

BAR ACTIONS

CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

Regular Meeting

December 19, 2017 – 5:30 p.m.

City Council Chambers - City Hall



BAR Members Present: Melanie Miller, chair; Tim Mohr, co-chair; Justin Sarafin; Stephan Balut; Carl Schwarz; Whit Graves (late); Corey Clayborne (late)

BAR Members Absent: Breck Gastinger and Emma Earnst

Staff Present: Mary Joy Scala and Camie Mess

Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). After presentations by staff and the applicant, members of the public will be allowed two opportunities to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves, and give their current address. The Chair will first ask for questions from the public, then from the BAR. After questions are closed, the Chair will ask for comments from the public. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to ask questions, and up to three minutes to comment. Comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

PLEASE NOTE THE TIMES GIVEN ARE APPROXIMATE AND ARE INTENDED TO BE A GUIDE. THE ACTUAL MEETING MAY BE LONGER OR SHORTER.

Miller called the meeting to order at 5:35 pm

5:30 A. Matters from the public not on the agenda (please limit to 3 minutes)

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. **Minutes**
November 21, 2017 Regular Meeting
September 26, 2017 Work Session
October 31, 2017 Work Session

2. **Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-12-02
421 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 320178000
Quirk Charlottesville, LLC Owner/Jennifer D. Mullen, Esq., Applicant
Re-approval of Demolition of Atlantic Futon

Schwarz moved to approve all the consent agenda items, with his modifications to the November 21st minutes (fixed prior to the meeting by Camie Mess) which include the November 21, 2017 regular meeting minutes, and the September 26, 2017 and October 31, 2017 work session minutes, and the Certificate of Appropriateness Application for 421 West Main Street, the re-approval of demolition of Atlantic Futon. Balut seconded. Approved (5-0).

C. Deferred Items

Claiborne joined the meeting.

5:40 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
BAR 17-02-02
118 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 280025000
West Cote Properties, Owner/Jeff Bushman, Applicant
Storefront Renovation

Balut moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Site Design and Elements, I move to find that the proposed new storefront design satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted. Sarafin seconded. Approved (6-0).

D. New Items

6:00 4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Historic Conservation District)
BAR 17-12-01
714 Locust Avenue
Tax Parcel 510069000
Rashad Dacus, Owner/James Robertson, Applicant
Additional front porch and landscaping

[This item was moved to the end of the agenda to wait for the applicant, who never arrived. The BAR was required to take action at this meeting since it is located in a historic conservation district.]

Mohr moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including Historic Conservation District Guidelines for New Construction and Additions, I move to find that the proposed front porch roof addition does not satisfy the BAR's criteria and is not compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District, because the porch roof addition covers the primary front gable which is a character defining feature of the house and that the BAR denies the porch roof addition as submitted.

Also, Mohr moved to find that the material changes to the stoop, stairs, and proposed garden wall satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Martha Jefferson Historic Conservation District and that the BAR approves that part of the application with these modifications:

- The materials for the stoop, stairs, and garden wall meet the BAR's Guidelines**
- The stoop must be held back a minimum of 8 inches on both sides from the existing brick central bay**
- The proposed porch roof is denied, but the applicant may submit an alternate design to the BAR for a smaller canopy (with a submission to come back to the BAR to review)**
- The BAR suggests the applicant retain the existing trim and door, and look into light fixtures that are in keeping with the current style.**

Balut seconded. Approved (7-0).

- 6:20** **5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application**
BAR 17-12-05
300 East Main Street
Tax Parcel 280040000
East Main Investments, LLC, Owner/James Barton, Applicant
Rear Façade Renovation

Schwarz moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation, I move to find that the proposed new storefront design satisfies the BAR's criteria and guidelines and is compatible with this property and other properties in the Downtown ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application with the modification that the brick not be white washed. Clayborne seconded. Approved (6-0).

- ~~**6:40** **6. Certificate of Appropriateness**
BAR 17-12-04
1001 West Main Street
Tax Parcel 100050000
Ian Kelly, Owner/Tom Bartell, Applicant
New Outdoor Deck~~

Graves joined the meeting.

- 7:00** **7. Certificate of Appropriateness**
BAR 17-12-03
122 Maywood Lane
Tax Parcel 110060000
Neighborhood Properties, LLC, Owner/Henningsen Kestner Architects, Inc., Applicant
Additions and Renovations

Sarafin moved: Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including City Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation and for New Construction, I move to find that the proposed partial demolitions, new additions and rehabilitations to the house and cottage satisfy the BAR's criteria and are compatible with this property and other properties in the Oakhurst Circle- Gildersleeve Wood ADC district, and that the BAR approves the application as submitted with either retention of the original, slightly cantilevered entrance hood [on the main house] or to extend the cantilevered hood for functional purposes. Also, a window sample will come back to the BAR to be reviewed. Balut seconded. Approved (7-0).

- E. Other Business**
7:20 **8. PLACE report**

Mohr recapped what PLACE has been doing, even though he was not in attendance at their last meeting.

- They mostly followed up on their mixed use workshop (what constitutes mixed use, what is its role in zoning, whether we need to think how it is addressed, specific percentages that the zoning code calls out for commercial versus residential, etc.)**
- PLACE wants to come out with a more definitive statement of what mixed use actually is, because it is clearly something that is at odds with form based code**
- Mohr will e-mail the link about this discussion**

- More discussion about the 3D model and how that can be integrated into other things that the City is doing

9. Discussion: Zoning text amendment for Downtown Corridor stepbacks

- Discussion and review of the street wall suggestions document that Carl Schwarz sent around to the BAR. In the Downtown Corridor (DN) district, requirements for streetwall height and number of interior stories should be more flexible, due to pervasive site constraints downtown, and the fact that almost all the DN district is also in an ADC district subject to BAR review.

10. Recognition:

The BAR would like to recognize Whit Graves and the time he has put into serving on this review board. The BAR would also like to thank Mary Joy Scala for the past fourteen years.

7:30 F. Adjournment Graves made the motion to adjourn at 7:15pm