> Street NW  
Tax Parcel 050064000  
Zeta Beta House Corp of Gamma Phi Beta Sorority Inc., Owner/ Garrett Rouzer,  
Applicant  
East Elevation Addition and replacement of window sashes

**Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Additions and the City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed addition (but NOT the window replacement) satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Rugby Road-University Circle-Venable ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the request that you submit a digital site plan and floor plan to staff. Mohr seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).**

**D.      New Items**

- 7:00**            **6.      Certificate of Appropriateness**  
BAR 17-11-04  
413 Ridge Street  
Tax Parcel 290136000  
Jeffrey Erkelens, Owner/ Jeffrey Erkelens, Applicant

Partial Demolition and Proposed Rear Elevation Changes

**Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitations, I move to find that the proposed changes including two window replacements on the Oak Street side [rear addition] satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Ridge Street ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with the rear elevation to come back to the BAR for approval at a regular meeting, and any additional site work to come back. Balut seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).**

**7:20            7.        Certificate of Appropriateness Application**

BAR 17-11-01

511 West Main Street

Tax Parcel 320174000

Main Street West, LLC, Owner/ Greg Jackson., Applicant

Updated Design for Rooftop Deck and Enclosed Kitchen/Bar

**Schwartz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed changes to the roof addition satisfy the BAR's criteria and guidelines and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted, with applicant's choice of window configuration to come back to staff for approval. Bault seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).**

**7:40            8.        Preliminary Discussion**

BAR 17-11-02

167 Chancellor Street

Tax Parcel 090126000

Alpha Omicron Corp, Owner/ Kevin Schafer, Applicant

New Addition

**Since this was a preliminary discussion there was no motion. The BAR was supportive of something happening here, but not the submitted version. The changes to Chancellor Street side were more problematic: the big dormer is not appropriate; maintain the wrap-around porch, maybe come out only as far as first column. Maintain integrity on Chancellor Street side.**

**Madison Lane side could be more contemporary and differentiated from historic fabric; invading setback on that side OK; maybe 1-story full width porch instead of 2-story portico; play off the two volumes; porch can create own axis, not necessarily symmetrical; take cues from Greek revival – not so grand 2 story porch. New addition could be more contemporary.**

**8:10            9.        Preliminary Discussion**

BAR 17-09-02

946 Grady Avenue

Tax Parcel 310060000

Dairy Holdings, LLC, Owner/ Wendie Charles, Applicant

New Additions

**Since this was a preliminary discussion there was no motion. No issues with proposed demolitions including 1959 loading appendage. No issues with new openings on Tenth Street. Keep central door operable. To extent possible landscape plan should reinforce horizontality of main facade. Simplify planting palette. Keep front roof terraces low so they do not compete with front façade. Do not locate signage on top of roof. Perhaps locate signage near terraces or near doors or to right of front steps. Mural**

on side may be OK or appropriate signage submitted as part of a Comprehensive Signage Plan. Not faux historic and not precedent setting. Need to see lighting and materials.

**E. New Construction**

- 8:40 10. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**  
BAR 17-08-01  
230 West Main Street  
Tax Parcel 280001000  
Taliaferro Junction LLC, Owner/ Fred Wolf, Applicant  
Ice Park Arena Redevelopment

**Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed massing satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the massing only as submitted, provided it complies with zoning regulations, and the schematic site plan. Mohr seconded. The motion was approved (5-1, with Schwarz opposed).**

**F. Special Use Permit Recommendations**

- 9:10 11. Special Use Permit Recommendation (SUP)**  
BAR 17-11-05  
517 Park Street  
Tax Parcel 530009000  
517 Park, LLC, Owner/ Kara Gloeckner, Applicant  
Special Use Permit for additional residents

**Miller moved to make no recommendation on the special use permit to allow more than 8 residents (to 12) in a group home due to no exterior changes and no additional information to evaluate any impacts that fall within the BAR's jurisdiction. Balut seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).**

- 9:30 12. Special Use Permit Recommendation (SUP)**  
BAR 17-11-03  
200 2<sup>nd</sup> Street SW  
Tax Parcel 280069000, 280071000, 280072000, 280073000, 280074000, 280075000  
Market Plaza LLC, Owner/ Keith O. Woodard, Applicant  
Special Use Permit for additional residential density

**Mohr moved to find that the proposed special use permit to allow increased density (from 60 units per acre to 83 units per acre) for the redevelopment of 200 2nd Street SW into a mixed use development including the City Market will not have an adverse impact on the Downtown Architectural Design Control (ADC) District, with the proviso that the BAR will want to review the height of the building in the context of massing and its street context when the project comes back for a COA. The BAR recommends approval of the Special Use Permit with this proviso, subject to the usual BAR review. The BAR also notes we are concerned about the functionality of the City Market, realizing the applicant is working with the City, but it concerns us. Sarafin seconded. The motion was approved (5-1, opposed by Miller).**

**G. Other Business**

- 9:50 13. North Belmont Neighborhood National Register Nomination**

Sarafin moved to find that the Charlottesville BAR recommends the North Belmont Historic District as proposed to be listed on the Virginia Landmarks Register and the National Register of Historic Places. Gastinger seconded. The motion was approved (6-0).

**14. PLACE report**

Tim Mohr gave a PLACE report with the following main points:

- A person from Roanoke, who now works for City of Chicago, spoke regarding public engagement.
- PLACE was taken through the 3D modeling effort done for the SIA, which was somewhat anti-climactic. There needs to be someone working on it that understands graphic and architectural oversight, because right now that is not a part of the proposal; it was put together by GIS guys. It is not accessible to the public yet.

**15. Downtown Parks RFP – update provided.**

**10:00 H. Adjournment 12:30 a.m.**